

**EVALUATION OF ANTI-TRAFFICKING
ACTIVITIES IN CENTRAL ASIA FINANCED BY SIDA**

May – October 2006

Table of Content

Executive Summary	3
0. Introduction	4
0.1 Purpose and background of the evaluation.....	4
0.2 Method.....	4
1. General questions.....	6
1.1 On achievements.....	6
1.1.1 Summary of the objectives of the projects.....	6
1.1.2. Counter trafficking.....	7
1.1.3 Assistance of Victims	9
1.1.4 Critical short comings.....	10
1.2 Overall effects.....	12
1.3 Consistency of the needs and priorities	13
1.4 Maintenance	13
2 Specific questions.....	15
2.1 Best Practice and Lessons Learned in Central Asia	15
2.1.1 Best practice	15
2.1.2. Lessons Learned	17
2.2 Regional or bilateral support.....	18
2.3 Influence on Poverty reduction.....	20
2.4 Influence on Human Rights	21
2.5 Indicators and statistics	22
3 IOM.....	23
3.1 Costs effectiveness	23
3.2 Organisation	25
3.2.1 Facts on the organisation.....	25
3.2.2 Cooperation with and between NGO:s.....	26
3.3 Project process	27
3.4 Capacity Building	28
3.6 Gender.....	33
3.7 Impact on Media reporting.....	38
4. Other Options	39
4.1 Draft Map of Measures and Partners in Counter Trafficking.....	39
4.2 Description of other actors involved in anti trafficking!.....	41
4.3 Size and impact of the support in Central Asia	43
4.4 Continued support?	44
4.5 Is support to IOM the best way to combat trafficking?	45
5. Recommendations	46
5.1 Recommendations to Sida	46
5.2 Recommendations to IOM headquarter	48
Supplements.....	50
Supplement 1 Chart on projects – see separate document.....	50
Supplement 2 Review of Expect results – see separate document.....	50
Supplement 3 . Statistics	51
Supplement 4. Timetable of the mission to Kyrgyzstan (June 5-11, 2006)	52
Supplement 5. Timetable of the mission to Kazakhstan (June 25-July 4, 2006)	53
Supplement 6. List of interviewed persons and organisations.....	54
Supplement 7. Terms of Reference	56

Executive Summary

Språngbrädan has, on behalf of Sida, evaluated Sida-financed counter trafficking activities in Central Asia. Sida has channelled its support through International Organisation of Migration (IOM), which is the leading organisation in counter trafficking in Central Asia. The evaluation will be used by Sida for decisions on continued support to counter trafficking in Kazakhstan and in Kyrgyzstan.

Sida has financed projects in Kazakhstan since 2001 up to 2005. The support to IOM in Kyrgyzstan started in 2002 and is ongoing. Sida supports also IOM in Tajikistan, but this cooperation is rather new. According to ToR, Tajikistan should therefore not be included. The evaluation comprises projects from 2001 up to 2006.

The overall objective of all the projects in Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan is “combating trafficking”. The internationally established strategy for counter trafficking is Prevention, Protection and Prosecution. The three projects in Kazakhstan (KZ) and the two in Kyrgyzstan (KG) have covered all three parts of the strategy but less prosecution.

The two IOM missions are among the leading actors in building structures for counter trafficking (CT) in Central Asia. Co-operative frameworks are established in the two countries through which state actors can fulfil their obligations to protect and promote the human rights of trafficked persons. There are structures for co-ordinating efforts in a strategic partnership with civil society. Inter-ministerial groups and CT-focal point (KG) or coordinator (KZ) at national level are in function, legislations are improved, a second national action plan is being implemented (KZ) and is to be implemented (KG), awareness has been raised among the population and nation wide networks of NGOs are trained for assistance of victims of trafficking. The two countries are gaining ownership of the counter trafficking and are now also contributing financially to the combat. IOM has successfully contributed to these achievements. Still far more is to be done. The prognosis is increased trafficking in the two countries and in the region.

We recommend Sida to continue with bilateral support to counter trafficking in first hand to Kyrgyzstan as it fits well into Swedish foreign aid policy and Sida's country strategy. We also recommend continued cooperation with IOM. Sida is phasing out from Kazakhstan. If Sida would choose to continue for another period in Kazakhstan, there is still a need for financial and knowledge support. IOM KZ is a capable partner.

The two most important gaps to close in a continued cooperation are:

1. The gap is too big between the numbers of assisted victims of trafficking and estimated victims. IOM needs to change their own way of working and systematise the training of law enforcement bodies in order to close the gap.
2. The gap is also too big between the numbers of assisted victims and indictments/convicted cases. IOM needs in first hand to systematise the training of judges. Measures for empowering victims are equally needed.

These gaps are also critical shortcomings in IOM's way of working

There is also a discrepancy between implemented IOM-projects and the highly engendered Swedish policy on trafficking. In the latter, actions for elimination of the demand side are required. We have not found any systematic work on elimination of the demand side which risks actually counter trafficking into to a band aid action.

We recommend Sida to continue supporting the implementation of the established strategy on Prevention, Protection and Prosecution, but as we also noticed good results in IOM-projects where they have had their focus. We recommend therefore now to focus the above mentioned gaps. A higher rate of convicted cases should appear as well as assisted victims.

Improvements are needed of diagnostic reviews of the reform measures taken. IOM headquarter is recommended to systematise the statically reporting for facilitating comparisons over time and cross IOM missions in their 120 countries. Currently the statistics are not systematised.

Trafficking is a symptom. Sida finances several projects in Central Asia which combats the root causes of trafficking - like corruption, gender inequality and poverty. Projects on empowerment of women as well as raising awareness on gender implications among men add value to a broad perspective on efficient counter trafficking. Continued support to these types of projects favours also the counter trafficking.

The evaluation was carried out for ten (wo)man-weeks during May 2006 to October 2006 by Bonnie Bernström, Anne Jalakas and Christer Jeffmar, Språngbrädan.

0. Introduction

0.1 Purpose and background of the evaluation

Sida's purpose

Sida has asked Språngbrädan to carry out an evaluation of anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia, financed by Sida.

Sida has supported the International Organisation for Migration's (IOM) anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia for several years. Before deciding on supporting future anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia, Sida needs to know how efficient the past support has been, whether the Sida support should continue in its present form or change direction, and which other options there may be.

Sida has financed three projects of IOM in Kazakhstan (KZ) during 2001 – 2005. The support to the second project of IOM in Kyrgyzstan (KG) ends in June 2006 formally. IOM has asked for an extension. The cooperation started in 2003. Sida supports also IOM in Tajikistan but this support is rather new. This evaluation does not comprise Tajikistan.

Background of trafficking

Trafficking in People is a crime against Human Rights. Trafficking has increased immensely since the collapse of Soviet Union. Corruption has fuelled the crime. The prognosis is still a continued increase of trafficking. The international community has therefore raised attention to it and taken firm measures for prevention.

Further, old violating traditions "Kidnapping the bride", polygamy etc have resurrected in Kyrgyzstan. Prostitution has grown in the two countries and in destination countries. These are breeding grounds for sex slavery. Illegal labour migration within and from Central Asia is as well increasing and feeds labour trafficking. International donors have up until now focused trafficking for sexual exploitation. Labour trafficking is getting more and more attention. In the combat of both sex slavery and labour slavery, efforts against the demand side have to increase. Both sex and labour slavery have strong gender implications.

UN Convention on international organized crimes defines trafficking as:
"recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person for the purpose of exploitation."

0.2 Method

Sida listed general and specific questions as a guideline for the evaluation. The questions concerned mainly the impact of the Sida financed support. There is also a request to assess how the support fits in to Sida's objectives on Poverty Reduction and Human Rights

and to what extent the implemented actions are in line with Swedish policy on trafficking. The list further contains questions on strategies for a continued support.

The evaluation has a qualitative evaluation approach.

Data collection

The data collection for the assessment consists of two main parts: desk research and missions to Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan.

The desk research has had two directions:

1. Studies of the IOM project documents, final reports¹ and Sida's decisions in order to see the proper fulfilments of the objectives and the action plans. We have scrutinised each of the expected results for each project and added to the evaluation report as an attachment. These studies on expected results included also search for information on IOM's own way of assessing the actions carried out.
2. Studies of international reports on trafficking in people to see if IOM has caught the main problems – that is if the needs are met. US State Department annual report on trafficking in people, OSCE documents and reports from IOM's headquarter represent the main documents in our studies. We have also used parts of several other international studies as well as Sida reports and referred to them in the evaluation. We have used the Swedish policy on trafficking as well as IOM's own gender policy for the assessment of the two IOM mission's way of implementing gender analysis.

The desk research has been carried out both before and after the field visits and constitutes the main part of data collection.

The mission in Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan on six workdays each has had four directions:

1. Interviews with the Chief and the closest co-workers of the two IOM-missions. We used mainly the questions listed by Sida in these interviews.
2. Participatory evaluations with the NGO-network in the two countries. We carried out two full workshops in Kyrgyzstan – one for the Northern network and one for the Southern. The workshop in Kazakhstan was smaller. The full team of the Almaty NGO, which runs the newly opened shelter and two representatives from the Taras-NGO took part. We had additional meetings with the NGO in Astana and in Taldy Korgan. These workshops and meetings focused Best Practice and Lessons Learned. Root causes and Learning needs became topics as well.
3. Interviews with stakeholders and international organisations. In these interviews we used mainly the Sida's evaluation questions. IOM had recommended the specific persons among the stakeholders. Sida's ToR had listed categories. We arranged some meetings with "outsiders" (former MPs, MPs and other politicians) to know how they perceived the work against trafficking. We also included media as a category for getting outsider-views. We had also a separate meeting with IOM Ukraine as it serves as role-model in the counter trafficking for in particular FSU-countries. .
4. Field studies to the shelters. The purpose was to meet with a) victims to know how they experienced the assistance. b) the NGO shelter staff to know about their opinion on the cooperation with IOM, and to listen to their needs and views.

Follow-up by e-mailing

We had planned to follow up the visits to Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan with e-mailing for additional information and IOM-aspects on our findings. The field studies took place in June and July. The emailing period, which followed, coincided with the vacation period in Central Asia and made it difficult to wait for their answers. Kyrgyzstan contributed however with useful statistics.

¹ IOM KG had not completed its second project by the time of the evaluation. We used interim reports instead.

Before closing the report, the two IOM missions have been invited to comment and correct the report. IOM KG has added information on the Sida-financing of the information campaigns carried out, on a newly published manual on gender equality and some statistics.

The structure of the report

Sida's evaluation questions

The structure of the report is mainly in line with Sida's proposed evaluation questions. (See the attached ToR). We have chosen this structure to facilitate the finding of answers to the listed questions.

No separate land reports

Sida's evaluation questions concerns equally the two missions, therefore there are no separate land reports. The similarities in the answers concerning the two missions are further predominant. When including the two missions in all chapters at the same time, the differences are also easier to identify than if there would have been separate land reports.

Few additions

There are a few additional chapters, besides the ones Sida proposed. The chapters are:

1. IOM's work with capacity building. Capacity building is a crucial tool for IOM, when building structures for counter trafficking.
2. The relationship between IOM and its field organisation of NGOs. Without the NGO-network, IOM would not reach out as efficiently.
3. IOM's relation to media. Media has a strategic role in the raising of public awareness and in influencing politicians. Further, media reflects common attitudes to societal problems.
4. The need of improved statistics and indicators. We had difficulties in finding comparative statistics, when we searched for key figures to assess the efficiency. This means also that both donors and IOM itself have difficulties in knowing about efficiency. The key figures in the report are now not exact, but indications due to this deficiency.

Strengths and Weaknesses

We have formulated the answer to Sida's evaluation questions in terms of Strengths and Weaknesses or Positive and Negative. If relevant, we have also made conclusions for Opportunities and Threats. In some chapters, we have also added a separate Conclusion.

Quotations

If significant, we have included quotations from the interviews and the participatory NGO-workshops in the chapters. That is; we have not reported the interviews separately.

Supplements

The stated expected results are reviewed line by line. Due to the quantity of this detailed review, it is added as a supplement instead. The overall conclusions from the review are integrated in the report. Statistics, project overviews, schedules for the missions and ToR are also among the supplements.

1. General questions

1.1 On achievements

Question: Have the Sida financed interventions achieved its objectives or will it do so in the future?

1.1.1 Summary of the objectives of the projects

The overall objective of all the projects, which Sida has financed in Kazakhstan (KZ) and in Kyrgyzstan (KG), is "combating trafficking" (CT). Sida has channelled its support through IOM only.

The established strategy for CT is Prevention, Protection and Prosecution. The two IOM missions and all five projects cover Prevention and Protection and less Prosecution.

The Sida financed intervention in Kazakhstan focuses on Prevention – information and institutional capacity building. In Kyrgyzstan, the Sida financed interventions focuses on assistance to victims (Protection).

The name of the projects in Kazakhstan is “combating trafficking...” and in Kyrgyzstan “Assistance to Victims”.

1.1.2. Counter trafficking

Achievements

National Referral Mechanisms².

The most important achievements of the two IOM missions have been building National Referral Mechanisms (NRM) in the countries. This is the crucial prerequisite in the combat.

A co-operative framework is thereby established in the two countries through which state actors can fulfil their obligations to protect and promote the human rights of trafficked persons. There are structures for co-ordinating efforts in a strategic partnership with civil society. Inter-ministerial groups and CT-focal point (KG) or coordinator (KZ) at national level are in function, legislations are improved, a second national action plan is being implemented (KZ) or is to be implemented (KG), awareness has been raised among the population and nation wide networks of NGOs are trained for assistance of victims of trafficking.

Zigic Zlatko, IOM KG

“We managed to push the law and build awareness among government officials. The first national action plan was produced by IOM. The legal base is all in place. Laws now need to be implemented. Government now provides shelters free of charge, pay telephone with cost of hotlines. Ms Ruskolova, head of State Committee for Migration and Employment, even talks about financing NGOs from budget. ... Top level officials are committed and convinced.”

International indicators

The Republic of KZ and KG are now ranked as Tier 2 - and not lower - in the US State department's annual report on Trafficking in People. One is the highest of the three Tier-levels. The CT work in Kazakhstan was downgraded from Tier 2 to Tier 3 during the project period and then upgraded again to Tier 2. Kyrgyzstan has been upgraded from observation of Tier 2 to Tier 2. We see the upgrading as results of the IOM missions' wide range of lobbying efforts, capacity building and assistance in many other ways.

Start from 0

The IOM missions have started their work from a 0-level in almost all regards – no institutional or public awareness or knowledge and no field organisation - to this position of level 2.

The political level in Kazakhstan has gone from denial to an, for the moment, acceptable level on CT. State representatives in Kazakhstan say, that they are prepared to finance all returns of Kazakhstan victims. The state has allocated 100.000 USD in the budget for this purpose. Local administrations finance some NGO-activities on CT work. The state level has declared its willingness to support shelters (in Almaty) in the future.

The political level of Kyrgyzstan recognized the problem at an earlier stage but was ignorant in CT-work and is now on an acceptable level, taking the financial situation in to

² OSCE has defined the framework for Combating Trafficking as described and named it National Referral Mechanisms (NRM). This is the best conceptual naming of a comprehensive CT-action, which we have found and which also is frequently used.

consideration. The state contributes with premises to the shelters and is prepared to finance some of the NGO activities. The state will finance the toll free hotline service.

Impediments

The objectives are still not achieved. There is one more level to go in the US State department's ranking. The increasing economic differentiation within and between the countries in the region, wide spread corruption and destructive gender patterns still prevent full-fledged National Referral Mechanisms and the political dedication to fight trafficking

Economic differentiation

The prognosis could be positive for Kazakhstan to become upgraded to Tier 1 as the economy is growing fast. Nevertheless, Kazakhstan has now an increasing role as a country of destination. This role is not properly accepted politically, according to OSCE and IOM. Kazakhstan recognises, however, the big illegal labour immigration and has recently introduced a law that allow illegal immigrants to apply - on time limited conditions -for a work permit.

State representatives in Kyrgyzstan say they will need help from international donors for CT-work many more years due to their weak economy. In spite of the weak economy, Kyrgyzstan has become a country of destination for the even poorer Uzbeks, besides still being a country of origin and transit. .

Corruption

The two countries have adopted national action plans against corruption. Firm measures are taken but the corruption will remain for many more years.

The NGOs commented the corruption as follows:

"Midlevel and grass root officials are overwhelmingly corrupt. Judiciary does not care. There is no regulation of the process, no authorisation of recruiters, and no protection of workers rights".

"Corruption is a big problem. If inspections would be conducted there should be trafficking cases in court but as a rule inspectors don't report"

Prostitution.

There are no coordinated state actions in order to prevent the wide spread prostitution in neither of the countries. A few measures on the field level were reported to us, at the same time as new saunas – venues for prostitution – are constantly opened. This means that there is a continued breeding ground for sex slavery.

Strength – reasons for achievements

Progress is always dependent on several actors. IOM is one of the organisations, which has contributed to the achievements. USAID and US State department and now lately OSCE have played strategic roles in the upgrading. These organisations have a political mandate.

Weaknesses

The strategy of counter trafficking is as mentioned Prevention, Protection and Prosecution. Too few measures are taken to strengthen the Prosecution-process. This shows also in the unacceptably low number of criminal cases brought to and convicted in court. See further below.

There are a few actions on preventing the intermediary level (authorisation of job agencies, helping governments closing down illegal job agencies, check on ads and marriage agencies). Too few measures are however taken to fight back the demand side in especially sex slavery. See further chapter on gender and below.

The discrepancy of estimated and assisted number of victims is too big. The police forces make too few inspections and IOM does not search actively for victims. See further below.

Our conclusion

When the current and newly adopted action-plans are implemented and evaluated in around 2009, the prognosis for fulfillments will be safer.

1.1.3 Assistance of Victims

The two missions have set up a framework for assistance to victims through a capable network of cooperative NGOs, international and governmental agencies. The IOM missions have lobbied for legislative protection of victims.

IOM KG

"We arranged a NGO meeting with government to bring the government closer to the process. The government, NGOs and parliament sat around one table and discussed how to improve the process. We discussed where the mistakes in the counter trafficking work are and how the Parliament can help the government to perform better. ... We have manuals and established procedures – a thick Koran on how to assist victims"

Improved legislations

In Kyrgyzstan, the Parliament passed a new law in 2005 that prohibits victims from being punished for acts committed as a direct result of being trafficked. The Parliament in Kazakhstan has recently passed legislation that will provide identified victims with temporary residence status to ensure their safe repatriation or participation in trafficking prosecutions. There are no reports of victims being jailed in 2005; however, victims were sometimes punished for unlawful acts committed as a direct result of their being trafficked. (US State Department)

Type of assistance

Assistance to victims of trafficking comprises three corner stones: Repatriation, Rehabilitation and Reintegration. In practice, this means safe repatriation of victims, medical and psychological check up and treatment if necessary, social and legal assistance, assistance in processing documents such as obtaining the documents establishing the identity of victims, assistance in renewing passport upon arrival, rehabilitation stipend for immediate needs, provision of a safe accommodation/shelter when needed, reintegration assistance (professional trainings, reintegration stipend during training period and assistance in employment when possible). The assistance to victims is carried out by a network of capable NGOs.

Each victim who comes to the shelters gets a rehabilitation and reintegration plan elaborated by the shelter staff in cooperation with the victim. The NGO follows the victim up to one year even though the funding for assistance is only for 6 months (KG) according to contract and, as we understood, in reality. The status is regularly reported to IOM.

The gap between assisted and detected victims

100 percent of the detected victims do not turn to IOM but all victims who turn to IOM have been offered shelter services. Slightly less than 50 percent accepted, according to statistics from IOM KG.

IOM KZ also has a gap between the number of assisted and detected victims. 89 cases were detected during project period 2 in KZ. Around 10 percent of detected victims got assistance.

IOM complains on the lack of willingness among many victims to stay in the shelters.

Strength

The staff in the shelters takes good care of the victims. That is the impression we got. The victims were in an improving physical condition, had new clothes and, in most cases, had good help of the psychological assistance.

The staffs, in the two shelters we visited in Kyrgyzstan and the two in Kazakhstan, were dedicated to their mission and had taken necessary precaution to protect the victims. We understand that it is difficult to complete each individual reintegration plan in a context where poverty is wide spread and unemployment is high. The rehabilitation is also

complicated due the traumatic experiences of especially victims of sex slavery. Some of the stories are close to worst form of torture.

Weaknesses

There is a big gap between the number of estimated and assisted victims as well as there is a gap between the number of assisted victims and of convictions. It is important to close these gaps. IOM's way of working seems not to be adapted for closing the gaps – waiting for victims, not searching for them. The gaps are further commented in the sections on Critical shortcomings. The statistical reporting on assisted victims varies too much. (See chapter on Statistics)

1.1.4 Critical short comings

A) Gap between the number of assisted and estimated victims of trafficking

The gap is too big between the number of estimated and assisted victims. The gap tells about lack of knowledge among police officers on how to search and detect victims as well as about IOM's way of working.

IOM in Kyrgyzstan commented on the gap in the following way:

There is no training of police on how to detect trafficking, identify ads, travel agencies etc. We have victims who return with false passports and end up in jail. It takes a lot of work from our lawyers to get them out. The law says that victims of trafficking shall not be criminalized but officials need to be educated

Number of assisted victims based on information in the reports (* up to December 2005)

Project No	KZ	KG
1	N/a	127
2	8-14	260*
3	91	no project
total	99-105	387

Key figures

IOM's statistical reporting makes it difficult to find indicators for comparisons. If we interpret the statistics correctly, the relation between the number of assisted and estimated victims is:

One assisted victim compared to 15- 30 non detected cases in sex slavery. (260 assisted cases in KG during the ongoing project period to the estimated number of 4000 victims of sex slavery. Victims of labour trafficking is not included)

If using the estimation of 75000 cases (labour and sex) in KG – picked up from the IOM report Fertile Field - is true, then there is one assisted per 288 estimated victims.

Search for victims

We had discussions with the two IOM missions on active search for victims. IOM KG was positive but IOM KZ meant that this was not a mission for IOM but for police.

Ways to search for victims:

IOM KG carried out training for the Consular Department of Ministry of Foreign Affairs among others with the help of a special team from IOM Vienna. A week after the training session, the Consul of Kyrgyzstan in Turkey, identified three Kyrgyz citizens who were sex trafficked. The victims were safely returned to Kyrgyzstan and got assistance.

One of the KZ NGOs told us that she had assisted the local police in a raid in saunas in Taras, where minor girls were found.

We found the following in the US State department report as an example of Best Practice:

“The Anti-Trafficking Strike Force in Bosnia and Herzegovina conducted four major raids in 2005 and 2006 that resulted in the rescue of 26 victims and the apprehension of at least 14 traffickers. This unit exemplifies the importance of close cooperation between prosecutors and police in effectively executing successful raids to rescue victims and arrest traffickers. It also highlights the practical results of bringing different police agencies together to cooperate on trafficking investigations. As a result of one raid, one of the most notorious night bars in central Bosnia was shut down. Tajikistan set up elite anti-trafficking units consisting of two to four specially trained police investigators in regions throughout the country. An increased number of these units led to 81 trafficking investigations in 2005, a significant increase from 2004.”

B) Gap between assisted victims and convictions

The gap is also too big between the number of assisted victims and convictions in court. An NGO in Kazakhstan commented this as follows:

“We had eleven criminal cases, only three were taken to court, all others ended up with an amicable settlement. We are not satisfied with results”.

The gap tells about lack of knowledge among law enforcement (police, prosecutor and judges). Sida has however funded training in Kazakhstan of law enforcement agencies.

In the interviews, IOM Kyrgyzstan told the following:

“Prosecution and training of law enforcement is so far missing in Kyrgyzstan. Only we – IOM - or OSCE could do this. We need to do a lot of institutional capacity building of police; border guards, prosecutors but we don’t have these programmes today”

MFA Department of consular services in Kazakhstan explained the gap in the following way:

“Victims do not voluntarily contact authorities. When our consular staff meets them abroad they are willing to testify but as soon as they get home they are afraid to name persons, places, phone numbers. More psychological help is needed for convincing the victims to testify - that would help a lot.”

In 2002 – 2003 in Kyrgyzstan, 1526 representatives from law enforcement were trained within a comprehensive information campaign, financed by USAID. Sida has also funded training for the period 2004 – 2006 but the reporting on this training is missing or it has not yet been carried out. During approximately the same period, the number of convicted cases in Kyrgyzstan dropped from 17 in 2004 to 3 in 2005. The drop is not commented in the reports to Sida.

The number of convictions increased in Ukraine after training of judges. IOM KZ tells on a couple of judges who opened cases after training. Training should help by other words.

Key figures

The relation between one assisted victim and the number of convictions varies due to the variety in the statistical reporting on cases brought to court. The statistics are mixed up by cases and people. Time periods are neither congruent.

If we have interpreted the statistics properly, there is one conviction on 33 victims. (if approximately 100 assisted victims in 2005 in KG compared to the 3 convictions). It is not possible to find a proper base for Kazakhstan to make a calculation on key figures.

C) Number of assisted victims

IOM KG has in particular stated expected results on concrete numbers of assisted victims. The second ongoing project period (July 2004 – June 2006) states as an expected result on assistance to 400 victims. We cannot see that this is fulfilled or will be fulfilled within the stipulated project period. The reason for not achieving the result is the important part of the story, but there is no analysis of the reasons.

Source IOM July 2006

Kyrgyzstan	Staying in		IOM assisted	VoT
year	Assisted returns	Shelters	at trials	
2001				
2002	5			
2003	83	24		
2004	90	36		17
2005	82	42		6
2006	41	41		1
	301	143		24

The number according to the reports varies and confuses. Total sum of assisted victims for the period of the two Sida financed projects in Kyrgyzstan (2002 – 2006) is 387 when reading the reports. For the period July 2004 to December 2005 IOM reports on both 260 and 309 victims. During the first project period, IOM assisted 127 victims.

D) Objectives and indicators

The objectives of the project are openly formulated. We assume this is due to the mission on introduction of counter trafficking in countries, which had no clear policy and due to the shadowed area as corrupt trafficking is as well as a correctly assumed resistance in the beginning.

We assume that these conditions also have shaped the vague indicators in the project document. Regardless the above mentioned restrictions, several of the actions carried out were possible to control. This means that elaboration of proper indicators was possible.

Stops half way

The reporting from IOM is based on the quantity of the performance – number of leaflets, brochures, media coverage, number of trained people, number of calls to the hotlines etc etc. Numbers like that is not a result telling about the impact. It tells about the capacity of the organisation but not the efficiency of the measures taken. It is actually difficult to evaluate the efficiency. The reporting stops half way.

IOM Kazakhstan has in particular got funding for one comprehensive information campaign. It is not possible to tell about any link between this campaign and the achievements on the overall level. Not even contact costs are reported. IOM Kyrgyzstan has also carried out comprehensive information campaigns. A special evaluation report of the USAID-financed campaigns told about the same pattern as in Kazakhstan. Number of publications, trained people etc. It stopped half way.

The problems with lack of indicators are close to the lack of acceptable standard of statistics. (See special chapter)

1.2 Overall effects

Sida question: What are the overall effects of the Sida financed interventions, intended and unintended, long term or short term, positive or negative?

Positive and long term effects

The financed interventions contribute to Poverty Reductions and strengthening of Human Rights. It contributes to enhancing women's rights and partly to gender equality. (See special chapters)

Another long-term effect of building National Referral Mechanisms is the raised awareness among the governments in taking their own financial responsibility for the problem.

A country that is serious about counter trafficking will not only help people, it will also be respected as a member of the international community. That, in its turn, will improve credibility. If no serious measures taken, the country will get bad reputation. There is a risk that international donors will withdraw.

Positive and short term

IOM missions have chosen to contract NGOs in order to get a nationwide field organisation. This is a chance for NGOs to develop new knowledge as well as a source of incomes. For NGOs in more remote areas, this is even more important. The contract with IOM is prestigious and open doors to other donors.

Negative and short term

NGOs, in first hand in the remote areas, risk developing a financial dependence.

Negative and long term

The intervention is not targeting the demand side of sexual exploitation, which will make it difficult to fight sex slavery.

1.3 Consistency of the needs and priorities

Sida question: Are the Sida financed interventions consistent with the needs and priorities of its target group and the policies of the partner country?

Needs and policies met

During the project periods, the basic needs in the two countries concerned lack of state structures for counter trafficking, lack of assistance to victims of trafficking and low public awareness. The Sida financed interventions have met these needs.

Not all the interventions have been in line with policies of the partner countries but in line with the international community. The very task of IOM has actually been to convince partner countries that they must improve policies and take measures for building National Referral Mechanisms.

Needs that are not met

Still many more needs remain. These are described in first hand in chapters on Achievements, Best Practice, Capacity Building and Recommendations. In this chapter, we want to point out three crucial needs that are not met. They are further described in chapter on Achievements and on Gender.

Prosecution – the number of convicted cases is too low in relation to the estimated number of crimes.

The **gap between the number of estimated and assisted victims** is too big. This mean that need of the overwhelming majority of victims are not met.

No measures are taken to combat **the demand side in prostitution** and this means that sex slavery will remain. The demand side in labour trafficking is also neglected.

1.4 Maintenance

Sida question: Will the benefits produced by Sida financed interventions be maintained after the cessation of external support?

It will be easier to asses the sustainability of the interventions when the new National Action Plans are carried out and assessed. That will happen approximately in 2009. The sustainability is further dependent on the economical growth in the partner countries. Not

even Kazakhstan has yet an economy, which allows full-fledged counter trafficking without assistance from international donors. Our answer to the question is now partly a speculation.

National Referral Mechanisms

Will be maintained:

The main intervention of the two IOM missions is building National Referral Mechanism. The national machinery and the legislation will not change to a lower standard if international donors would withdraw. Knowledge on counter trafficking must now be considered as an institutionalised knowledge at the national level.

Special courses introduced to Universities (KZ) will help the maintenance of legislative knowledge for the future.

The new National Action Plans are plans for maintenance.

Risk

Capacity building of Law Enforcement agencies on regional and local level and public awareness campaigns cannot be carried out without international financial assistance in Kyrgyzstan. The level of counter trafficking will not rise. Shelters would most likely have to close. According to the Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs, the motivation for helping victims of sex exploitations is very low.

IOM Kazakhstan says they are running their activities for the moment without Sida support but international donors are still needed even if Kazakhstan has reserved funds in its state budget for rescue of victims. According to the National Action Plan, Kazakhstan will support a shelter in Almaty at the earliest in 2008. The rehabilitation and reintegration of victims will drop in quality and in volume without international donors.

NGOs

Maintained

The capacity of assisting victims is now getting established among NGOs as well as their preventive work (hotlines, information, schools): Several of the NGOs have financial support from other donors for different missions. They will be able to continue as NGOs without support from IOM/Sida. Thereby, the knowledge will stay for a while.

Most NGOs are dedicated to the mission and do counter trafficking without 100 percent financing from IOM/Sida. The NGOs in Kazakhstan are better off. The NGO in Taldy Korgan houses victims partly with financing from their café/restaurant. The NGO Sharia in Astana is prepared to continue with the hotline service even without a contract with IOM.

State representatives from both Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan have declared their future intention to finance NGO-work on counter trafficking

Risks

The volume of the services will not be kept. Financing is the critical aspect, if the nationwide network of NGOs will stay. The investments in knowledge might disappear in the end. The weakest NGOs are located in remote areas where there are many people at risk.

Public awareness

Maintained

IOM KZ and KG have carried out its big information campaigns in order to raise public awareness. Mass media was active in the campaign. Media will most likely continue to cover the problem, especially if trafficking increases. The number of calls (KZ) to the hotline service indicates that people know of the problem and the service. The awareness will remain; the hotlines will continue operating.

Risk

Actions for maintenance of public awareness will be needed sooner or later. It is not likely that large-scale information campaigns will be carried out without assistance from international donors.

Conclusion

International donors are needed through the period of the second National Action Plans. The financial needs are bigger in Kyrgyzstan.

2 Specific questions

2.1 Best Practice and Lessons Learned in Central Asia

Sida question: Which are the best practices of anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia?

In this chapter we have included our own assessment of Best Practices and Lessons Learned as well as opinions of the stakeholders and the results from the participatory workshops that were held with NGOs in the two countries. The information we got from interviewees and from NGOs can serve as good indicators of the IOM projects. For NGOs, best practice of counter trafficking in Central Asia was fairly synonymous to IOM's and their own practice from the field.

2.1.1 Best practice

Our assessment

National Referral Mechanisms

The Best Practice in Central Asia is the results achieved in building National Referral Mechanism. That concerns the two countries.

Passport reform

The Kyrgyz passport reform introduced, in which IOM was the main knowledge partner, will have good preventive effects. Traffickers from the region as well as in more distant destination countries have used old Kyrgyz passport, because they were easy to falsify. The impostors could easily exchange the photos in the passports. Still 500.000 passports are in use by Kyrgyz citizens abroad. The reform will be completed in 2012. The reform was complicated and IOM consider it also as a Lesson Learned, referring to the complicated implementation of the reform.

Hotline number

The new hotline number in Kyrgyzstan, introduced from July this year will make it easier for people to call for information or tell about suspicious cases. The new phone number has three digits (189), is toll free, nationwide and launched in an information campaign. The government will pay for the phone service, which is also good practice and progress.

NGO network

The field organisation with NGOs in the two countries has strongly contributed to make people in remote areas aware. The NGO partners' willingness to network among each other has helped their own capacity building in general and shaped an efficient chain of assistance to victims in particular.

Uzbek rescue

An Uzbek rescue operation to Turkey resulted in 25 victims being brought back home. Their operation is worthwhile copying in order to reduce the gap between estimated and assisted cases.

Special police units

The special elite anti-trafficking unit in Tajikistan contributed to a substantial increase of detected numbers of victims in the country. The same type of unit in Bosnia disclosed actors also on the demand side. Their way of working is of great interest for other countries as well.

Training of consular representatives

The Consul of Kyrgyzstan in Turkey identified three Kyrgyz citizens who were sex trafficked. The victims were safely returned to Kyrgyzstan and got assistance. He/she had attended training for the Consular Department of Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Training of psychological staff

In 2005, IOM KZ held the first workshop on mental health issues mainly for psychologists. 19 psychologists participated. According to two interviewed psychologists in Kazakhstan,

they got useful information on new therapies besides an important network to turn to with difficult cases. Some victims of trafficking have traumas similar to tortured political prisoners. None of the psychologists has an adequate education for handling such difficult cases, according to themselves.

Summer camp

An NGO in the IOM KZ network carried out a summer camp for children at risk. During fourteen days, the children spent the days with training on what is trafficking, in what way they are at risk and how to fight it. Some of the children got that empowered that they planned to continue CT work in their blocks back home where there are other children at risk.

Street children

An NGO in Kyrgyzstan carried out training for street children. That was the first time the participating street children got information on trafficking. The NGO Sharia in Astana got funding confirmed from the Finnish Embassy, during our meeting with them, for the same concept.

Interviewees

Mr Talaybek Kydorov, deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs, KG

“Another Best Practice is our fight against corruption. In the consular service where corruption is possible, we changed 60 per cent of the staff this year. Three persons were dismissed, three received warning. ... We introduced video surveillance so that head of department can see how his staff is dealing with visas”

USAID

“IOM Kazakhstan managed to build a good network of NGOs and establish shelters. This has been a success – the network and the shelters work fine.”

IOM KG

“The national level is dedicated to participate in the fight. The Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs, Mr Kydorov and one MP disguised themselves as labour migrants, brought hidden cameras and went to see the border inspectors. It created big fuzz in parliament about how they were treated.”

IOM KZ

It is good to have both Sida and USAID as donors. Otherwise there is a risk that people easier reject our ideas by saying “this is just American ideas”

NGO KG

“One of our victims is now working with us as a volunteer. During the rehabilitation she realised that she wanted to contribute to the fight against trafficking and prevent others from getting in to the same misfortune”.

“I got a call to our hotline from a person about advertisements on jobs abroad. We learned that this company does not exist and could stop ten persons from going. “

“We prevented 4 people from going for jobs in Canada that didn’t exist. “

“Our NGO workers collected money and sent a juvenile victim home. She had been accused of crimes and brought to court; but thanks to our efforts she was released, “

“A former victim of labour exploitation established an own NGO and is now part of our NGO network“

“We managed to help a 23-year old woman to return to her family. She had been trafficked to Turkey. She got assistance in shelter, psychological help etc, 3-month vocational training and job as barber”

“We did a good training for street children“.

“We have had training on women’s rights and on trafficking in women. Afterwards nine of 17 said they that they cancelled the plans to send their daughters to Turkey. “

“The schools introduced special classes on trafficking in the curriculum after we had carried out information, which covered over 40 schools and a couple of thousand juveniles, age 14-16”

“We covered 16 schools in Osh city and in 56 in Kara-Suu, we trained school children, parents and others. Two girls who participated realised that they were proposed illegal jobs and that it was dangerous. “

“Good NGOs is equal to good anti trafficking work”.

2.1.2. Lessons Learned

Our assessment

Overlapping in Kyrgyzstan

The overlapping reported here below is actually an ongoing problem and more of a Lesson that should be learned.

OSCE and IOM have failed to establish good relations in Kyrgyzstan. This has caused – or is caused by – overlapping in building prevention, assistance to victims and competitive behaviour. The conflict between IOM and OSCE has been observed by both USAID and the State Committee on Migration and Employment. The newly appointed Focal Point for Trafficking, Ms Ryskolova, had called for a meeting with all concerned international donors to sort out the division of work between them. The meeting was supposed to take place 14 days after our interview. The determined behaviour of the Focal Point could at the same time serve as a Best Practice, proving the country's ownership.

Kazakhstan

OSCE and IOM at the national level in Kazakhstan did not at all experience overlapping even though the IOM NGO Taldy Korgan complained about efforts from OSCE to build field organisation for CT in their town.

We met with the ambassador of OSCE in Kyrgyzstan as well as the deputy head in Kazakhstan. We got an impression that it is not for sure that the heads of OSCE have all information on the field activities.

Conclusion

This overlapping is one reason of several to see to that the partner countries “own” the CT. The National Focal Points are the best to take a lead when a conflict already has occurred. The national actions plans are good platforms for the division of work.

Interviewees on Lessons Learned

“ILO prepared video material for public information. It pointed out Kazakh people in tobacco plantations as bad guys. This caused problems between the governments”

“It is hard to prosecute traffickers who are abroad. My division started only 8 months ago. We have only 4 staff members, three deal with issues of legal cooperation. We need experience of other countries since all the cases are related to several countries. Minsk convention helps us. We do not have bilateral agreement with Turkey on legal coop, we lack this”.

Mr Yandayer, KG National Prosecutor's Office:

“A big minus is that the government does not recognize Kazakhstan as a country of destination in the National Action Plan. Also, the government does not provide any protection to victims.” OSCE staff, KZ.

NGOs KG on Lessons Learned

“I learned that too much trust in clients can lead to disappointment. One has to provide aid “soberly”. Emotions are not always good advisors.”

“We learned that we must study the auditorium carefully beforehand. We used theatre presentations at a market. Because we used cases of victims in Kazakhstan, there was a conflict between Kazak and Kyrgyz spectators”.

2.2 Regional or bilateral support

Sida question: Is regional support better than bilateral or the opposite when it comes to anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia. Why so?

The Central Asian countries have trafficking as a problem in common but there are big differences in the governmental attitudes and policies in the combat.

Trafficking is not recognized at all in Turkmenistan. Uzbekistan is classified as Tier 3 and IOM and OSCE KZ witness on difficulties for the middle ministry level in Uzbekistan to do CT-work. The Uzbek government does not accept the problem. Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan are classified as Tier 2.

Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan have signed all relevant international conventions; others have not signed by the time of our assignment.

Differences in the economies start emerging with Kazakhstan as the rich country and the others lagging behind.

There is a big variation in the level of openness and democracy in the region as well as in the size of the countries.

The yearly reports from US State Department and other sources on trafficking flows, prove that the problem has to be solved in cooperation with more than the Central Asian countries involved.

Flows from Kyrgyzstan, according to US State Department 2005

“The Kyrgyz Republic is a source, transit, and growing destination country for men, women, and boys trafficked from Uzbekistan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, South Asia, and the Kyrgyz Republic itself for purposes of forced labour and sexual exploitation.

Victims of forced labour are trafficked to Kazakhstan for work in the agricultural sector, to Russia for work in construction, and to China for bonded labour. Kyrgyz and foreign women are trafficked to the U.A.E, China, South Korea, Turkey, Greece, Cyprus, Thailand, Germany, and Syria for sexual exploitation. Kyrgyz boys are trafficked to Russia and Kazakhstan for sexual exploitation. Kyrgyzstan is a growing destination for women trafficked from Uzbekistan for the purpose of sexual exploitation.”

Kyrgyzstan and the Ferghana Valley

In the Ferghana Valley, the borders of Uzbekistan, Tajikistan and Kyrgyzstan are zigzagged. The biggest trafficking flows from Uzbekistan to Kyrgyzstan takes place at the border check point Kara –Suu (?) close to Osh city. Immense corruption fuels the crime. This flow is now that intense that Kyrgyzstan also turns into a country of destination. Sex trafficking is predominant. The main street for selling prostitutes in Osh is full of young – many minors - Uzbek women who are shuttled daily through the border checkpoint.

Flows from Kazakhstan, according to US State Department 2005

“Kazakhstan is a source, transit, and destination country for people trafficked for the purposes of forced labour and sexual exploitation. Kazakhstani men, women, and children are trafficked to the U.A.E., Turkey, Israel, South Korea, Greece, Russia, and Western Europe. Last year saw a slight decrease in the number of cases of Kazakhstani victims being trafficked abroad and an increase in the number of labour trafficking victims into and within Kazakhstan. Men, women, and children from Uzbekistan, Kyrgyzstan, Russia, and Tajikistan are trafficked through or to Kazakhstan primarily for forced labour in construction and agriculture. Women and girls are trafficked for sexual exploitation. “

Advantages with a regional support – stakeholders and international organisations

Kazakhstan

IOM

“It is obvious that we cannot fight trafficking in just one country. I know from own experience that it is easier to work with a regional program. Of course, it is more expensive but results are better. Our office could coordinate. We would need to include also Russia in a regional cooperation as well as other countries.”

Head of National Commission on Family Affair and Gender Policy.

“In the Aral Sea we had regional support from many donors. This approach did not lead to results. Each country was trying to solve the problem their way. But of course, it is possible to have role model projects in the most advanced country and then disseminate the results. We are willing to take a lead there.”

“Labour migration is a regional problem, not possible to fight in one country. All Central Asian Republics are connected with invisible ties.”

Department of consular services, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

“Even if we stop out-trafficking we would still have in-trafficking until our neighbours have solved their problems”

Counter Trafficking Unit, Ministry of Interior, Kazakhstan

“Regional would be better but the matter of coordination is important.”

Head of the OSCE Anti-Trafficking Assistance Unit, Michele Clark, May conference in Astana 2006.

“Experience gained in the Balkans and other parts of the world show that a regional approach is useful in combating this trans-national crime and facilitating solutions. We look forward to seeing similar successful models come out of this event.”

Kyrgyzstan

State Committee on Migration and Employment, Ms Ryskolova, Focal Point

“It is more effective with regional support. It would be better if all governments, border services and other agencies worked under one programme, then they could cooperate.”

Advantages with bilateral support:

Kazakhstan

OSCE staff

“There is no structure for regional work. It would be problem coordinating. Also, the countries are on so different level in so many areas that it would be hard to find a common language. Two countries do not even admit there is a problem; three countries have developed national action plans.”

USAID

” It is good that the countries begin to talk on regional basis. World Bank discussions about regional integration in this area have not led to anything because the countries do not want it. They will start working regionally if they want to; international organisations will not be able to make them doing it. US Government has bilateral agreements”

IOM

” We do not have good experience of regional funding because regional and national goals do not meet. It’s hard to achieve results with a large regional project with many different interests, contexts, countries. How to administer all this, how to meet all these needs? This Sida project would be hard to do on regional level. You would have a lot of conflicting interests in different countries. ...

...Maybe some projects, for instance on labour migration, are better implemented on regional level. But it has to be done in a very elaborate way so that every participating country knows the terms of reference, the budget, actions, activities, indicators etc. It takes a lot of time”.

Conclusion:

In the interviews with stakeholders and international organisations, we got both positive and negative examples on regional co-operation. An OSCE representative refers to good experience from Balkan on trafficking in particular. A state representative in Kazakhstan refers to the Aral see as a negative experience from Central Asian regional co-operation.

Central Asian regional support seems to be the easiest for donors, at first glance. The strategy of OSCE aims at strengthening a regional co-operation among governments.

However, the closer to field work, reality, the more arguments speak for bilateral support. One of the stronger arguments against regional support is actually the quite strong emotions involved with elements of competition and feelings of superiority or inferiority.

The economic differences between the countries, their different sizes and different recognition of the problem are not good platforms for a regional support. A regional co-operation might also be negatively influenced by the fact that the countries are more willing to deal with their role of origin than destination.

The trafficking flows show further the importance of international work and through organisations with international networks more than regional.

As a final argument for bilateral support, we would like to refer to the USAID-comment on the fact that the countries will take their own initiative when they want to and not when international donors want to.

This does not exclude support to regional conferences on exchange of experience, for capacity building and similar, where one country has the responsibility as organiser (like now).

2.3 Influence on Poverty reduction

Sida question: Does IOM's anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia have an influence on poverty reduction? How?

Labour migration

Trafficking is failed labour migration. Preventing trafficking is making labour migration safe. Migration is needed for the short-term poverty reduction.

The increasing regional economic differentiation serves as both pull and push factors. While PPP in Kyrgyzstan (2003) was 1751USD, Kazakhstan had a PPP on 6671USD during the same period which turn Kazakhstan into the predominate destination country in the region.

Positive effects of labour migration.

Income opportunities

“Every year hundreds of thousands migrant workers from Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan make their way to richer Kazakhstan and Russia to find jobs... In Khoji-Bogh, a mountain village in northern Tajikistan eight out of ten villagers make the trip every spring, knowing that the USD 1000 they can earn during the season is more than they could ever hope to make at home”³

These eight of ten villagers in Tajikistan, may return to their village with 1000 USD. Their families can enjoy the income, which most likely is spent within the country on daily necessities, which, in its turn, improves the economy in the country.

Remittances

Remittances are increasing round the world. According to Frank Laczko, Head of Research and Publications, IOM, gross flows to developing countries amounted to 142 billion USD in 2003. In 1980 the remittances were 18,4 billion USD. Provisional World Bank figures for the

³ Torm 2003:26 via Fertile Fields IOM

2003 are 160 billion USD. The figures are picked up from a recently published report by Frank Laczko "Migrants' Remittances and Development, MYTHS, RHETORIC AND REALITIES. The increase has jumped since the break down of the Soviet Union.

We have not come over any specific figures on remittances for Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan but according to Central Asian Development report, 50 percent of the population in Tajikistan are dependent of the remittances, which they get from relatives and friends abroad. For Kyrgyzstan that could serve as an indication, as the economies are similar. For Kazakhstan – with growing economy and a role as country of destination – it might be far less people depending on remittances.

The former president of Kyrgyzstan, Mr Akaiev, stated during his presidency the importance of remittances – then one of the highest single incomes for the country.

There are different behaviours among labour emigrants concerning remittances. Men send more money back than women; newly married men send much more than single people. Migrant who go temporarily away (seasonal workers) return also with more money than people who settle down in the country of destination.

New jobs

Another interesting example is returning migrant to Uzbekistan having shaped 350.000 new jobs in their homeland. (Source: Central Asia Development report 2005 page 163).

Negative effects

Labour migration can be a problem for poor people in the countries of destination. The labour migrants from poorer countries hold back the salaries for unqualified work. The salaries can be paid on such a low level that the poor people in the destination country – with higher living costs - are forced to emigrate in their turn to countries, which pay better. Kazakhstan has migration flows to Russia as an example.

Labour migration does not automatically bring remittances. The family can be left behind and get an income loss which must be compensated by social assistance.

The brain drop is another risk but this should be compared to the knowledge which migrants bring back to their countries.

In the footsteps of an immense labour migration racism follows. Serious attacks against and even murders of people from Central Asia have been committed in Moscow.

Does IOM contribute to reduction of poverty?

The corporate mission of IOM is as follow:

"IOM's mission is promoting humane and orderly migration for the benefit of all. IOM does so by providing services and advice to governments and migrants... The IOM Constitution recognizes the link between migration and economic, social and cultural development, as well as to the right of freedom of movement."

All preventive measures against trafficking, improve the safety in labour migration.

Sex trafficking and labour trafficking have often the same roots. Both are often failed labour migration. Sex traffickers pretend often being intermediaries for ordinary jobs.

Conclusion

Counter trafficking work is an important part of a safe labour migration and thereby the IOM missions contribute to reduction of poverty.

2.4 Influence on Human Rights

Sida question: Does IOM's anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia have an influence on Human rights? How?

Trafficking in Human Beings, defined in the UN Palermo-protocol, is a crime against Human Rights. According to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, trafficking is a violation of several of the paragraphs in this declaration, not only Article 4:

“No one shall be held in slavery or servitude; slavery and the slave trade shall be prohibited in all their forms.”

IOM and Human Rights:

Counter trafficking is defending Human Rights.

A few examples:

- The information nationwide campaigns ran by the IOM missions are most likely the biggest campaigns for Human Rights in the two countries. The campaigns have had a call for “Ask for your Rights!” which contributes to make people aware that they have rights in line with the Universal Declaration.
- The hotlines serve in the same direction – telling the clients to ask for their rights, which are in line with the Declaration.
- Also to mention the attitude of the members of the NGO-partners: All victims we interviewed spoke spontaneously about the attitude of respect they had met in the shelters.
- IOM and their partner NGOs encounter situations (media, law enforcement, ministries), due to their mission on sex slavery, where they have to advocate that “even” prostitutes have rights.

Conclusion

Our conclusion is that IOM does an important part of the work for strengthening Human Rights.

2.5 Indicators and statistics

The problem – estimated number of trafficking

Trafficking is a crime. Therefore, it is difficult to elaborate reliable statistics on the total number of victims. The lack of proper statistics causes a tendency to either exaggerate or underestimate the number depending of the interest in the problem. We encountered among the interviewees a span on estimated victims from none in Kazakhstan (one high official) to hundreds of thousands within or from Central Asia (NGO-people).

Swedish government has the same statistics on estimated number of victims world wide as OSCE has for “Central Asia and within the OSCE area”. That is: “2 to 4 million people are trafficked within borders annually, and 600,000 to 800,000 are trafficked trans-nationally”. The span between 2 and 4 million is big and might affect the allocation of resources for counter trafficking activities. The difference in the geographical span confuses.

Labour trafficking has a higher estimation but also a bigger variety. Estimation of sex slaves has a lower variety. The numbers on estimated sex slaves are also lower than for estimated labour slaves, but on the other hand, sex slaves dominate among assisted victims.

The problem – judicial cases

The statistical reporting on judicial cases does also lack standards. US State Department publishes reports on efforts country wise on counter trafficking. This report is useful because it is yearly and has information from almost all countries in the world. Statistics show numbers of investigation, indictments and convicted cases from each country. The report is dependent on input from the countries. And here again is a variety which also shows in Appendix 2. It is a mixture of cases and people and there is a lack of figures which makes it difficult to compare between countries.

Conclusion

Sida supports IOM's counter trafficking in several countries. It would be useful for Sida to be able to compare the countries and also make comparisons over time. We assume, it

should be of interests for IOM headquarter to elaborate proper standards for statistical reporting as well as to state one way of calculating the estimated number of victims. A yearly publication on statistics from IOM's 120 countries with field missions would raise the quality of the debate and involve more people in the combat.

Proper statistics would also lead to better indicators, which would help all parts in the assessing of the measures taken.

3 IOM

3.1 Costs effectiveness

In general

The projects in Kyrgyzstan have targeted assistance to victims. Number of assisted victims is reported.

The Kyrgyz projects also comprise capacity building of Law Enforcement bodies and NGOs besides lobbying for building National Referral Mechanisms. The projects in Kazakhstan have targeted mainly public awareness through information campaign as well as capacity building of NGOs, hotlines and Law Enforcement bodies, besides lobbying for building National Referral Mechanisms.

All projects miss indicators for the capacity building. All projects miss indicators on impact for the information campaigns. It is not possible to evaluate the efficiency in this regard.

The two missions have started from a 0-level. When assessing the technical efficiency, this must be considered. However, even at a 0-level, it is possible to work with indicators and to observe tangible results of most of the measures taken.

Sida's contribution in SEK

Project Phase	KZ	KG
1	1.050.000	no financing
2	1.000.000	1.555.000
3	1.600.000	4.000.000
total	3.650.000	5.555.000
Part of Sida's total funding of anti trafficking ⁴	App 1,5 %	App 2,2 %

Kazakhstan

The Sida's contribution in Kazakhstan has been a prerequisite for USAID. The USAID and the Sida financing are not divided on separate actions. They cover the same budget lines with a few exceptions. USAID's contribution is six times higher.

Kyrgyzstan

USAID has also funded projects in Kyrgyzstan but without the prerequisite. The differently financed projects are anyway linked to each other and jointly influence the outcome. The approach is comprehensive even if there are different donors for the separate components.

Canadian embassy financed opening of the two IOM shelters in Kyrgyzstan but the main donors of both missions are Sida and USAID.

Division of funds between different types of components.

Direct assistance to victims in Kyrgyzstan has approximately 40 percent of the total project budget. The direct cost for producing the Information campaign in Kazakhstan had around 25 percent of the project budget.

⁴ According to the Overview of Sidas work Against Trafficking in Human Beings 241.585.835 SEK was donated during 1999-2004. The support to Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan comprises also 2005 (KZ) and up to first half year 2006(KG)

The two missions spend 20 percent of the budget on project management and administration whereby IOM headquarter has 2 percent of the total budget.

Capacity building of hotline staff, NGO staff and law enforcement bodies are other important parts of the budgets and concerns 10 – 15 percent for each of the categories.

Project management and administration efficiency

Kazakhstan

Administration has – as written - 20 percent of total budget (USAID and Sida) and comprises 5 percent of staff costs for Chief of Mission, regional coordinator, one fulltime employed project coordinator, 50 percent of an assistant, 25 percent of administrative coordination and 25 percent of a secretary. Travelling and per diem as well as part of office costs are also included. 2 percent cover IOM overheads.

Kyrgyzstan

Also in Kyrgyzstan administration has 20 percent of the total budget but comprises more staff: International staff (20 percent) of work time; Project Coordinator (100 percent), Project Manager in Osh (100 percent); Admin personals (20 percent: receptionist, secretary, finance assistance, driver); Duty travel; Communication; Office Space and Office Supplies; Security (3 percent of budget for assistance to victims) Vehicle (fuel) etc. The contribution to IOM headquarter is also 2 percent.

Conclusion on administrative efficiency

The co-financing in Kazakhstan with the USAID, makes the project big. The manning in Kazakhstan can therefore be considered as efficient.

The manning of Kyrgyzstan is slightly higher than in Kazakhstan even if the country, as well as the project, is smaller. The salaries in Kyrgyzstan are in general lower.

The administrative efficiency in Kyrgyzstan is thereby lower and should be considered in a potential continuation. It appears as if 20 percent for project management and administrative costs is more a rule, than related to what manning is needed.

Technical efficiency

We consider the achievement of the overall objectives as an efficient outcome. In that regard, the overall efficiency of the projects is high, but the efficiency of each measure taken could be discussed.

Cost per assisted victim

Taking reported assisted victims divided with the project cost⁵, the cost per victim is 34000 SEK (105 victims) in Kazakhstan and in Kyrgyzstan the cost is about 14000 SEK (387). The fewer cases, the higher cost. Kyrgyzstan has focused assistance to victims

Hotline calls

Kazakhstan has focused prevention. Calculation on the project cost in Kazakhstan is 85 SEK per hotline call (42515 calls). Kyrgyzstan has 895 SEK (7205 calls)

Indictments and convictions.

Kazakhstan had 19 indictments according to US State Department in 2004 and 2005. That would make a project cost of 192000 SEK per indictment.

Kyrgyzstan had 46 cases of indictment. The project cost per case would then be 121000 SEK.

During 2004-2005, Kyrgyzstan had 20 **cases** with convictions. That would make about 270 000 SEK per conviction.

⁵ Total cost of project divided by number of assisted victims, hotline calls, indictments, convictions.

Kazakhstan had 25 **people** convicted during the same period. That would make 146 000 SEK per convicted person.

Conclusions on technical efficiency

It is not really correct to compare the two countries with each other as Kazakhstan has had a longer project period and the available US State Department reports comprises only two of the years. On the other hand, the total KZ budget is lower. The figures might anyway give a hint on, for example, what it has cost to get a case to court – lobbying for improved legislation and training of law enforcement agencies etc.

It seems however obvious that the focus of the projects affects the efficiency. IOM KZ has lower costs for hotlines and IOM KG has lower costs for assistance to victims. None of them has really targeted the prosecution part. Costs for prosecution and convictions are high when using this way of calculating.

Allocative efficiency.

We presume that the lack of efficient gender analysis (see separate chapter) affect the allocation of resources - mainly measures targeting victims (prevention and assistance) compared to the combat of the demand side. This might partly explain the low number of convictions.

We also presume that the lack of gender analysis has shaped the allocation of resources to sex trafficking (women domination) compared to labour trafficking (men domination) which potentially comprises even more victims. (See further the chapter on gender)

Conclusions on allocative efficiency

Our advice is not to reduce funding for combat of sex trafficking and assistance to sex victims but to increase the support to labour victims. In both cases, fighting back the demand side is necessary if the costs for assistance to victims shall decrease in the future. A reallocation of current resources is not the solution by other words. Expanding the resources is necessary instead.

3.2 Organisation

3.2.1 Facts on the organisation

IOM is an international organisation with 118 members and 89 observers. It has 291 field locations in 120 countries.

The IOM field locations/missions in Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan have an international chief of mission, with an appropriate competence for lobbying at the national level for NRM. Kazakhstan had a vacancy on the position of chief of mission during this evaluation period. A local deputy was temporarily heading the organisation.

Staff, working with projects, have either similar experience from other international organisations or are trained for their missions. They are locally recruited. Among staff categories there are also drivers and security guards.

External consultants are hired for special tasks – as for the information campaigns. Judicial experts work as sub-contractors for assistance of victims in trials as well as for lobbying improvements of the legislation. .

NGO partner networks shape the field organisation of both missions.

The organisation supports “Rescue” of victims in the sense that there are specially trained units for taking care of detected victims (assistance at airport etc). The organisation supports also “Rehabilitation” (Psychologists and medical staff) and it has capacity to link to “Rehabilitation”-resources (social workers) to the assistance of the victims. The weak link is the way of “waiting” for victims. No special units exist for searching for victims.

Conclusion

Strength

IOM has a good organisation for assisting victims, a strong field organisation as well as a capability to work on the strategic level with promotion of NRM. The network of NGOs and sub-contracted experts give flexibility.

Weakness

The passive way of “waiting” for victims, contributes to the big gap between estimated and assisted victims.

Features

The IOM missions are organisations, affected by time-limited projects and the financing of donors. This seems to shape a dependence of getting donors. IOM KZ described this: “For everybody here, it is necessary to know how to get new projects”. The partner NGOs work on equal terms - on time limited subcontract basis.

IOM KG further described their organisation as “hands-on”, a little bit under staffed on purpose in order to avoid conflicts”.

Conclusions

Strength

The workload is often high in organisations with features as IOM missions. That can give good feed-back to the project staff through successful practice. A human resource driven leadership style is then a prerequisite as well as clear objectives and indicators, so the staff know when and how they achieve results and how to get credit for it. The efficiency is then high.

Weakness

It is difficult to keep the positive spirit for a longer period in such organisations as there is very little time for reflection. These organisations can also easily get problems with transparency in failures and lack of trust to superiors in telling Lesson Learned and shortcomings. There is a risk that conflicts stay long under the surface, grow and comes out with strong destructive emotions.

3.2.2 Cooperation with and between NGO:s

Both IOM missions comment on the NGO partnership as Best Practice.

Field organisation

The NGO partners help IOM to reach out nationwide in general and in particular to the risk groups in the remote areas. They bring back local knowledge to the missions in Bishkek and Almaty. Without this nationwide network, the IOM missions would work in a vacuum. In the two countries, the NGOs are organised in networks for cooperation within and cross countries.

Number of NGOs

IOM KZ has chosen to reduce the number of NGOs involved - from 19 to 8 – due to the experienced work-load. IOM KG has chosen to go the other way and expand its network to 24 NGOs but has on the other hand two co-coordinators of NGOs.

Task of NGOs

NGOs carry out assistance to victims, educational activities in schools, hotlines, training of local law enforcement bodies and parts of the information campaigns, both in Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan. The shelters are also run by NGOs.

Formalised cooperation

The co-operation between IOM and NGOs established after a formal open tender process and a workshop. Contracts and well elaborated ToRs with instructions on assistance are

signed. Funding for the NGO activities is transferred by bank, which helps in the financial control.

Competence

Some of the NGOs are experienced as NGOs and have several contracts on related issues – like violence against women, other gender issues, vocational training. This makes them less dependent on one contractor, which in its turn shapes a more balanced, and professional relation. The contract with IOM seems to be a key to more missions.

IOM as managers of NGOs

As manager and accountable to the international donors, IOM has taken measures if an NGO does not fulfil its task. (KZ) When an appointed project manager of an NGO had too many contracts, IOM demanded a change.(KG)

Strength

The network among the partner NGOs in all Central Asian republics (except Turkmenistan) is strong.

We did not come across any conflicts between NGOs and IOM. A member of an NGO explained: *“Other organisations provide grants but let you know that they are above. With IOM we are partners.”*

One NGO described conflicts with victims but said that in all those cases IOM supported and defended the victim.

In particular in Kazakhstan, the NGOs are experienced and run other projects, which make them not too dependent on IOM. This shapes a healthy power balance between the contracted and the contractor, which is fruitful in problem solving.

NGO staff reported on systematised work with administration and that IOM missions had trained them for this.

The partner NGOs (Sezin who runs the shelter in Bishkek) will have a seat in the new national council against trafficking. IOM mission did not participate in the regional conference in Astana, Kazakhstan, 2006, organised by OSCE, but saw to that their NGOs did.

IOM KZ takes actions for supporting the regional as well as the international networking of their partner NGOs by arranging workshop and trainings where international guests have been invited.

Weakness

Important information about victims is not always transferred from one NGO to another (also not from one IOM mission to another)

Opportunities

Increased training and elaborated networking, both in and between countries, can substantially improve the fight against trafficking.

Threats

NGOs need training on how to survive and continue working even if donors withdraw or lower their support.

3.3 Project process

The input

IOM's own knowledge on needed measures has been the platform for project process. This has not been contradictory to the analysis of the needs made by the stakeholders as they – in the two countries – have relied mainly on IOM's knowledge and established experience.

IOM facilitated the process of the first National Action Plan (NAP) in Kyrgyzstan. OSCE has taken over the role as facilitator in the process of the second NAP. IOM is however a member of the national council, which will monitor the NAP.

In Kazakhstan, both OSCE and IOM helped the government with its second plan. USAID plays also an important role for the governments in defining the needed measures and as one of the financers of IOM's project. Consequently, there are several knowledge sources even though state representatives in the two countries say that IOM is the main knowledge partner.

IOM has not elaborated the projects in any process similar to a qualified LFA-process where all stakeholders are involved. In the preparation of the NAP, the needs of the stakeholders have been taken care of. The NAP in the two countries is an important input to projects.

Relation to financers

IOM initiates contact with most of the donors for financing.

Some smaller donors (like embassies) are dependent on the knowledge and the analysis made by IOM on the relevant measures.

USAID has its own knowledge base and is present in both countries. USAID and IOM have regular and frequent meetings on follow-up of the USAID financed IOM-projects.

Sida has good experience being a financer to several IOM missions.

Implementation

IOM works with all significant national stakeholders for implementation of the projects. The NGO partners implement a big part of the project in co-operation with local stakeholders or with local stakeholders as target groups.

Relation to stakeholders

There was no observed dependence to the stakeholders – more a partnership or rather the contrary. The stakeholders are rather depend on IOM.

We would not say that IOM has become a part of the state structures, which is otherwise a risk. IOM's role of coming from outside has, during the circumstances, shaped a good platform for progress.

3.4 Capacity Building

Does IOM systematically work with Lessons Learned and Best Practices?

The evaluation method "Best Practice and Lesson Learned" is often part of a comprehensive strategy on capacity building. The Sida's funding covers capacity building of Law Enforcement bodies and NGOs in the two countries. Capacity building is a strategic tool in building and establishing National Referral Mechanisms (NRM). We have therefore chosen to assess IOM's work with capacity building.

The Sida-question on Best Practice and Lessons Learned has a direct answer further down.

Capacity building of Law Enforcement bodies takes around 10 -20 percent of Sida's project funding, capacity building of the NGOs and hotline staff have about the same proportion.

The IOM missions are dependent on their partner NGOs. The degree to which the NGOs are educated, deeply affects the efficiency of the projects as well as the sustainability of the reintegration of victims.

Workshops, seminars, round tables and conferences are carried out. The trainings are tailor made for hotlines, for medical and psychological staff, for law enforcements agencies, media and state officials.

Large-scale information campaigns in both countries have targeted the population with the aim to educate them on the risks and their rights. Sida has contributed financially to campaigns both in Kyrgyzstan and in Kazakhstan.

We have assessed the learning needs with the help of interviews of stakeholders, NGOs and others. We have not been able to assess the impact of the capacity building carried out as no specific indicators are elaborated by IOM.

The IOM missions are well aware on the learning needs of law enforcement bodies and NGOs.

3.4.2 Learning needs

Learning needs of NGO network

IOM Ukraine says it is necessary to “build” the NGOs, meaning that they are not full-fledged partners when they are contracted. Their learning needs cover a wide range of issues.

Psychologists in the shelters tell they need training in relevant therapies. They point out good trainers from St Petersburg, where there is a centre for psychologists working with victims of trafficking. The psychologists say that they need literature in Russian (according to them, the good literature is in English). IOM Ukraine tell on a decrease in the number of assisted victims who were trafficked again, when the professional support to psychologists and social workers was intensified.

Social workers in the shelters tell they need both training and practise, as there is still a very small knowledge base to refer to on social work for victims of trafficking.

Psychologists, social workers and other staff members of the shelters say they need to know more about management in general and conflict management in particular.

IOM KZ says the NGOs need computer and internet skills.

Stakeholders say the partner NGOs need more knowledge in analysing groups who are at risks for being trafficked.

IOM and the NGOs need improved media knowledge, according to journalists interviewed.

No one has commented learning needs on restoration of the formal identity of victims and of identification documents.

Learning needs of Law Enforcement bodies

The gap between cases brought to court and the number of convictions is too big. IOM Ukraine points out judges as the weakest link in counter trafficking. According to IOM Ukraine, the number of convictions went up when judges received training.

Police officers need basic knowledge on what trafficking is, on new amendments to the legislation, on how to identify victims and traffickers, on how to investigate cases and secure proof.

Capacity building is needed for setting up special anti-trafficking units of different police officers, prosecutors and judges like in Bosnia and Tajikistan.

Prosecutors need basic knowledge on trafficking and new amendments to the legislation. They also need knowledge about practice and guidelines.

Learning needs of media

Journalists need basic knowledge on the human rights aspects of all kinds of trafficking, and of root causes as gender inequality.

Journalists need to know how to scrutinize corrupt systems. The investigations and reporting by journalists can make a difference between a traffickers release or imprisonment.

Media representatives also need training in changing the perspective from the victims to the perpetrators and traffickers.

According to journalists who have difficulties obtaining early information, IOM missions need improved media strategies.

Learning needs of IOM missions

The two IOM missions need knowledge on gender analysis and on methods for gender mainstreaming.

The two IOM mission need training to carry out communication on the demand side in sex trafficking.

The two mission need training to shift focus in communication from victims to the perpetrator.

Strength

IOM missions are a source and resource – often the main source - of knowledge for politicians, ministries, law enforcement bodies, journalists and population. This means in practice that the knowledge of IOM is largely synonymous to the knowledge on counter trafficking of the nation.

IOM has an established position and can mobilise all influential stakeholders for campaigns in order to raise public awareness. IOM has access to Law Enforcement bodies and can therefore build capacity among them.

IOM missions are aware that they have to continue to build capacity of the NGOs.

Regional trainings are carried out for experts within the NGO-teams. Especially the medical regional training for psychologists was appreciated.

The international and regional network of IOM is a knowledge asset. Exchange within the NGO network is highly appreciated by the members.

The mandatory shelter interviews with victims on assessments of the assistance contain, most likely, important feed back.

Weakness

Capacity building is dependent on a long term strategy and planning. None of the two missions says they have plans for capacity building. This is typical for organisations with the features of IOM. Still the project documents are a sort of plan for capacity building. IOM KG says that the capacity building is dependent on what the donors want to finance.

Efficient indicators are missing in the training now carried out. The current reporting on capacity building tells about numbers of workshops and in best case, people trained, but there are no indicators telling about the impact of the workshops. There are a few interesting exception. One is a workshop for judges, which IOM KZ carried out. Three trafficking cases were re-opened after the training. That sort of indicator is terrific, but it would also have been equally interesting to know what happened to the cases in court. Another example is mentioned in the Chapter on Best Practice in Central Asia.

An in-depth analysis would have been interesting of a potential link between the USAID funded training in KG 2002-2003 of 1526 representatives of law enforcement structures

and the drop of convictions from 17 cases 2004 to 3 cases in 2005 – regardless the responsibility of IOM.

Opportunities

A long-term capacity planning strategy would improve the addressing and combating of an assumed increasing and changing trafficking.

With improved and implemented gender knowledge, it is partly possible to fight the sex slavery.

Elaborated and reported indicators will convince the donors of the necessity of financing capacity building.

Threats

With the assumed increase of trafficking, insufficient knowledge will appear through less sustainability, increased number of burnouts and internal conflicts.

Without impact indicators for capacity building, the donors might lose interest in financing these parts of the projects.

3.4.3 IOMs work with Best Practice and Lessons Learned

Definitions

Systematic work with Best Practice and Lesson Learned are common parts of an established capacity building and evaluation strategy.

Both Best Practice and Lessons Learnt include

New experience, the reasons for the outcome are analysed, the experience is documented, communicated and shall have an impact on future practice.

Best Practice includes

Positive performance, surpassing of achieved results and empowering practice

Lessons Learnt includes

Underperformance and unforeseen obstacles

“Best Practice and Lesson Learned” demands a transparent leadership style and trust between co-workers.

IOM and Best Practice and Lesson Learned

Answering a direct question the two IOM missions say that they do not systematically work with Best Practice and Lesson Learned, whether defined as above or in any other form.

IOM headquarter does not have any proper promotion of Best Practice or Lesson Learned on the external website. This can be compared to the annual web-report of US State department on “Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act of 2000”, which includes several pages on world wide Best Practice.

The Gender Bulletin on IOM’s website reports on something similar to Best Practice.

Lessons Learned are not reported anywhere, which in itself may be an indication of authoritarian leadership.

There is occasional use of the method. Some examples:

The staff in Almaty says that they use e-mailing with their world wide network where they ask colleagues for their Best Practices in specified cases.

In the regional workshops carried out by IOM KZ, exchange of experience close to Best Practice and Lesson Learned was on the agenda. (Final report Phase III).

IOM KG arranged a study tour to Ukraine in 2003 with the explicit purpose to study IOM Ukraine's "Best Practice".

Strengths

IOM missions have invited partners from Ukraine, Turkey and Moldova to NGO workshops in order to learn Best Practice in other countries with longer experience of counter trafficking.

Weaknesses

The features of the IOM missions are previously described in the chapter on Organisation. IOM has a type of organisation, which can easily get problems with transparency in failures and trust to tell superiors on Lesson Learned and on shortcomings. There is a risk that conflicts stay under the surface. This is not a soil for learning from mistakes.

Further, there is a bad heritage. Former Soviet Union countries have no tradition of working with Lessons Learned. The history tells more on the opposite way of working like hiding mistakes and adjusting reports in order not to be punished.

Opportunities

An open and systematized internal work on Best Practice and Lesson Learned would strengthen the outside image of an IOM as a knowledge based and transparent organisation promoting trust and effective leadership. This would eventually bring trust to donors and other stakeholders as well possibly also more contracts. If IOM headquarter, would open and promote a website for Best Practice and Lesson Learned, knowledge on work with counter trafficking would be faster spread thanks to the international and large network of IOM.

IOM missions have strong networks locally, regionally and internationally. The partner NGOs are motivated and dedicated to their mission. The networks are action-driven which means that the members together possess a lot of experience; successes and failures, which could be turned into Best Practice and Lesson Learned.

Further it would contribute to capacity building and make the staff and the members of the network feel good about what they are doing which, in its turn, would decrease the risks for burnouts.

Threats

IOM staff as well as members of the NGO network confronts situations continuously that contain a great deal of stress, trauma and pain. Victims of trafficking often show symptoms that are similar to the ones that can be seen after torture. From other workplaces with clients having similar experience, it is known that differently strong emotions are transferred by different communications to staff members that are not educated in dealing with these situations in a professional way. More often, than not, the staff tries to put the emotions back on the victims (counter-transference), thus creating a bad relation with the victims or – most likely -the transfer of heavy emotions will take place within the team itself. These emotions – are often conveyed and disguised as psychological defence mechanisms, e.g. projection, repression, regression. If the emotions are not dealt with the risk for staff burnouts will increase and eventually contribute to a decrease in leadership efficiency. In other words the victims' traumas will traumatise the teams, eroding them so to speak from the inside and paralyse effective work with the victims.

Consequently different measures for preventing burnouts are necessary. Work with best Practice and Lessons Learned could be one of several measures. Debriefing is a first hand measure.

According to all persons interviewed for this report, trafficking as well as illegal labour migration is increasing. This means that the mental and emotional workload will increase also for IOM. Preparation – and planning – to come to terms with this situation is needed.

Not working with Best Practice and Lessons Learned would give an impression of a too traditional and authoritarian leadership. The result of this will show in the end first in the

quality of staff work but probably also in the competition with other actors in the field, which in the end would mean an unstable situation for IOM. And contracts lost will certainly not contribute to that change in leadership, which seems to be urgently needed to improve the situation for all team members and eventually the situation for the victims themselves.

3.6 Gender

How are gender issues dealt within IOM's anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia?

Trafficking is a highly gendered issue, on both supply and demand side. It is not possible to reach sustainable results in the combat without a correct gender analysis. It is also important to recognise the gender backlash in Central Asia. During the time when trafficking has grown, gender based violence and discrimination of women have increased and harmful cultural traditions like bride kidnapping, honour suicides and polygamy have been resurrected.

The Sida decisions on the projects state that IOM shall consider gender aspects in the implementation of the projects.

IOM KG has accordingly stated a project objective in phase II on *"increased awareness of gender matters in all aspect of the project"*.

Sida writes in the ToR that trafficking comprises *"women, children and men"*. The first project in Kazakhstan targeted women and children but the latter ones target *"human beings"*.

Sida states in the ToR for this evaluation, that the evaluators shall consider the Swedish policy on counter trafficking, which is a highly engendered policy.

The Swedish policy clearly states men's violence against women as a root cause to sex trafficking. The policy acknowledges the link between prostitution and trafficking.

The Swedish policy is in line with UN Policy, Commission on the Status of Women from 2005 and the US Human Trafficking Resolution, the first resolution that focused on eliminating demand.

IOM headquarter revised its gender policy in August 2006. This means that the old gender policy is the one which has influenced the assessed project. The old policy did not include a stand or comment on the link between prostitution and trafficking. It is further clear that in the IOM policy as well as in the strategy, gender is understood as a synonym for women and gender quality as a matter of numbers.

The Policies on trafficking – in brief Swedish Policy

Swedish governmental strategy ⁶ describes trafficking as a symptom of poverty, lack of gender equality and lack of respect for children's rights. The strategy mainly focuses on the trafficking of women and children and on the worst forms of exploitation like exploitation for sexual purposes, labour exploitation and harmful child labour. Swedish strategy connects prostitution and trafficking for sexual purposes, rooted in men's violence against women. In June 2006 the Swedish Government appointed a Minister for Trafficking in Human Beings. This minister shall also cover labour trafficking.

The Swedish Minister of Gender equality states the following at 49th Session of the United Nations Commission on the Status of Women, New York, USA, March 1, 2005:

⁶ Fattigdom och människohandel, en strategi för bekämpning av människohandel genom Sveriges internationella utvecklingssamarbete. Regeringskansliet/UD2003

“We must also acknowledge that prostitution and trafficking in women for sexual purposes are gender-specific crimes and serious barriers to gender equality in all societies. It is essential that we make the commitment to counteract these practices with the recognition that full gender equality and equal participation of women and men in all fields of society cannot be brought about as long as some women and children, mostly girls, in our countries are victims of prostitution and trafficking in human beings for sexual and other purposes.”

UN Policy, Commission on the Status of Women

Since an estimated 75 percent⁷ of all victims of human trafficking are trafficked for sexual exploitation (UNODOC, UN office on Drugs and Crime) the Commission states that “the world must increase attention not only to the root causes that leave people vulnerable to trafficking, but also on eliminating the demands for commercial sexual exploitation – which overwhelmingly impacts women and girls and fuels the growth of human trafficking. Simply we must dry up the ‘market’ for victims if we are serious about ending human trafficking.”⁸

US Human Trafficking Resolution

The UN resolution, identical to US Human Trafficking Resolution, was adopted by the UN Commission in 2005. It is the first UN resolution stating the link between prostitution and sex trafficking.

IOM Gender Policy

IOM revised its old gender policy in August 2006, as written. The old policy – covering the assessed projects - was adopted by IOM headquarter in 1995. A Gender Issues Coordinator appointed in 1997. The first policy statement says that IOM works to ensure that “migrant women’s needs and concerns are addressed”⁹ The strategy talks about the feminisation of poverty, the vulnerability and marginalisation of women in migration and concludes that their needs have not in the past been sufficiently taken into account.

The IOM staffing policy states that equality between men and women is a guiding principle and that the staff should be gender balanced. Gender focal points are designated at all levels of the Organization. They are to devote 5-10 per cent of their time to the promotion of gender mainstreaming.

The overall Gender Mainstreaming Strategy introduced 1998 states that it is not exclusively related to women, “It also includes initiatives for men when needed”.

Gender actions

Strength

The focus of IOM on assistance to women, who are victims for sex trafficking, is in line with the Swedish policy, which up to now also focuses sex trafficking.

IOM missions have given women’s vulnerability full visibility in actions, in written and in spoken words. The neglect of women and denial of their problems is not a case in IOM’s counter trafficking. IOM also defends prostitutes, who are victims for trafficking, and say they too have human rights.

IOM KZ has carried out a Sida financed research on the link between prostitution and sex trafficking. The links are indirectly proven¹⁰.

A lot has been done to eliminate the stigmatisation of prostitutes that have stopped so many victims from getting the help they are entitled to.

⁷ IOM’s statistics tell rather on the opposite proportion with a dominance for labour trafficking.

⁸ Fact sheet, Office to Monitor and combat Trafficking in Persons, US State Department

⁹ www.iom.int

¹⁰ Interviewed prostitutes told about *other* prostitutes who had been victims of trafficking. No one told about the own experiences.

The missions have followed the IOM corporate gender policy by appointing gender focal points for the offices. The current focal point in Kyrgyzstan was recently appointed. There had been two or three predecessor. The focal point reported directly to the Chief of Mission. In Kazakhstan, the focal point is not a person but a task for everybody, which is actually a risky and weak solution.

Several of the statistical tables include division of women and men but the statistics are not sex disaggregated in the proper sense.

Weakness

Besides the focus on victims for sex trafficking, there is no further reflection of the international policies, above mentioned, in IOM's work, although USAID and Sida are the most important donors to IOM KG. See further below.

We cannot see that IOM KG systematically has worked accordingly its project objective quoted above.

We have not found any systematic gender mainstreamed work in any of the IOM missions. Rehabilitation does not include gender analysis. Vocational training is not gender mainstreamed. Information campaigns for school children, students and the population do not include gender aspects as roots to human trafficking. (KG)

The sex disaggregated statistics is not a principle which means that the disaggregating is not consistently implemented, only occasionally.

Gender awareness

Gender analysis of criminals

IOM KG has described the way traffickers are organized in their interim report to Sida for the second half year 2005. Clear gender aspects are included. This analysis is reflected in a discussion with the National Security Service, according to the report. National Security Service has a strategic role in disclosing the criminal chains.

In the analysis, women are defined as actors on the lower and middle level of the criminal organisations but – as stated by IOM - are not in the upper level "*due to the glass ceiling*". Women, who become "*she-bosses*" or "*problem-setters*", want to protect themselves from direct sexual exploitation.

This is an interesting description as the common perception of a criminal in trafficking is a man. IOM changes this perception with this description and this is very important in the work with detecting the real criminals. There is, though, a gender "trap" in this description. Women are often – in all contexts – excused for criminal activities through an inferior position to the criminal men involved. This often renders reduced punishments. In the IOM description, women's criminal activities are due to the will of protecting themselves from direct sexual exploitation by men.

Gender analysis of victims

The word victim is strongly feminised and can almost be considered as a feminised archetype in all kinds of contexts. Men "cannot" be victims in the cultural perception of the human mind. Men can be perpetrators or rescuers. If they become victims, it is because of bad luck. (Our analysis of gender stereotypes in trafficking)

The majority of victims of sex trafficking are women. Labour trafficking is often seen as a male dominated area even if women also become victims of labour exploitation. In both cases, labour and sex trafficking, women are recognized as victims.

For men the problem is more complicated. IOM KG has experienced – according to the NGO-workshop - only one case of a male victim of sexual exploitation. This does not necessarily mean there are only a few cases. We assume that, since training is lacking for detecting victims in general, the police lack knowledge also in this area. State officials tell about scornful attitudes among state employees to sex victims.

In the NGO-workshops we were told that there is a lack of knowledge on how to rehabilitate male victims of sex trafficking.

This also seems to be true for men who become victims of labour trafficking.

In the report "Fertile Fields" Liz Kelly writes about the disadvantages of only focusing on sexual exploitation of women:

"Men are seen as the primary target for trafficking for labour exploitation and the use of, and self-identification with the concept of victim is more problematic."

Some of her interviewees said that it was to avoid the shame involved in victimization that accounted for so many Tajik men not returning home, or delaying return until they had enough money to help their families.

"One is forced to ask whether the word victim has become a gendered concept", Liz Kelly writes.

If a person is recognized as a victim or not, is not an academic question since the legal status of a victim is a passport to access support and services.

At least in spoken words, men's vulnerability is recognized by IOM staff:
"It is a difficult situation for men who go abroad, they are ashamed. Women can recognize that they are victims, men cannot. Because of male dignity he wouldn't acknowledge it"

Gender analysis of trafficking

The Swedish policy focuses sex trafficking. IOM does too. Actually, labour trafficking has been shadowed. This is however changing now and the new Swedish ambassador appointed shall explicitly work with both sex and labour trafficking.

Our hypothesis is that a proper gender analysis of trafficking has led to an acceptance on the international and national levels that men can be victims too. Therefore labour trafficking has got more attention. A few examples:

- The OSCE Central Asian regional conference in May 2006 focused on labour trafficking because - as OSCE said – *"it has been neglected"*. Another reason, pointed out by an OSCE staff member, is that *"the focus on sexual exploitation has contributed to the low status for the issue itself"*. Sex slavery was not even on the public agenda for the conference, but dealt with in speeches of invited experts.
- The new National Action Plan for Kyrgyzstan is presumed to target labour trafficking more than the previous plan. OSCE has been involved in the production of the plan.

How is IOM dealing with labour and sex trafficking? IOM KG reports statistically on considerably more victims of labour trafficking than of sex trafficking. The proportion of IOM-assisted victims in all kinds of trafficking - labour and sexual - is however roughly only 20 percent men and 80 percent women. IOM KG's reporting for second half year 2005 included only 10 percent male assisted victims. IOM KG says that they want to assist more cases of labour trafficking.

IOM KZ says the number of victims for labour trafficking is higher. According to the Deputy Chief of mission an estimation could be calculated as follows; The coefficient of latency for sex trafficking is that one girl mentions 6-10 other girls. For labour trafficking it is one victim mentions 10-15 people. Clearly there is a need for more research in order to get reliable statistics.

Strength

IOM is aware of the domination of sex trafficking and IOM has the statistics which show that labour trafficking is neglected.

Weakness

The number of assisted victims – especially in the shelters – does not reflect the statistics that we were given. We only met one case – a family - of labour trafficking in the shelters.

Warning

We want to add a warning. There is a risk when labour trafficking is higher up on the agenda that sex trafficking is shadowed. Consequences can be less funding and political interest. Quoting the OSCE staff member – sex trafficking has given trafficking a low status. That is an indication of the problem. Sex trafficking is closely linked to prostitution. Men from all layers of the Central Asian society buy prostitutes, including men among stakeholders who shall fight the sex trafficking. That complicates the combat.

The link between sex trafficking and prostitution

Criticising prostitution often turns back to the messenger since it is believed that men have a natural need and therefore a right to buy sex.

The link between prostitution and sex slavery is therefore often denied, separated or avoided. E.g. IOM Ukraine has a strategy on counter trafficking, which clearly separates sex trafficking from prostitution.

IOM KZ commented on the minor victims, which had been housed in the shelter in Taldy Korgan and described the common man in Kazakhstan as “*having his family and then also a mistress. Then he visits the saunas, which are venues for prostitutions, together with his male friends*”. Five minor girls had been detected as victims of sex trafficking in a brothel/sauna in Taldy Korgan. The female police officer, who handled the case, was however sure that the owner would be convicted.

Another example given in the interviews tells about women being sex trafficked to the big Chinese workplaces, which are dominated by male labour migrants.

The report Fertile Field, published by IOM headquarters, refers to the research on the links carried out by IOM KZ and takes a stand for the link between prostitution and sex trafficking.

Strength

In spoken and in written IOM KZ confirms the link between prostitution and sex trafficking. The IOM-publication Fertile Field confirms the link.

Weakness

We found no other action targeting the link besides the KZ IOM's research. We also observed that the Swedish policy was unknown among NGOs and just vaguely known to the IOM missions. Among NGO members the opinions on prostitution were divided and a few even confirmed “men's rights”.

General conclusions on IOM and gender

In spite of the highly gendered nature of trafficking, gender analysis is not practised within IOM. In spite of two very progressive donors, USAID and Sida, the international agreements gender is not a topic. IOM people have a far higher gender awareness than the practical work shows.

IOM headquarter has a new policy since August 2006. The old needed professional updating. IOM Ukraine is in a learning process but still is on a level where gender is understood as women and men and figures. Their strategy on separation of prostitution from sex trafficking might be tactical but not in line with the reality, the policies of their donors nor international agreements. They have contracted the NGO Men Against Violence for support to male victims. That is a however good practice.

Gender is a complicated subject that also affects everyone personally. Therefore, a systematic gender approach requires time for reflection. If the leadership, in IOM itself and in the sub contracted NGOs, is not committed to gender analysis, this time will not be given.

3.7 Impact on Media reporting

The role of media is strategic. Media's interest and way of reporting can make a difference in the number of detected victims and the number of convicted criminals.

The two IOM missions have arranged seminars for journalists in order to increase the knowledge and ensure better reporting.

We interviewed twelve journalists from different parts of the countries.

Media strength

None of the interviewed journalists thought their reporting glorified working abroad and thereby feeding false hopes of a prosperous future. One of them commented by saying:

"In the last article I try to depict the real attitudes towards victims among law enforcement bodies, I think it is important to show the true picture".

Journalists were asked to rank the issue on a scale from 1 "this is not very important" to 10 "this is one of the most important areas of my work". Nobody answered below 3. Several saw reporting on trafficking as one of the most important parts of their work (priority 8-10), most answered 4-5.

The interviewed journalists fully understood that IOM needs to protect the integrity of the victims.

Media weakness

One of the journalists said that many of her colleagues did not consider prostituted women to be "real" victims if they ended up being trafficked

A few of interviewed journalists had attended "gender in media"-training. Still gender aspects were not included in her/his current reporting. One journalist said that she knew very well of gender aspects in trafficking but did not write about them.

The sample of newspaper articles in Kyrgyzstan that we were provided with – without reference to the interviewed journalists - showed a strong focus on women trafficked for sexual exploitation. Many of the articles were illustrated with pictures of women, not actual victims but photographer's models.

There are examples of unethical behaviour like when a TV journalist in Kazakhstan did not keep the promised anonymity of a victim. The victim was fired by her employer who happened to see the interview. In other cases, actual names of victims have been published (No one of interviewed journalists were involved in the violation of the integrity)

IOM Strength

The journalists turn to IOM for information; many even see IOM as the main source of trustworthy facts. They find it easy to get information from IOM or NGO partners and hard from law enforcement bodies.

The most appreciated information provided by IOM is its statistics, journalists commented.

The IOM missions are aware of the importance of media. IOM KZ takes time to, if journalists ask for it, check the facts in articles before publishing.

IOM KG, on the request of the NGO network, is now preparing a media strategy.

The two IOM missions have successfully included media in information campaigns for social advertisements: KG had free of charge spots on national television in the summer of 2006. Media have published (KZ) telephone numbers to hotlines and informed about other sources of help for victims.

IOM KZ told about situations when they had to defend prostitutes and telling journalists that prostitutes also have human rights.

IOM Weakness

Even though IOM statistics was appreciated, some journalists commented that the statistics were out of date and that IOM sometimes are reluctant to provide journalists with information which is already known to others. They gave the following concrete examples:

“When US state department said that trafficking is increasing we know this information comes from IOM, but IOM did not tell us”.

“When the plane with 62 women was stopped at the airport in Osh I was told information was classified. I had more help from Russian media than IOM”

Conclusion:

Future seminars and workshops for media should focus on a shift from victim to perpetrator, help journalists develop reporting on the economic and social structures (poverty, gender inequality, corruption) that feeds trafficking. Ethics should also be a topic.

IOM also needs to develop its own strategies on how to balance a) the victims’ right to integrity and media’s need of first hand sources and b) themselves breaking news in delicate situations and the need of classified information..

4. Other Options

4.1 Draft Map of Measures and Partners in Counter Trafficking

This draft map contains current and potential activities and partners. We don’t pretend to present a totally complete picture. More information could surely be added.

Potential measures on root causes are included. Swedish policy defines economy, gender inequality and lack of human rights as the main root causes to trafficking. Trafficking is thereby a symptom not a root in itself. Other Sida financed programmes in Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan cover already several of these root causes. It has not been possible to investigate, within the period of the evaluation, to what extent these programmes are mainstreamed with trafficking.

Level	Individual	Group/ agencies and NGOs	National
Strategy			
Prevention of direct risk	Hotline service Education Information material on work abroad. Website Permanent venues for information at job agencies or similar “Mobile theatres” in remote areas. Potential partners IOM and OSCE	Training of Partner NGOs Capacity building of Law Enforcement bodies; in particular local and regional level. Potential partners: IOM, OSCE Training of educational institutions like Universities, schools, pedagogic institutes including gender sensitized educational material. Potential partners OSCE and IOM. Training of job agencies Potential partners: ILO, OSCE and IOM Improved border control.	Building National Referral Mechanisms – Continued improvement of established framework through which state actors shall fulfil their obligations to protect and promote human rights of trafficked persons. Improvements of co-ordination of efforts in a strategic partnership with civil society and international donors. Improvements of legislations and National Action Plans. Potential partners: IOM and OSCE

		<p>IOM and OSCE</p> <p>Accomplishing passport reform: IOM KG</p> <p>Control of job agencies. ILO plus training of police by IOM and OSCE</p> <p>Gender awareness in media. Existing partner:FOJO</p>	
Indirect prevention of risk	<p>Empowerment of men and women – raised self esteem and training in business development, micro credits and vocational training - for groups at risk. Gender awareness. Human rights. Links between religious and cultural traditions and trafficking. Potential partners: UNDP, Unifem, separate NGOs, World Bank(ongoing?), OSCE.</p> <p>Raised awareness among men on gender, violence and consequences of prostitution. Potential partners: UNDP, NGO Golden Goal in Osh.</p> <p>Donors: EU, World Bank, Embassies like Canadian, Finnish, British, Dutch, Aga Khan Foundation, Asian Development Bank, Eurasian Foundation, members of the UN family.</p>	<p>Building strong democratic trade unions for prevention of labour trafficking: Potential partners: International networks of Swedish trade unions.</p> <p>Media awareness. Potential Partner: FOJO (ongoing) and local NGOs</p>	<p>Improvements of Economy and raise of labour opportunities. <i>Ongoing with World Bank?</i></p> <p>Fight against Corruption. <i>(ongoing with through World Bank project?)</i></p> <p>Migration policies in general and labour migration in particular. Potential partner if not already ongoing: ILO and World Bank</p> <p>Enhancing gender policies and implementation of Gender National Action Plans. Potential Partners: UNDP UNIFEM</p> <p>Legislative actions against demand for prostitution Potential partner: USAID Swedish gender experts.</p> <p>Awareness raising of Human Rights declarations (2004 Sida financed projects in Human Right directions with 11 million SEK).</p>
Protection	<p>Safe assistance to victims based on the concept Return, Rescue and Reintegration</p> <p>Potential partner: IOM</p>	<p>Training of NGOs as well as medical staff and social workers outside shelters. Potential partner: IOM</p> <p>Capacity building of Law Enforcement bodies; in particular local and regional level. Potential partners: IOM and OSCE</p> <p>Capacity building of border police as well as embassies. Potential partners: IOM and OSCE</p>	<p>Legislative work and policies for embassies. Potential partners: IOM and OSCE</p>

Prosecution	Legal assistance Potential partners besides IOM; American Bar Association, OSCE.	Capacity building of Law Enforcement bodies (police, prosecutors, judges); in particular at local and regional level. Potential partners: IOM and OSCE Training at Law Schools, University and institutes Training for journalists. Partner: FOJO	Legislative improvements and policy work. Potential partners: IOM, OSCE Fight against corruption. See above Special police units should get established. Possible partner: IOM or OSCE in cooperation with Tajikistan and Bosnia.
-------------	--	---	--

4.2 Description of other actors involved in anti trafficking!

IOM is without doubt one of the leading actors in the two countries. OSCE has an increasing role in both Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan. USA is the country which has the most important state donors.

OSCE

OSCE works mainly on policy level, not directly with victims as IOM.

Kyrgyzstan

IOM initiated the work with the first National Action Plan (NAP) against trafficking. OSCE has initiated the work with the second one and IOM has not been part of the working group. However IOM, but not OSCE is a member of the new national council.

OSCE has been working for the past three years raising awareness, strengthening capacities of NGOs, worked with police, prosecutors, militia and judges. The new NAP (draft was to be presented during the summer) has not the same focus on sexual exploitation as the previous one because OSCE sees forced illegal labour migration as a growing problem.

The former commissionaire on trafficking in OSCE took a standpoint for legalisation of prostitution as a mean in counter trafficking.

OSCE does not formally work with victims but the organisation tries to monitor trials and cases in detention. There is a plan to, later this year, bring in experts from Vienna, among them formal police officers, to do training of trainers.

OSCE has its main office in Bishkek and a branch office in Osh in the south, like IOM.

Kazakhstan

OSCE has been active in counter trafficking in Central Asia for 3-4 years. 2005 the organisation decided to help the country develop a NAP that would meet and respond to all challenges in trafficking in human beings. IOM was the only other international organisation involved in this work that led to a new NAP which was approved in March 2006. OSCE is now working to get the ombudsman's office involved and also promotes broader participation from NGOs and other stakeholders. The involvement of NGOs, does not concern protection of victims of trafficking.

OSCE and IOM had a meeting 2005 where they decided to focus on different issues. OSCE concentrates on the NAP and protection issues and plan to train local governments, akimats, in National Referral Mechanisms (NRM).

There is an ambition to meet regularly with IOM. For instance, when ODIHR experts visit the country, OSCE sets up meetings with IOM. USAID is another meeting place, both OSCE and IOM meet there regularly to share plans in order not to duplicate.

OSCE has organised round tables with crisis centres and trainings for NGOs on NRM and on the definition of trafficking. The organisation has also arranged two regional conferences 2006, both with a focus on labour issues. According to OSCE itself this does not mean that there has been too much focus on sexual exploitation, rather that trafficking for labour exploitation has been a neglected area. There are few facts about trafficking of children but OSCE thinks that it exists and will grow.

OSCE suggested a couple of years ago that Kazakhstan should take the presidency of OSCE worldwide. The suggestion was controversial but OSCE representatives said in a newspaper interview: "... *not for what they are, but for what they can be...*".

Financially OSCE is not a big player. Approximately 50.000 Euros are spent yearly which means the actions taken have a small scale.

USAID

USAID is a donor and coordinates the US financed counter trafficking activities in Central Asia from Kazakhstan. USAID has agreements of cooperation with 4 countries. Projects are planned to 2008 but funding has already been cut and can be cut even more when USAID becomes more of a vehicle for US foreign policy than a separate organisation. The cooperative agreements run as long as there are funds. USAID holds regular meetings with the actors in the field and is in reality the main coordinating body in the country.

INL

INL, International Narcotics and Law Enforcement Agency, which is part of US Department of Justice, works on prosecution and training of police officers, both in Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan.

ILO

ILO runs a program in four countries, Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan, Tajikistan and Uzbekistan. It includes the issue of child trafficking.

ILO has no official projects together with IOM but regular exchange of information. Short before our visit a round table was organised where IOM helped with technical contribution.

ILO is convinced that trafficking in children is growing. The regional inequality is much bigger today than five years ago and Kazakhstan has become a country of destination for adult workers and, often, children. In tobacco plantations and cotton fields it is not unusual with whole families working. There is little information of child trafficking, so far only anecdotal cases, according to ILO, under 10 each year. However ILO believes that child trafficking exists in every big city or large construction site. Child prostitution is also growing, in Almaty. One can find 14-15 year old children in street prostitution.

TRADE UNIONS

Trade unions would be a natural partner in the fight of labour trafficking, but trade unions are the weakest link in the chain. When the old unions collapsed, nobody supported the rebirth of real and democratic trade unions, instead international donors focused on NGOs. Today ILO is the key agency working with support and capacity building of unions. ILO has worked with the Trade Union Federation who gets technical support. ILO tries to engage the organisation in all national activities. Recently ILO had a regional workshop in Kyrgyzstan with the Federation of Agricultural Workers and the Trade Union Federation. ILO describes the role of the trade unions as small but growing.

State authorities have a different picture. The committee for migration (under Ministry of Labour and Social protection) does not see any role for the trade unions. In order to receive help from a trade union one has to be a member. And since only Kazakh citizens can be members they cannot do much for illegal immigrants or victims of trafficking, says the representative from the committee for migration.

UNDP

UNDP is not actively involved in counter trafficking in people, even if several of the regional programmes have a potential affect on trafficking. UNDP focuses on border management. The regional project BOMCA (Border Management Central Asia) runs in five countries with a budget of 45 million Euro and is coordinated from Kyrgyzstan. BOMCA is promotion legal transit of goods and services and facilitating easier transport but has no direct anti trafficking in People component.

However UNDP is an important resource and meeting point, one of these being regular meetings for gender focal points from international organisations, like OSCE and IOM. UNDP also regularly collaborates with IOM

OTHERS

Soros Foundation, Aga Khan Foundation, Asian Development Bank and Eurasia Fund are examples of other actors in the field of indirect counter trafficking. Several of them receive funds from USAID. As far as we have understood by asking around, they are all of less strategic importance.

4.3 Size and impact of the support in Central Asia

The predominant international donor of anti trafficking activities in Central Asia is doubtless USAID. IOM has had the biggest direct impact. The biggest donor of IOM is USAID. Thereby, USAID has indirectly the biggest impact.

The size of the support

USAID

USAID has a budget on 3,4 million USD for supporting contra trafficking in four of the Central Asian countries during January 2006 to 31st of March 2008 (27 months). The budget is disposed in the following way:

Kazakhstan 1.068.000 USD
Kyrgyzstan 700.000 USD
Uzbekistan 860.000 USD
Tadjikistan 770.000 USD

USAID's funding of IOM in Kazakhstan has had as a prerequisite, the co-funding from Sida. (funding in USD)

Project Phase	Sida	USAID
1	200.000	?
2	100.000	50.000
3	200.000	1.334.987
total	500.000	1.384.987

ILO

ILO says that it is new as an actor. The three-year Central Asian program, which is coordinated from Kazakhstan, will end in 2008 and is financed by Germany and US Department of Labour, in all 2.5 million USD.

OSCE

OSCE spends 50.000 Euro yearly on counter trafficking in the total region.

EU

We tried to get in contact with representatives for the EU-office in Almaty but failed. IOM KZ told about an upcoming interest from EU to finance anti trafficking in people. No figures on funds were given. Most likely EU can have plans for becoming a big donor.

Other donors

We asked all interviewees about other actors than IOM and other donors than Sida and USA (USAID, US Department of Labour and US State Department). We did not get any information on other influential donors. OSCE and ILO are though important actors.

We got information that the Canadian, British and Finnish Embassies are donors to separate NGO-projects as well as Eurasian Foundation and Aga Khan Foundation. (See also above)

Conclusion

Sida is an important donor and actor in Central Asia. Counting only the support to Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan, Sida has donated more than 1,2 million USD. That makes Sida as number two after USA-organisations. If Sida would withdraw, it would make a difference until the implementing partners and the partner countries have found new donors.

4.4 Continued support?

Our recommendation is to continue supporting the counter trafficking (CT) in Central Asia.

Overall reasons

Increase of the problem

With the presumed higher attention on labour migration policies and flows, detected cases of labour trafficking will increase and thereby the total number of victims of trafficking. All interviewees we talked to say that trafficking will increase in the region. The increasing economical differences within and between countries will contribute.

Several interviewees talked about increase in prostitution. With that follows the risk of trafficking for sexual exploitation.

Sida policy

Support to CT fits in to three of the six Sida objectives of foreign aid; namely on Poverty Reduction, Human Right, and Gender Equality as argued.

Continued support to Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan fits in clearly to the land strategies. Continued support to Kazakhstan is dependent on Sida's strategy for phasing out.

Synergies in Sida's programme in Kyrgyzstan

Some of the Sida financed programmes in Kyrgyzstan have synergies with programmes on anti trafficking.

E.g. Sida finances a long term programme in Kyrgyzstan together with other international actors. The programme aims at establishing an efficient state financial system. Anti corruption is a part of the programme. Trafficking feeds corruption in the state administrative structures as well as the corruption is one of the main problems in trafficking.

Sida has also financed long-term projects on gender, which included empowerment of women and raised awareness on men and gender.

Kyrgyzstan – reasons for continued support

The support up to now has strongly contributed to the establishment of structures for effective work. However, financial support is needed for maintenance as well as raise of the level.

Representatives of the state declare that they need assistance from international donors in general and IOM in particular:

“The Government has no funding for return of victims; we can't even pay salaries to diplomatic staff abroad. People cannot accept that we should rehabilitate people who were sexually exploited; they think they went voluntarily and they ask why use state money for them? Last year we gathered our consular workers from countries where we have trafficking. Ministry of Internal Affairs, border service and National Security Service participated. We have tried to determine what our missions abroad need and how to coordinate work.”

Mr Talaybek Kydorov, Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs

"We cannot bring victims back without IOM."

Erik Bishbembiev Consular services KG

IOM says further that capacity building of representatives from Law Enforcement is needed on all levels in general, regional and local in particular. The only ones capable to carry out this are IOM or OSCE.

Kazakhstan

Financial support to Kazakhstan is not as urgent as to Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan. We abstain from recommendations due Sida's plans to phase out. However, the problem with trafficking will remain and IOM KZ has the capacity to be a good partner.

4.5 Is support to IOM the best way to combat trafficking?

Our recommendation to Sida is, as written, to continue with support to counter trafficking in Central Asia and continue the cooperation with IOM due our recommendations.

Advantage IOM

International network

IOM has a large international network, which fits in to the character of trafficking. Cooperation between countries is necessary.

Part of big network with strategic knowledge

The IOM missions are also part of an international organisation with knowledge resources. In the continuously changing patterns of trafficking, it is easier for a local organisation to be updated when being a part of such an organisation.

Domestic network

IOM has built a large network in the partner country. Domestic trafficking will most likely increase, when the domestic economies start to grow with trafficking from remote areas to bigger cities as happens in Kazakhstan. For the preventive work, it is necessary to be as close as possible to people, especially in areas at risk. NGOs are close.

Competence

IOM knows how to work on different levels – has the experience of effective work on the field and get NRM established at the state level.

The strategy for counter trafficking is built on Prevention, Protection and Prosecution. IOM has capacity and experience within all areas, even if Prosecution is at present a neglected area.

Access to decision makers

The Governments in KZ and KG consider IOM as one of the main partners.

Assistance to victims

All stakeholders and international organisations, including OSCE, consider IOM as the only organisation for assistance to victims.

Capacity building of Law Enforcement agencies.

When it comes to capacity building of law enforcement agencies – which is a big remaining part of the building of substantial National Referral Mechanisms (NRM) IOM says that only IOM and OSCE are capable..

IOM's gender policy

IOM's gender policy is not adversary to the Swedish policy on sex trafficking. IOM doesn't have any official standpoint on legalisation of prostitution. NGO people and IOM staff showed a serious interest for the Swedish policy.

Disadvantage IOM

Our impression is that IOM has difficulties in balancing the assistance to victims of sex trafficking and of labour trafficking, which actually might indicate a gender discrimination of men.

Our impression is that IOM has a too passive organisation – waiting for victims.

Our impression is that IOM does not pay enough attention to the third P (Prosecution) which otherwise could raise the number of prosecuted and convicted cases.

If measures to improve conditions for long term planning are not taken by IOM head quarter, capacity will decrease. IOM leadership must improve at all levels for not only keeping the competence but also raising it.

The IOM missions are previously described as organisations, which do not have a good ground for learning from mistakes. (See also chapter on Capacity Building and Organisation)

The IOM missions have not taken a lead in counter trafficking of children. ILO is planning actions.

It is difficult to assess the real outcome of IOM actions taken as the impact indicators are missing.

5. Recommendations

5.1 Recommendations to Sida

Several of the recommendations below are guidelines more than actions. They are listed without any ranking.

Bilateral support as a main rule and regional in certain contexts.

Continued bilateral support and in various ways encouraged regional cooperation - particular in capacity building and networking of NGOs. Urgent and needed cooperation between governments will most likely be covered within the budget frames of other donors (USAID, OSCE)

If not...

If Sida anyway would prefer supporting a regional cooperation, OSCE would be an appropriate partner as its strategy is to try strengthening the regional cooperation. Choosing regional cooperation, and thereby OSCE as a partner, will change the direction of the support. In the presumed division of work between the different international actors, IOM will most likely continue with direct assistance of victims and OSCE will not build a field organisation for this.

Continued support to Kyrgyzstan

Due land strategy, the financial needs and the presumed increase of trafficking (origin, transit and destination), we recommend Sida to continue the support to Kyrgyzstan.

Continued support to IOM

We have argued for a continued co-operation with IOM on other pages.

If not...

If Sida would withdraw its funding, IOM needs time for finding other donors for assistance to victims.

Continued support to Kazakhstan?

The financial needs are not as urgent as in Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan. The government of Kazakhstan has stated its willingness to finance a minor part of CT work from its own budget. Sida has a strategy for phasing out of Kazakhstan. However, the problem with Kazakhstan's increasing role as destination country for trafficking will require international assistance. If these destination problems are not cared for, efforts in Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan will not be equally efficient.

If not...

If Sida would withdraw from Kazakhstan, it is even more urgent to include components, which support regional co-operation as argued above.

Initial steps of project development process

The first step in a new but continued cooperation in Kyrgyzstan has to include a meeting with the National Focal Point for counter trafficking to avoid being involved in a potential overlap in the OSCE and IOM programmes. It is necessary to see to that IOM and OSCE come to a serious agreement on division of work. For the final conclusions on priorities in the cooperation – regardless what is written here – the priorities in the NAP, will be the best guide.

Gender Equality

Swedish involvement in counter trafficking can be a guarantee for properly gender-mainstreamed actions. This can even be the main reason for in particular Sida's presence in the counter trafficking. Our recommendations include increase of actions on the demand side in sex slavery and increased support for detecting men victims of sexual exploitations. There are only a few international donors with an appropriate policy for this. In the Central Asian area Sida and USAID are the two most important - both representing countries with the same kind of policy in this regard. Further Sida can also be a guarantee of continued attention to sex trafficking when labour trafficking will be properly accepted. That means elimination of the risk that the labour trafficking would dominate so much that it shadows the biggest trafficking problem for women (sex trafficking).

Inclusion of gender analysis in all kinds of training, IOM staff training included, for raised awareness and for implementation of gender mainstreaming models.

International partners for support of Swedish aspects

It will be a long-term process to get understanding for the Swedish policy on the link between prostitution and sex trafficking even if USAID is a good partner. Involving more international partners through strengthening of UN Policy, Commission on the Status of Women might be one way.

Objectives for a continuation - Close the Gaps

The assessing of the projects would be easier, if the objectives of the projects were more specified and focused on for instance closing the gaps between assisted and estimated victims and on the number of cases brought to court/convictions. A wide range of activities have to be implemented in order to close these gaps. The efficiency of the activities would be easier to assess for IOM itself as well as for the national councils on counter trafficking and for Sida. The projects could even be named "Close the Gaps". Compared to current naming of the projects in for instance Kyrgyzstan – "Assistance to Victims", it might be obvious that the proposed naming is more result driven

As a consequence of the recommendation to "Close the Gaps", measures for fighting back the demand side in both sex and labour trafficking are needed. Otherwise the counter trafficking risks to turn into a band aid action. A fight back of the demand side will also help media to shift focus from victims to perpetrators.

This type of objective has a higher exposure to risks and failures as it is more specified. Therefore we recommend IOM to adapt a regular evaluation in line with Best Practice **and** Lessons Learned.

Examples of possible IOM actions:

Help establishing Special Forces like the anti trafficking forces in Bosnia and the elite anti trafficking unites in Tajikistan.

Reshaping of IOM's organisation to support search for victims of sexual **and** labour exploitation. NGO training is needed.

Special component on men and gender plus inclusion of a men's NGO in the network.

Explore the need of good-will for companies and see if there is an interest for something like a campaign as Swan-marked companies but in this case “No to trafficking”.

It should however be up to the local IOM mission to propose actions for achieving the goal as well as to present a proper statistical base-line study.

Continued support to assistance to victims through IOM

Sida has capacity and policy for long-term support, which is crucial for rehabilitation of victims. Because of the new NAP in Kyrgyzstan, financial contribution to NGOs and shelters might be included but additional financing will be needed for the nearest ten years. We recommend longer programmes than currently in order to contribute to a higher efficiency of IOM.

IOM is considered the best partner for assistance to victims.

Support to raised level of psychological treatment

Capacity building of psychological staff is necessary. Cooperation with the mentioned Institute in St Petersburg might be an option for improved therapies and number of capable psychologists. There is a shortage of psychologists in the two countries.

Development of therapies for men victim is needed – victims of sexual and labour trafficking.

Some of the victims of sexual exploitation should be recognised having the same level of traumas as tortured political prisoners.

Funding of an international conference on the psychological status of victims of trafficking and on relevant therapies would contribute to higher quality in the rehabilitation of victims. If this funding should be channelled through the cooperation with Kyrgyzstan, IOM headquarter or any other organisation can be discussed.

Children

There is now only vague knowledge on trafficking in minor girls and boys among the stakeholders we met. International estimations say that up to 30 percent of all victims for trafficking can be minors. IOM KG wants to start working with children. The ongoing Sida financed programme in cooperation with Association of Social Worker and the Ministry of Social Security should be sufficient within the frame of Sida-financing for preventive actions.

Indicators

We have had big difficulties in evaluating the efficiency of IOMs measures taken due to lack of relevant indicators. If the projects were elaborated in line with LFA, weak indicators would be easier to identify already before the start of the project. The management of IOM KG expressed that it wished to use LFA as a model also for Sida projects.

5.2 Recommendations to IOM headquarter

Statistics

IOM headquarter could help IOM missions to develop a joint standard of statistics and also help them pay more attention to raise the quality of their statistical reporting. Improved diagnostic reviews and performance assessment would raise the efficiency of the counter trafficking.

The two IOM missions base now their statistical reporting on the time for the project. Project based statistics helps evaluating the costs for the project itself. Statistics founded on calendar year are equally important for comparison cross countries and over time. That helps assessing the efficiency also within the IOM network.

For Sida, this is of special interest as more than one IOM field mission receives financial support.

All statistics shall be sex aggregated.

A small - electronic or printed - booklet like the Swedish "Women and Men in figures" would be useful for dissemination of knowledge round the world.

Long term planning

We have already described the features of the IOM-missions. Measures are needed to support a long term planning for increased capacity building of the IOM staff itself, the NGOs and the stakeholders. We emphasise the capacity building as this is a common IOM-measure in building National Referral Mechanisms and for building strong NGO-networks. Building capacity of others requires, a continued raise of the knowledge of the "capacity builders" themselves. The following comment on gender is for instance one area which needs capacity building.

Gender

Due to the period (Aug 2006) for launching the new gender policy of IOM, it has not been possible to study it and follow up with comments. Still the previous gender policy is the one which has influenced the gender analysis of the projects which we have assessed. We just want to point out the necessity of gender training – not only of the gender focal points but also of managers.

Supplements

Supplement 1 Chart on projects – see separate document

Supplement 2 Review of Expect results – see separate document

Supplement 3 . Statistics

2004			% indicted in		% convicted in	
Country	Investigation	Indictments	relation to invest	Convictions	relation to indict	
KZ	27	14	52%	N/a	N/a	12 people convicted
KG	N/a	31	N/a	17	55%	
UA	72	68	94%	67	99%	

2005			% indicted in		% convicted in	
Country	Investigation	Indictments	relation to invest	Convictions	relation to indict	
KZ	29	5	17%	N/a	N/a	13 people convicted
KG	34	15	44%	3	20%	
UA	78	95	122%	N/a	N/a	115 persons convicted.

Source US State department

Global						
year	Investigation	Prosecutions	Convictions	%	New amendments or legislation	
2003		7992	2815	35%	24	
2004		6885	3025	44%	39	
2005		6618	4766	72%	41	

Source US State department

Europe and Eurasia						
year	Investigation	Prosecutions	Convictions	%	New amendments or legislation	
2003		2437	1561	64%	14	
2004		3329	1274	38%	20	
2005		2598	1984	76%	41	

Estimated VoT.

OSCE Conference Almaty 06

2-4 million are trafficked within borders annually, and 600.000 and 800.000 are trafficked transnationally in Central Asia, as in other parts of the OSCE region

Fact sheet Swedish Government

2 to 4 million people are trafficked within borders annually, and 600,000 to 800,000 are trafficked trans-nationally

IOM KZ, Kataryna Badykova

Coefficient of latency: (sex) one girl mentions 6-10 other girls; (labour) one victim mentions 10-15 people

Fertile Fields IOM referring to:

Kyrgyz info - 75000 Kyrgyz in slave like conditions

Ministry of Labour, Uzbekistan - 100000 Uzbeks trafficked; 600000 subjected to labour exploitation

Sida

Ref No 2001-001700 - 5 000 – 10 000 Kazakh women living abroad as trafficking victims

Ref No 2001-001700 - 4000 Kyrgyz women trafficked in 1999

Acronyms – IOM International Organisation of Migration, KG Kyrgyzstan, KZ Kazakhstan, OSCE Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe, UA Ukraine, VoT Victims of Trafficking

Supplement 4. Timetable of the mission to Kyrgyzstan (June 5-11, 2006)

Date, time	Designation	Venue
June 05, 2006 Monday		
05.10	Arrival in Bishkek, Manas airport. Accommodation in the hotel, rest.	
13.30 – 16.00	IOM Bishkek CT team and NGOs. Group-workshop-interview. Participants:	IOM Office
16.00 – 16.30	- NGOs "Tseonis", "Elsen", "Sezim", "Kalys", "Eraiym"	
Coffee-break	- IOM NGO Coordinator – Ms. Khalida Rakisheva	
16.30-19.00	- IOM National Program Officer – Ms. Bermet Moldobaeva - IOM Program Assistant – Ms. Janna Salieva - IOM Project Assistant – Mr. Sadyrbek Esendjanov	
June 6, 2006 Tuesday		
09.30-12.00	Meetings with victims of trafficking	Shelter for victims of trafficking in Bishkek
12.00 – 13.30	Lunch	
13.30 – 15.00	UNDP – Ms Sezin Sinanoglu, Deputy Res. Rep., Ms Anastasia Davinskaya, Good Governance programme and Ruslan Baiysh, representative from BOMCA-project.	UNDP
15.30 – 17.00	OSCE – Ambassador Mr Marcus Mueller, Head of OSCE field office in Osh Mr Jerome Bouyjou and Head of OSCE's counter trafficking Mr Oleg Semenko	OSCE
June 07, 2006, Wednesday		
09.00 – 09.30	Mr. Arapbaev (Ministry of Internal Affairs), Member of National Council on counter-trafficking	
09.35 – 10.05	Mr. Kydyrov (Ministry of Foreign Affairs), member of National Council on counter-trafficking	
10.45 – 11.15	General Prosecutor office representative, Mr Yandayer and Mr Nurjan Shaiyldabekova	
11.20 – 12.00	Mr. Erik Beishembiev – Head of the Consular Service under the Ministry of Foreign Affairs	
12.00 – 13.30	Lunch	
13.40-14.10	Meeting with journalists.	
14.20 – 15.10	Resource Centre on Migration issues on the basis of the Kyrgyz State University, Mr Damir Asanov	Kyrgyz State University
16.40 – 18.00	Flight to Osh. Accommodation.	"Taj-Mahal" Hotel
19.00	Dinner	
June 08, 2006, Thursday		
09.30 – 12.00	Meetings with victims of trafficking	Shelter for victims of trafficking in Osh
12.00-13.30	Lunch	
13.40 – 19.00	Golden Goal and other NGO partners in the south. Group-workshop-interview. Participants:	IOM Office in Osh
	- NGOs "El-Site", "Leylek Ayalzaty", "Golden Goal", "Podruga", "Ulybka" - Ms. Hymia Suerkulova, NGO Coordinator in the South	
19.00 -	Meeting with former MP Tadjinitza Abdurasolova	
June 09, 2006, Friday		
09.30-10.10	Representatives from the South Internal Affairs Department under the Ministry of Internal Affairs	

10.20 – 11.00	National Security Service representatives. Mr Bahir Bakibaev	
11.10 – 12.00	State Department on Migration and Employment (South department) Djoldosheva Nuriyla Kimsanova	
12.10 – 14.30	Lunch	
14.40 – 15.10	Meeting with Journalists	
15.20 – 16.00	Bubusara Orozbekova – head of NGO and politician.	
16.30-17.00	OSCE field office in Osh and meeting with the head. Mr Jerome Bouyjou	
18.00	Flight to Bishkek	
June 10, 2006, Saturday		
11.00 – 12.00	Ms. Ryskulova – Head of the State Committee on Migration and Employment	
Afternoon	Discussions with IOM, Mr. Zlatko Zigic and Ms. Bermet Moldobaeva	
June 11, 2006, Sunday		
June 12, 2006, Monday		
	Flight to London	

Supplement 5. Timetable of the mission to Kazakhstan (June 25- July 4, 2006)

Date	Time	Event
25/06	23.45	Bonnie arrives with LH648
26/06	9.00-18.00	Trip to Taldykorgan – meeting with NGO Partner – “Taldykorgan Regional Women Support Center”
27/06	10.30 – 11.30	USAID - Mr Mark Hannafin, Programme Manager
	12.30 – 13.15	Lunch, Meeting with IOM
	13.30 – 18.00	Meeting with NGOs (NGO “Rodnik” from Almaty (3 people , and NGO from Taraz, 2 people) at IOM office
28/06	06.55 – 8.30	Flight to Astana
	13.00 -15.00	NGO Zharia
	15.00	Ministry of Interior, Mr Timur Karimov
	19.00	NGO Zharia
29/06	10.00	Head of Secretariat National Commission of Family and Gender, Mr Bekzhanov Zhambyl Lesbekovich
	12.00	Mr Yrskali Daurenbek, Deputy Chief of Department of Consular Service, Ministry of Foreign Affairs plus colleagues
	14.00	Department of International Law, Ministry of Justice, Dania Aitmuhametov and Karlygas Kandykerova
	17.00	Mr Abdiev Jaibek Nietovny, Head of Committee on Migration of the Ministry of Labour and Social Protection.
30/06	11.30	Senator Ms Svetlana Djalmangambetova
	15.55	Flight to Almaty
	18.30 – 20.00	Deputy Head of OSCE in Kazakhstan Mr Björn Halvarsson
1/07		IOM
2/07		
3/07	09.00	OSCE, Ms Liza Zhumakhmetova, National Legal Officer, Human Dimensions
	10.30	ILO-IPEC, Sofia An, Country Project Coordinator
	13.00	Argumenti i Faktu
	14.00	Shelter Rodnik Almaty
	17.00 -19.00	IOM

4/07	Departure Sweden
------	------------------

Supplement 6. List of interviewed persons and organisations

Kyrgyzstan:

IOM:

Zlatko Zigic, Chief of Mission
 Bermet Bermet Moldobaeva, National Program Officer
 Janna Salieva, IOM Program Assistant
 Sadyrbek Esendjanov, IOM Project Assistant
 Aida Akjoltoeva, IOM Project Assistantm Osh
 Khalida Rakisheva, NGO coordinator

Representatives from NGOs (see appendix)

Tseonis
 Elsen
 Kalys
 Sezim
 Atyrkul Jaylobaeva, public foundation Kelechek Dooru
 Women's Public Foundation
 Altanay
 Hymia Suerkulova, NGO Coordinator in the South
 Representatives from NGOs
 Golden Goal
 El-Site
 Leylek Ayalzaty
 Podruga
 Ulybka
 Women-leaders of Jalalabad

Talaybek Kydyrov, Deputy Foreign Minister
 Aigul Ryskulova, Chairperson State Committee on Migration and Employment
 Erkin Arapbaev, Ministry of Internal Affairs
 Timur Sarubaev, Deputy Head Security of Borders, National Security Service, Bishkek
 Bahir Bakibaev, National Security Service, Osh
 Mr Yandayer, Head of International Relations and Extradiction, General Prosecutors Office
 Nurjan Shaiyldabekova, Head of International Department. General Prosecutors Office
 Erik Beishembiev, Head of the Consular Service, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
 Damir Asanov, Center for Research Migration Problems
 Sezin Sinanoglu, Deputy Resident Representative UNDP
 Anastasia Divinskaya, UNDP
 Ruslan Baiysh, representative of BOMCA-project, UNDP
 Djoldosheva Nuriyla Kimsanova, Chief Committee on Migration and Employment of Osh City

Markus Müller, Ambassador, OSCE
 Oleg Semenenko, Human Dimension Office, OSCE
 Jerome Bouyjou, Head of Field Office (Osh)OSCE
 Jyldyz Bekebaeva, journalist Osh

Almaz Khalet, journalist Osh
 Stanislav Polishek, journalist Osh
 Alla Piatibratova, journalist Osh

Journalists invited in Bishkek:

Vitaly Pojarksy, Delo No (Newspaper)
 Eugeny Denisenko, Vecherny Bishkek, newspaper
 Tolkun Namatbaeva, Nemtskaya Volna (radio)
 Ibragim Nurakun Uulu, BBC
 Ludmila Pavlovich, Slovo Kyrgyzstana (newspaper)
 Dmitry Orlov, Argumeny i fakty (newspaper)
 Bermet Matkerimova, Kyrgyz Tuusu (newspaper)
 Jildiz Boroeva, Erkin Too (newspaper)

Bakyt Orunbekov, Azattyk (radio)

Bubusara Orozbekova, Osh, Politician
Tadjinita Abdurasolova, Osh, former MP.

Shelter staff in Bishkek
Shelter staff in Osh
Victims of Trafficking

Kazakhstan

Yekaterina Badikova, Deputy Head of Mission
Aliya Alikova, Counter-trafficking Programme Coordinator
Ainour Danenova, Counter-trafficking Program Assistant
Aina Shomanbayeva, Regional Counter-trafficking Programme Legal Consultant

Mark Hannafin, Program Manager, USAID

Mr Bekzhanov Zhambul Lesbekovich, manager of secretary of the National Commission on Family Affairs and Gender Policy
Timur Karimov, head of counter-trafficking Department, Ministry of Interior
Svetlana Pak, counter trafficking Department, Ministry of Interior
Daniay Aitmuhametov, Ministry of Justice
Karlygash Kandykerova, Ministry of Justice
Abdiev Jaibek Nietovny, Head of Committee on Migration of the Ministry of Labour and Socail Protection
Yrskali Daurenbek, Deputy Chief of Department Consular Service, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Svetlana Jalmagambetova, Senator

Nina Balebaeva, NGO Rodnik, director and head of shelter
Svetlana Sharbanova, Rodnik
Gasisa Saisanbaev, Rodnik
Elena Barshenkov, Rodnik
NGO Bolashak, Taraz
Gulsi Nabieva, Director or NGO Zharia and her staff

Björn Halvarsson, Deputy Head of Center, OSCE
Liza Zhumakhmetova, National Legal Officer, Human Dimensions, OSCE
Sofia An, ILO-IPEC Country Project Coordinator

Alla Cercejevna, journalist Argumenti I Fakti
Eugenia Wojtkievicz, journalist
Shelter staff in Taldy Korgan
Shelter staff in Almaty
Victim of trafficking

Ukraine

Fred Larsson, Head of Mission

Supplement 7. Terms of Reference

EVALUATION OF ANTI-TRAFFICKING ACTIVITIES IN CENTRAL ASIA FINANCED BY SIDA

EUROPE/EECA

21 April, 2006

Max Inverin/Kerstin Gyllhammar

Ref. number:

2006-001211

EVALUATION PURPOSE

Sida has given support to the International Organisation for Migration's (IOM) anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia for several years. Before taking a new decision on support of any kind to anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia, Sida needs to know how efficient the past support has been, whether the Sida support shall continue in its present form or change direction, and which other options there might be.

The intended user of this evaluation is Sida's department for Europe.

INTERVENTION BACKGROUND

According to the UN Convention on international organized crimes, trafficking is recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person for the purpose of exploitation.

With the collapse of the Soviet Union and of the economy of many people combined with the opening of the borders, the problem of trafficking in persons has appeared. Trafficking flows are mostly under control of organized crime networks which operate in origin, transit and destination countries in recruiting, deceiving, transferring and exploiting people in degrading conditions.

Increasing economic differentiation within and between the countries of the region together with false perceptions about employment opportunities abroad, constitute push factors for Central Asian migrants to seek a better livelihood abroad. The perception is that there has been a consistent increase in the number of women, children and men trafficked from the Central Asian republics to the Middle East and Persian Gulf countries, Southeast and East Asia, Europe and Russia. Various estimates suggest that Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan and Uzbekistan are becoming a major source of trafficked women, besides serving as transit and destination countries. Similarly, as economic migrants in the poorest Central Asian countries seek employment opportunities in the informal labour market of Russia and wealthier neighbouring states, labour exploitation within the region itself becomes evident.

It is difficult to calculate the real number of trafficking cases due to the deep social misgivings that confuse trafficking with voluntary prostitution. With such stigmas, expected maltreatment from the side of authorities and lack of overall public understanding of trafficking as a human rights abuse, many trafficking cases may remain unknown even to victims' closest friends and relatives.

To combat trafficking in human beings is an issue of human rights and a priority for both the Swedish government and for Sida.

Since 2001 Sida has supported IOM's anti-trafficking activities in Kazakhstan with SEK 3,650,000. The two latest phases have been co-financing with USAID. *Since this evaluation shall focus on IOM activities, it shall be concentrated on the time period 2001 until present.*

The most recent USAID contribution was 1,482,436 USD to a program in Kazakhstan, Tajikistan, Uzbekistan as well as a regional cooperation. Co-funding was a prerequisite for the USAID contribution. Sida decided to continue its assistance to the Kazakh part of the programme.

In addition, Sida is financing a second phase to a project in the Kyrgyz Republic including i.e. establishment of a data base, assistance to victims, study tour to Ukraine and a regional conference for representatives from Russia, Ukraine, Moldova, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan. Sida's total contribution: 5 555 000 SEK.

Sida has also been financing an educational prevention project including NGO capacity building in victim advocacy and migrant awareness with IOM in Tajikistan. Sida's contribution was 1 900 000 SEK, and the project period was October 2003 – September 2005.

An overview of Sida's work against trafficking in human beings 1999-2004 was carried out 2005 by Stiftelsen Kvinnoforum and Kvinna till Kvinna.

A Regional Central Asia Conference "Combating Trafficking in Human Beings – Regional Response" jointly organized by the OSCE and the Republic of Kazakhstan will take place in Astana 18-19 of May 2006.

STAKEHOLDER INVOLVEMENT

The evaluators shall interview stakeholders from IOM's anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia, when gathering information. These should include trafficked persons (men and women), representatives of the judiciary systems in the countries, authorities, foreign consulates, NGO's, and IOM representatives involved in the Sida financed projects.

EVALUATION QUESTIONS

General questions

- Have the Sida financed interventions achieved its objectives or will it do so in the future?
- What are the overall effects of the Sida financed interventions, intended and unintended, long term and short term, positive and negative?
- Are the Sida financed interventions consistent with the needs and priorities of its target group and the policies of the partner country and Sida?
- Will the benefits produced by the Sida financed interventions be maintained after the cessation of external support?
- Can the costs of the Sida financed interventions be justified by the results?

specific questions

Trafficking

- Which are the best practices of anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia?
- Is regional support better than bilateral or the opposite when it comes to anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia? Why so?

IOM

- Does IOM's anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia have an influence on poverty reduction? Human rights? How?
- How are gender issues dealt with within IOM's anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia?
- Does IOM systematically work with lessons learned and best practices?
- Is support of IOM the best way to combat trafficking?

Other options

- Which other actors are involved in anti-trafficking? (Map other initiatives by i.e. USAID, OSCE, NGO's, UNODC, and others.)
- How is Sida's support related to the total support, in size and impact? Does Sida's support make any difference?
- Shall Sida continue to support anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia?
- Are there alternative ways for Sida of addressing anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia? (Provided continued Sida interventions are found relevant, a ToR for such activities shall be drafted.)
- Which are the possible counterparts regarding anti-trafficking activities in Central Asia?

RECOMMENDATIONS AND LESSONS

If the evaluation concludes that Sida shall be active in this area, the recommendations shall focus on what Sida can do within the present cooperation strategy and resources, considering also other possible initiatives besides support of IOM. The pros and cons with different interventions shall be presented. Due considerations shall also be taken to the Swedish government's guidelines on combating trafficking, as well as the Swedish strategy for cooperation with Central Asia.

Provided continued Sida interventions are found relevant, a ToR for such activities shall be drafted.

METHODOLOGY

The methodology is to be proposed by the evaluator and decided upon together with Sida. The chosen methods should be described, and justified in relation to possible alternatives, in the tender document.

WORK PLAN AND SCHEDULE

The evaluation shall include field visits to Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan, possibly by two evaluators. Information on which sites should be visited and how evaluator's time should be divided between field and reporting phases is to be discussed with the evaluator. Contacts are also to be taken with the Sida-financed Ukrainian project on anti-trafficking. The assignment is

to be concluded on August 15th, and then reported as stated below. 10 man weeks may be allocated altogether.

REPORTING

The evaluator shall adhere to the terminological conventions of the OECD/DAC Glossary on Evaluation and Results-Based Management as far as possible.

Evaluation activities performed shall be included in the reports. Any obstacles encountered shall be reported immediately to Sida as well as included in the reports.

Provided continued Sida interventions are found relevant, a ToR for such activities shall be drafted, in addition to the report.

The evaluation report shall use the report format presented in Annex A of this ToR. Moreover a completed Sida Evaluations Data Work Sheet should be presented along with the report.

The draft final report shall not exceed 50 pages (excluding annexes), be written in English, and submitted to Sida in two printed copies and one digital on September 15th 2006 at the latest. Sida shall comment on the report within three weeks.

The final report shall not exceed 50 pages (excluding annexes), be written in English and submitted to Sida in two printed copies and one digital on November 15th 2006 at the latest.

The evaluator's role in follow up seminars and workshops is to be later discussed.

Evaluation reports will be assessed against standard quality criteria for evaluation reporting.

EVALUATION TEAM

The evaluation team shall possess basic knowledge about Central Asia and development problems as well as possessing relevant competence for the assignment. Two members of the evaluation team shall have participated in at least two Sida financed evaluations during the past three years. The evaluators should be independent of the evaluated activities and have no stake in the outcome of the evaluation.