



FINAL EVALUATION

**Occupied Palestinian
territory**

Thematic window
Gender Equality & Women's Empowerment

Programme Title:

Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment
in the occupied Palestinian territory

Prologue

This final evaluation report has been coordinated by the MDG Achievement Fund joint programme in an effort to assess results at the completion point of the programme. As stipulated in the monitoring and evaluation strategy of the Fund, all 130 programmes, in 8 thematic windows, are required to commission and finance an independent final evaluation, in addition to the programme's mid-term evaluation.

Each final evaluation has been commissioned by the UN Resident Coordinator's Office (RCO) in the respective programme country. The MDG-F Secretariat has provided guidance and quality assurance to the country team in the evaluation process, including through the review of the TORs and the evaluation reports. All final evaluations are expected to be conducted in line with the OECD Development Assistant Committee (DAC) Evaluation Network "Quality Standards for Development Evaluation", and the United Nations Evaluation Group (UNEG) "Standards for Evaluation in the UN System".

Final evaluations are summative in nature and seek to measure to what extent the joint programme has fully implemented its activities, delivered outputs and attained outcomes. They also generate substantive evidence-based knowledge on each of the MDG-F thematic windows by identifying best practices and lessons learned to be carried forward to other development interventions and policy-making at local, national, and global levels.

We thank the UN Resident Coordinator and their respective coordination office, as well as the joint programme team for their efforts in undertaking this final evaluation.

MDG-F Secretariat

The analysis and recommendations of this evaluation are those of the evaluator and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Joint Programme or MDG-F Secretariat.



Final Evaluation

MDG-F Joint Programme on
Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment
In the occupied Palestinian territory

Final Report

Hanife Kurt and Rana Nashashibi

Prologue

This final evaluation exercise has been carried out by a team of independent, external experts, Hanife Kurt (international expert) and RanaNashashibi(national expert) for the MDG-F Joint Programme on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in the occupied Palestinian territory.

It took place at a historical time, at a time when soon after the end of the war on Gaza, the President of the Palestinian Authority and the chairman of the Palestinian Liberation Organization, Mr. Mahmood Abbas, initiated a bid in the UN General Assembly in order to upgrade the status of the occupied Palestinian territory (oPt) to that of a non-member observer status.

Since 29 November 2012, oPt is officially recognized as an independent non-member state by the UN.

However, the implication of this important political achievement is yet to be seen in light of Israel's continuous occupation of the newly recognized state.

Israel continues to control the borders, resources and security of the occupied state. As soon as the resolution was passed in the General Assembly and in an act of retaliation, Israel announced the expansion of the illegal settlements around Jerusalem and the approval of the E1 project, which will ultimately sever the West Bank into halves and rendering it non contiguous.

These measures as well as Israel's belligerent policies cause a serious threat on the results achieved by the Joint Program (JP) as well as the achievements reached under the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs).

Therefore, the future efforts of the international community have to deal with the illegal occupation policy of Israel directly, otherwise it will not only impact the achievements reached under MDG-F JP on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment(GEWE), but will lead to a further increase in poverty and gender based violence.

If Israel realizes its threats to target the Palestinian National Authority (PNA) by withholding tax and custom money, delegitimizing its role and undermining its capacities, then that will also endanger the achievements made on the level of building state institutions under this JP.

This new reality will have implications on the UN agencies and their operations in Palestine.

Thus, this final evaluation report is advocating that the groundbreaking accomplishments achieved through and under the JP are further continued by the UN in order to support the fulfillment of the MDGs in oPt and to support the state building process, to which the JP has significantly contributed to.

This final report has been revised based on the comments sent by the Evaluation Reference Group and the MDG-F Secretariat on the draft report. It has been written according to the UNEG standards for evaluations within UN systems.

Acknowledgement

The final evaluation team expresses herewith its deep gratitude to all partners at the national, sub-national and local level, who have contributed to the development of this report.

Without their active and fruitful participation in the discussions, their important input, openness and objective criticism this report would have not been completed. The people, the final evaluation team met, had remarkable contributions in support of the lawful struggle of the Palestinian people to live in freedom and dignity.

The team expresses its thanks also to the Evaluation Reference Group and the MDG-F Secretariat that has guided the evaluation team through the entire evaluation process.

Finally, the thanks are addressed to the Program Secretariat and in particular to the Program Manager of the JP, Hanna George Nakhleh, who gave the evaluation team his utmost support to guide this evaluation and to make it as smooth as possible considering time and security constraints.

Duisburg/ Jerusalem, 28 December 2012

<u>Table of Contents</u>	<u>Page</u>
A. Acronyms	6
B. List of Tables	8
I. <u>Executive Summary</u>	9
II. <u>Introduction</u>	14
1. Background of the MDG Achievement Fund and the JP on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in oPt	14
2. Situational analysis	15
3. The situation of the Palestinian women	17
4. Overall goal of the evaluation	18
a) Scope of the evaluation and specific objectives	18
b) Evaluation methodology	18
5. Limitations to the evaluation conducted	20
III. <u>Description and analysis of the development interventions Carried out</u>	21
1. Relevance of the JP	21
a) To MDG 3 and the thematic window 2 under MDG-F	21
b) To the MDGs	21
c) To a national results oriented framework	22
d) To national plans and priorities	22
e) To strategic plans of line ministries	23
f) To civil society organizations	24
g) To the design period	25
h) To the situation in Gaza	26
2. Efficiency of the JP	27
a) The main achievements on the level of JP's outputs	28
b) Management of the JP	30
c) Management structures and responsibilities	30
d) Implementation of the Mid Term Review Recommendations (Improvement Plan)	32
e) Management of the budget	33
f) Monitoring and reporting	33
3. Effectiveness of the JP	35
a) Outcome 1	37
b) Outcome 2	42
c) Outcome 3	44
IV. <u>JP's contribution to the MDG Fund objectives, MDGs, Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness and UN reform</u>	47
a) JP's contribution to the thematic window 2 GEWE At the local and national level	47

b) JP's contribution to the MDGs in oPt	49
c) JP's contribution to the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness	51
d) JP's contributing to the Delivering as One/ UN reform	52
V. <u>Levels of analysis: Evaluation criteria and questions</u>	54
• Design level	54
• Process level	54
• Results level	55
VI. <u>Conclusions and lessons learnt</u>	57
VII. <u>Best practices/ Success stories</u>	61
VIII. <u>Recommendations</u>	63
IX. <u>Annexes</u>	67
Annex I- ToR of the final evaluation consultancy	67
Annex II- Time schedule for the field visit	74
Annex III- List of ERG and PMC members	76
Annex IV- Key References	77

A. Acronyms

AA	Administrative Agent
AECID	Spanish Agency for International Development and Cooperation
AWP	Annual Work Plan
BZU	Birzeit University
CBO	Community Based Organizations
CEC	Central Elections Commission
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women
CSNSG	Cross- Sectoral National Strategy on Gender
CSO	Civil Society Organizations
DARP	Development Assistance and Reform Platform
DIM	Direct Implementation Modality
ERG	Evaluation Reference Group
FPCCIA	Federation of Palestinian Chamber of Commerce, Industry and Agriculture
GEWE	Gender Equality and Women´s Empowerment
GBV	Gender Based Violence
GRB	Gender Responsive Budgeting
HIS	Health Information System
ILO	International Labor Organization
JP	Joint Program
LACS	Local Aid Coordination Secretariat
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MIFTAH	The Palestinian Initiative for the Promotion of Global Dialogue and Democracy
MoEHE	Ministry of Education and Higher Education
MoH	Ministry of Health
MoI	Ministry of Interior
MoJ	Ministry of Justice
MoL	Ministry of Labor
MoLG	Ministry of Local Government
MoPAD	Ministry of Planning and Administrative Development
MoSA	Ministry of Social Affairs
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MoWA	Ministry of Women Affairs
MTDP	Mid Term Development Plan
NCWE	National Committee on Women`s Employment
NIM	National Implementation Modality
NGO	Non Governmental Organization
NSC	National Steering Committee
OECD	Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development
oPt	occupied Palestinian territory
PA	Palestinian Authority
PAPP	Programme of Assistance to the Palestinian People
PCBS	Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics
PCC	Palestinian Counseling Center

PCM	Project Cycle Management
PGA	Participatory Gender Audit
PGFTU	Palestinian General Federation of Trade Unions
PLC	Palestinian Legislative Council
PMC	Program Management Committee
PMT	Program Management Team
PNA	Palestinian National Authority
PNDP	Palestinian National Development Plan
PRPD	Palestinian Reform and Development Plan
PS	Program Secretariat
PARC	Palestinian Agricultural Relief Committee
PWRDC	Palestinian Women's Research and Development Center
SME	Small and Medium Size Enterprise
STD	Sexually Transmitted Diseases
SWAp	Sector Wide Approach
ToR	Terms of Reference
ToT	Training of Trainers
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education Training
UCASC	Union of Cooperative Associations for Saving and Credit
UN	United Nations
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNDG	United Nations Development Group
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Education, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
UNRWA	United Nations Relief and Work Agency
UN Women	United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women
VAW	Violence against Women
WATC	Women Affairs Technical Committee
WCLAC	Women Center for Legal Aid and Counseling
WB	West Bank

B. List of Tables

Table 1	Excerpt from the Mid Term Evaluation Report from January 2011, JP's contribution to the MDGs
Table 2	Budget disbursement rate per agency, December 2012
Table 3	Direct beneficiaries the JP has targeted, December 2012
Table 4	Indirect beneficiaries the JP has targeted, December 2012
Table 5	JP's contribution to the MDGs in oPt
Table 6	JP's contribution to the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness
Table 7	JP's contribution to the "Delivering as one" approach/ UN reform

I. Executive Summary

The MDG-F Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment (GEWE) Programme in the occupied Palestinian territory (oPt) has been implemented by six United Nations (UN) agencies in an effort to address gender based violence (GBV), violence against women (VAW), political participation of women and equal economic rights in a joint effort by strengthening the national Gender Machinery in oPt for the very first time.

Although the time period for writing the proposal of the joint program was short and did not allow for proper consultations with all stakeholders equally, the inception phase was, nevertheless, longer and allowed for more participation and involvement by social, political and economic actors from the West Bank and Gaza, thus making the JP integrative and holistic in its nature.

Activities were implemented through a two-tier process by linking research with policy action to improve service provision of the Palestinian Authority, its institutions and civil society organizations (CSOs), and by developing sustainable institutional capacities and encouraging innovative projects.

Thus, the JP has significantly contributed to the goals of the thematic window 2 on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment of the MDG Achievement Fund, which has been funding the JP with a total amount of 9.000.000 USD.

Despite the challenges to set up an organizational structure based on the specifications of the MDG-F Implementation Guidelines, which would have enabled the JP to be implemented more smoothly, the JP has nevertheless achieved measurable progress in addressing and contributing to the achievement of the MDGs at the national level,

- Through the development and endorsement of the *Violence Against Women (VAW) Strategy*, which was enacted in January 2011 by the Ministers Cabinet,
- The *implementation of the VAW Strategy through the line ministries* by developing action plans,
- In support of the above, the *draft of the Cross- Sectoral National Strategy on Gender (CSNSG) 2011-2013*, the very first in its kind advocating to mainstream gender across all sectors in oPt,
- The development of the *Media and Advocacy Strategy* on GEWE issues for the very first time in oPt,
- The *institutionalization of the national Gender Machinery towards the end of the JP by means of establishing a Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E) Unit within the Ministry of Women Affairs (MoWA)*, being in charge of developing and monitoring national gender indicators in close cooperation with the Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics (PCBS) and the Development Assistance and Reform Platform (DARP) of the Ministry of Planning and Administrative

Development(MoPAD),whereby gender mainstreaming can be initiated through a three tier process: by linking the national level with that of the sub-national and local (tawassol) and vice versa,

- The *publication of the most gender sensitive “violence survey”*, the PCBS has ever published through capacity development interventions by the JP, hence enabling policy-makers to address violence cases in a much more targeted and comprehensive way,
- The *development of guidelines for Family Protection Units of the Police*, the curricula to eliminate VAW in schools and the one for lawyers, judges and prosecutors on how to deal with cases of VAW, which were institutionalized within the relevant departments,
- The establishment of the *National Committee on Women’s Employment (NCWE)*as an advisory body to the Minister of Labor.The NCWE was endorsed by the Cabinet of Ministers and is comprising of theMinistry of Labor (MoL), Ministry of Women’s Affairs (MoWA), Palestinian General Federation of Trade Unions (PGFTU), Development Center of Birzeit University and the Center for Democracy and Women’s Rights. It’s mandate is to advocate for gender sensitive policies, legislations, capacity building interventions, social safety net for women workers and a healthy work environment, and
- *The JP allowed UN agencies to develop more holistic interventions in the field of GBV, VAW and GEWE. It also increased the organizations’ technical expertise to mainstream gender within their programmatic areas.* UNRWA, for instance, adopted GEWE, GBV and VAW within its programmatic areas for the very first time in oPt, rightly so, as violence cases are more prevalent in the refugee camps, one finding the latest violence survey came up with.

The outreach of the JP went beyond the contribution to MDG 1 and MDG 3; in fact it contributed to 6 out of 8 MDGs at the micro, mesoand macro level, thus making the JP a success story.

The contribution of the JP via MoPAD to support the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness is rated as medium, although oPt has been involved in the Paris Declaration Monitoring Survey for the very first time only two years ago. This is an average result.

The contribution of the JP to the Delivering as One approach/ UN reform, however, is rather low.

In order to take up the success stories and replicatethem inpossible/ future JP interventions, the following recommendations are proposed in order to ensure sustainability of the JP accomplishments.

1. To conduct an in depth capacity development needs assessment of the capacities of the main implementing ministries at the design phase, in order to

better address the structural / systematic weaknesses that exist within the PA institutions so as to ensure sustainability and impact. UNDP's and UN Women's wide repository of knowledge products on issues such as capacity development within public institutions/ for gender mainstreaming should be continuously utilized for this purpose as well as ILO's Participatory Gender Audit Strategy.

2. The design of the programme should be more results based. The Results Based Management (RBM) tool of the UN should be more adhered to. Results and outputs should be formulated to be as accurate as possible. The activities should then be designed to lead to the desired results, outputs and outcomes.
3. The monitoring should exceed the monitoring of activities into monitoring and evaluating the achievements of outputs. Monitoring reports should elaborate on the problems and challenges faced by the implementers to include main discussion points and suggested solutions.
4. A proper review of the ToRs of the NSC, PMC, PS and PMT should be done at the inception phase. The review should examine whether the proposed governance structure is a) applicable to the current context and b) by considering local needs and existing capacities.
5. The UN agencies financial systems should be adjusted to produce disaggregated financial data on the West Bank and Gaza by showing the amounts disbursed in Gaza and the West Bank separately, so that financial imbalances favoring West Bank over Gaza are not occurring.
6. A technical review of the budget- as recommended in the midterm evaluation- remains also valid in the final evaluation. It should be done prior to the approval of the application and include an analysis of the annual allocations. Further, it is recommended that the review should also appraise the accuracy of the costs. The evaluation specifically recommends the use of the Activity-Based Costing (ABC) method in preparing budgets, because this method is consistent with the concepts of RBM. The evaluation is also not recommending the use of the commitment rate method for fund releases in JP that may be supported by the MDG-F in the future.
7. The Media and Advocacy Strategy should be developed at the outset of program implementation (design phase). It should specify the type of messages, advocacy campaigns and strategies to be used in order for the main messages to be mainstreamed. The current Strategy could be amended accordingly and should target more men, youth male, and children and marginalized groups.
8. It is recommended that in future projects the establishment of an M&E to monitor gender equity goals at the national, sub-national and local level should be established at the onset of the program, in order to centralize data on gender based violence, political participation and economic empowerment as

well as other women related issues. The unit should also be equipped to provide support and guidance to other ministries and agencies so that all sectoral strategies are gender mainstreamed and monitored based on harmonized national gender indicators.

9. Strengthening of and aligning the referral system created by MoH/ MoSA and Family Protection Unit of Police (MoI) with that of UNRWA.

Even though UNRWA is operating under a different legal environment to which the one of the national institutions do not apply, the further institutionalization of the referral system within UNRWA is pivotal to address the highest amount of GBV and any other type of violence cases in the future. Alliances should be build with the EU funded projects on the establishment of a national referral system.

10. Gaza

The no contact policy with the existing government and public institutions in Gaza should be revised, as the humanitarian as well as the developmental needs of Gaza is severe and pressing. To ensure sustainability and impact of future programs in Gaza, a focus and emphasis on public institutional building is essential.

Proposed future JP interventions to accelerate the attainment of the MDGs in oPt

MDG 1	ILO and UNRWA should continue with their income generation projects (TVET, SME, cooperatives and women engineers placement projects) in the next phase, by putting more emphasize on the integration of women and marginalized groups (youth criminals, youth that are trafficking etc.) into the local labor market and measuring the impact of such interventions by developing local indicators with regard to improvement of income, decline of poverty rate, increase of GDP in oPt, social coherence (differentiation into Gaza and WB) through JP intervention. These indicators could be developed with MoLG, MoSA, MoEHE and MoL through a bottom up approach and channeled through the relevant sectoral strategies (Employment, Social Protection, Agriculture and Economic Development). Emphasize should also be given to standardization and equalization of certification received by youth criminals with that of students certified by the MoEHE. UN agencies should facilitate this process by enabling MoSA, MoEHE and MoL to develop a policy paper to take action in this regard.
MDG 2	UNFPA and UNRWA should work closely with MoEHE and MoSA to contribute to the further development of school curriculum, training of teachers etc. by integrating awareness raising and prevention of GBV, VAW and other types of violence into school curriculum. PCC, MaDAD and other CSO's working within the education sector and in refugee camps should be further involved in the actual implementation by providing continuous support in parents-children counseling, counseling of teachers dealing with violence cases and prevention of VAW. The consultation of the CSO's for the further development of the Education and Social Protection Strategy is pivotal, from which the M&E Unit of MoWA will benefit too.
MDG 3	As this goal is very holistic and cross cutting, <u>each UN agency should and could contribute to this</u> as done under the current JP. However, the

	<p>a) Establishment of a full fledged and standardized national referral system (MoSA, MoH, UNWomen, UNFPA),</p> <p>b) Improvement of the legal standing of the Sharia law (personal status law, setting up Gender Units in the court administration, education of female lawyers and judges by interventions of UNDP, UNWomen, BZU, MoJ),</p> <p>c) Design of an advocacy campaign targeting more youth male, marginalized groups at the local level (UNFPA, UNRWA and UNESCO)</p> <p>d) The fulfillment of NCWE's role (ILO, UNDP, MoL),</p> <p>e) The further support of the Family Protection Units of the Police (UNWomen, UNFPA, UNDP, MoI, MoJ) and</p> <p>f) The further revision of laws (election, labor, women representation by ILO, UNWomen, UNDP, MoL, MoJ, MoLG)</p> <p>are major interventions that should be addressed in future joint projects that will support the attainment of MDG 3.</p>
MDG 4	The national indicators developed under this goal are very vague, although the causes for infant mortality are plausible. Therefore, this MDG goal should be further elaborated at the national level under the leadership of UNFPA, WHO and UNICEF.
MDG 5	UNFPA, MoH and MoSA should improve the HIS system of the MoH by developing more appropriate indicators on GBV and various types of violence as part of a standardized national referral system. UNRWA should be involved in this intervention by conducting awareness raising sessions on early dangers of early marriage and sexual education/ safe sex consulting with PCC and SAWA.
MDG 6	UNFPA and UNRWA should address this goal; even if HIV/AIDS is currently not a serious threat in oPt, by providing awareness raising sessions on sexual education/ safe sex in close alignment with the activities under MDG 5.
MDG 7	All UN agencies can contribute to the achievement of this goal by involving ministries such as MoH, Ministry of Agriculture, MoWA, Water Authority and CSO's to integrate environmental indicators into the programmatic areas. As UNRWA covers currently 19 refugee camps in the WB and 8 camps in Gaza, they could initiate and support more projects in this regard, as shown in the case of the refugee camp in Jenin.
MDG 8	UNWomen , MoWA, PCBS, UNDP and MoPAD should contribute to this by upgrading the M&E Unit within MoWA, review and modification of all sectoral strategies (2011-2013) from a gender perspective and the further support of the DARP system to improve oPt's contribution to the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness Principles and the UN reform process in the wider sense.

II. Introduction

This is the final evaluation report for the MDG-F Joint Programme (JP) on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment (GEWE) in the occupied Palestinian territory that began officially in February 2009 and is going to be accomplished on the 31 of December 2012.

The JP was implemented by six United Nations agencies, namely United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women (UN Women), United Nations Development Program/Programme of Assistance to the Palestinian People (UNDP/PAPP), International Labor Organization (ILO), United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA) and United Nations Relief and Work Agency (UNRWA) in close cooperation with Palestinian Authority (PA) ministries, led by the Ministry of Women's Affairs (MoWA).

The Government of Spain through the MDG-F Achievement Fund funded the JP. Joint programs or "Delivering as one" aim at supporting the UN reform process. The UN organizations and national partners, through the joint program, work together to prepare, implement, monitor and evaluate the activities aimed at effectively and efficiently achieving the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) at the country level.

The ultimate goal of this report is to assess the extent to which the objectives and the expected results as stated in the Terms of Reference (ToR) of the final evaluation consultancy have been met.

It captures the main findings, conclusions, lessons learnt and recommendations for possible future interventions under the JP modality.

1. Background of the MDG Achievement Fund and the JP on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in oPt

In December 2006, UNDP and the Government of Spain signed a major €528 million partnership agreement with the aim of contributing to progress on the MDGs and other development goals through the United Nations System. The Spanish MDG Achievement Fund (MDG-F) supports countries in their progress towards the MDGs by funding innovative programs that have a positive impact on populations directly served while simultaneously boasting the potential for replication within other contexts.

The MDG-F operates through the United Nations Country Teams (UNCT) by promoting increased coherence and effectiveness in development interventions through collaboration among UN agencies. The collaboration mechanism serves to create further synergy and achieve a greater impact through joint programs.

The MDG-F uses this JP mode of intervention accordingly and has approved 130 JPs within 50 countries so far.

In order to achieve these goals, the MDG-F has created eight thematic windows that contribute in various ways towards progress on the MDGs.

The JP on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment (GEWE) in the occupied Palestinian territory (oPt) aimed to promote Palestinian women's social, economic and political empowerment through the following three outcomes:

- Reducing gender-based violence and all forms of violence against women and the girls,
- Increasing the representation of women and women's issues in decision-making bodies; and
- Advancing equal opportunities for women's economic participation.

To achieve its three outcomes, the programme adopted two key strategies:

- Provide a holistic approach to problem-solving, by linking research with policy action and service provision by the PA, its institutions and civil society organizations (CSOs); and
- Complement and strengthen the PA's service provision capacities.

The first strategy was to provide support to comprehensive research in areas where information was lacking. The results of the research were used to inform a number of subsequent activities: the building of a knowledge-based system, the establishment of baselines from which women's political, social and economic participation can be regularly monitored by both the PA and other stakeholders; training and other forms of technical support to build gender-awareness among decision-makers and other constituents; and development of policy papers, action plans and other documents to ensure gender-sensitive services are provided.

The second strategy was aimed to strengthen service provision capacity by supporting women's shelters, hotlines and counseling services, as well as by building know-how in economic empowerment projects designed to aid the rehabilitation of women survivors of violence and their families, such as upgrading vocational training institutions, providing grants for women cooperatives and training micro, small and medium size enterprises (SME's).

To ensure maximum national ownership and capacity development of national institutions, UN agencies, whenever possible, made sure that national experts were recruited. In case international experts were hired, UN agencies ensured that they were embedded within the national institutions, ministries and NGO's and made accountable to them.

2. Situational analysis

The illegal Israeli occupation of more than four decades has affected all aspects of Palestinian life. It has overshadowed any attempt at real development, as it has maintained control of the land, people and economic resources.

In 1994 and in the aftermath of signing the Oslo Accords, the PA came to power and a partial transfer of West Bank and Gaza Strip territory was entrusted to the PA to administer. The Israeli occupation maintained control over large areas of the land in the Gaza Strip and the West Bank, borders, major roads, people's access between the Gaza Strip and the West Bank and resources, such as water. There was no real sovereignty over the land or people, no political control, and the political environment

did not allow for independent Palestinian economic growth or development. Consequently, oPt remained heavily dependent on Israel, especially in the economic context.

Since 2000, Israeli occupation measures in the West Bank and the Gaza Strip have deepened. Movement restrictions have intensified considerably with border closures, roadblocks, and checkpoints (over 700 checkpoints are active within the West Bank and the Gaza Strip). These measures severely limited and still limit the movement of Palestinian goods and labor. Health, education and general living conditions have also deteriorated sharply. The Annexation Wall, with its ghettoization of areas and people and confiscation of land, separated many Palestinians from their sources of livelihood and social support, thereby further increasing levels of deterioration in living conditions. The inability of the Palestinian economy to support the livelihood of its people maximized dependency on Israel and international aid, and further compromised the ability of the PA and local civil society to set an independent national agenda fully aligned with national needs and void of external interference.

In 2006, the Palestinian Islamic movement (Hamas) won overwhelmingly the general elections in the oPt and formed the government. This led to a western embargo on international assistance the same year against the newly formed Palestinian government and all of its institutions. This block contributed to the reversal of progress that had been made during the reformation of the PNA¹.

The political situation further deteriorated in 2007, with Hamas overthrowing the PA in Gaza and taking full control over the Strip. This led to the formation of two governing bodies - one led by the Palestinian Authority in Ramallah and the other led by Hamas in the Gaza Strip. Unemployment more than doubled between 1999 and 2006, reaching almost 35% in Gaza and nearly 20% in the West Bank. Approximately two-thirds of Gazans were living in deep poverty.

In 2008, the situation in Gaza deteriorated when the Israeli occupation waged a 22-day offensive attack on the Strip. Over the course of this assault, Israel killed more than 1,434 Palestinians, and destroyed more than 22,000 buildings, displacing thousands of families as a result. The war and its aftermath resulted in a major humanitarian crisis.

Thereafter, while the financial assistance embargo of 2006 was partially lifted from the PA and its institutions in the West Bank, it remained enforced completely on the Gaza Strip. UN agencies within the Gaza Strip were subsequently forced to adopt a no-contact policy with the de-facto government. This significantly affected the implementation of the JP in the Gaza strip, where the main partners (public institutions) could no longer be directly involved. Alternatively, civil society institutions implemented the program. Due to the no-contact policy of the UN, it remains unclear to what extent the government in Gaza is committed to *gender equality and women empowerment*. Sustainability of the project's implementation thus remains dubious.

¹ Since the Second Intifada the Palestinian economy declined and has left per capita GDP at \$1,129 in 2006. This is about a third less than its level of \$1,612 in 1999. The emerging recovery in 2003-2005 was again reversed in 2006 as a result of the fiscal crisis following the Palestinian Legislative Council (PLC) elections.

3. The situation of the Palestinian women

Palestinian women make up almost 49% of the total population. Occupation affects all aspect of Palestinian women's life. Women in oPt are subject to all kinds of Israeli occupation oppressive measures. Whether in a direct manner as thousands of women were killed, maimed, incarcerated and whether displaced after their home was demolished.

In addition to oppression from occupation, Palestinian women and girls are subject to the oppression of the patriarchal system. Female participation in the different political decision-making bodies is very low, making up just 13% of the Palestinian Legislative Council (PLC) membership and 17% of the membership in the local councils².

Even more alarming, participation in the higher executive-levels of government does not exceed 5% (ambassadors and director generals)³.

Economic experience in the West Bank and Gaza Strip has been characterized by a number of paradoxical relationships. Whilst there have been significant improvements in female educational qualifications at all levels, these gains have not translated themselves into higher labor force participation⁴. The rate of female participation in the labor market in the West Bank and Gaza at the design phase stood at 13.4% in 2006, one of the lowest in the world. This figure is low even by the regions' standards, where the average rate for Arab countries during the same year was 27%. Jordan for example, had a female participation rate of 23%, Lebanon 29%, and Egypt 30%. The latest 2012 figures by Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics (PCBS) of 16.6% show an improvement in the situation of women in the labor market.

Violence against women constitutes a major problem in Palestine. A household survey, conducted in 2007 and again in 2011, showed that 26.5% of married women surveyed reported physical abuse from their husbands, while more than 65% report psychological abuse. Women continue to be victims of so-called "honor killings" too, with over 50 murders taking place in the last five years, 25 of which have occurred since 2010.⁴ Violence and abuse is intended to degrade and debilitate the victim and lead to her disempowerment. Thus, any attempt to generate real empowerment has to first work on combating violence. In order to address this problem, the women's movement in Palestine has adopted a bilateral strategy, committed to lobbying and advocating decision-makers to adopt laws and develop national plans that are conducive to women's equality and empowerment, while simultaneously working on the grassroots level in education and awareness-raising.

² A quota of 20% for women was introduced first in 2004 for local council elections and again for 2006 in PLC elections.

³ PCBS, Policy paper on "Women in public life" funded by the MDG-F GEWE, 2011, oPt

⁴ According to a report published by the Palestinian Independent Commission for Human Rights, 2012/08/03, http://www.upi.com/Top_news/World-News/2012/08/03/Protesters-ask-crackdown-on-honor-killings/UPI-62991343996034/

4. Overall goal of the evaluation

There are two overall goals of the evaluation, as stipulated in the ToR (Annex 1).

1. Measure the extent to which the joint programme has fully implemented its activities, delivered outputs and attained outcomes, specifically measuring development results.

2. Generate substantive evidence based knowledge on GEWE, one of the MDG-F thematic windows, by identifying the best practices and lessons learned that could be useful to other development interventions at the national (scale up) and international levels (replicability).

a) Scope of the evaluation and specific objectives

The specific objectives of the final evaluation were as follows:

1. Measure the extent to which the joint programme has contributed to resolving the needs and problems identified in the design phase.
2. Measure the joint programme's degree of implementation, efficiency and quality delivered on outputs and outcomes against what was originally planned or subsequently officially revised.
3. Measure the extent to which the joint programme has attained development results for the targeted population, beneficiaries, and participants, whether individuals, communities or institutions, etc.
4. Measure the joint programmes contribution to the objectives set in the respective specific thematic window as well as the overall MDG fund objectives at local and national levels (MDGs, Paris Declaration and Accra Principles and UN reform).
5. Identify and document substantive lessons learned and good practices on the specific topics of the thematic window, MDGs, Paris Declaration, Accra Principles and UN reform, with the aim to support the sustainability of the joint programme or some of its components.

In this regard, the final evaluation analyzed the status of the programme regarding its design, implementation and impact and established a set of recommendations based on the relevance, ownership, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability of the programme.

b) Evaluation methodology

Literature review

All literature - including the original proposed Joint Programme Document, national plans, ministerial plans and strategies, the MDG-F Implementation Guidelines, the MDG-F Monitoring and Evaluation Plan, the amended work plans of the Joint Programme, the Media and Advocacy Strategy, the monitoring and evaluation plans and reports, the exit and sustainability strategy, the Mid-Term Evaluation Report, and other documents that may provide information necessary to formulate opinions - was reviewed.

Inception report

The inception report was prepared based on the desk review as the guiding document for the conduct of the final evaluation. This report was submitted to the Evaluation Reference Group (ERG) for comments and feedback and was adjusted accordingly.

Fieldwork

Prior to field visits and in order to prepare the inception report, two kick-off questionnaires were sent to the implementing agencies and beneficiaries. The questionnaires were designed to assess the level of information needed in order to refine the methodology to be implemented during the field mission.

The field mission consisted of two parts. In the first part, the national evaluator went to Gaza and interviewed representatives of UNRWA, UNFPA, UN Women and UNDP involved in the programme. Additionally, she visited a number of UNRWA-run programs and met with CSO and CBO representatives and beneficiaries, partners of the different UN agencies.

The second portion of the field mission took place in the West Bank and was attended by both evaluators. The mission included meetings with key stakeholders and implementing partners as well as visits to project sites and activities.

The program was organized and suggested by the Evaluation Reference Group (ERG).

Additionally, the evaluators requested extra meetings during their mission. (Annex 2 – Mission’s Final Itinerary).

Meetings in the form of interviews, semi structured interviews and focus groups were held with:

- National Steering Committee (NSC, comprised of UNSCO, the Ministry of Planning and Administrative Development, MoPAD and the Spanish Agency for International Development and Cooperation, AECID)
- The Programme Management Committee (PMC) in its function as the Evaluation Reference Group (ERG)
- The Programme Secretariat (PS)
- The Ministry of Women Affairs (MoWA, as the lead agency) and the implementing ministries such as Ministry of Labor (MoL), Ministry of Social Affairs (MoSA), Ministry of Health (MoH) and the Family Protection Unit of the Police Department of the Ministry of Interior (Mol)
- Institute of Law at the Birzeit University
- Partner NGOs / CBOs in Gaza and West Bank
- Direct beneficiaries (women cooperatives, women committees, local council members, directorate of local government, income generating projects and Sharia court judges and lawyers).

A set of guiding questions was designed to frame the interviews. The questions aimed to assess the extent to which the work had been done and capture success stories and lessons learned.

Data Analysis

The data gathered through the desk review, questions asked during meetings and interviews, as well as observations made during field visits were analyzed in order to

answer the main evaluation criteria as stated in the ToR - namely, relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability and replicability.

The main findings under each of the above criteria were then formulated, presented, and discussed with the ERG; their feedback and comments were sought to refine the main findings. Following the meeting, additional questions were formulated on specific aspects of the programme and, as necessary, these questions were sent back to relevant organizations/implementation institutions via email or phone calls for further clarification.

5. Limitations to the evaluation conducted

There were a number of limitations to this final evaluation relative to the ToR's of the final evaluation originally set up by the PMC.

- Due to the limited time available for the whole evaluation - a total of six weeks - it was neither possible to meet with all stakeholders, nor was it feasible to visit other pilot sites where the JP operated. However, interventions in the north, center and southern parts of oPt as well as Gaza was visited.
- Access to important JP documents, such as the final narrative and financial reports were not available during the evaluation period. These reports will only be ready one month after the submission of the evaluation report. Lack of a clear and comprehensive monitoring and evaluation plan made it more difficult to reach concrete and conclusive findings. However, through cross-reference and triangulation, the evaluators are confident of the validity of their data.
- One of the major evaluation problems was the lack of baseline data collected before the programme was implemented. This raised difficulties when estimations of the various impacts of the project were required in the evaluation. Best estimates therefore needed to be ascertained by the evaluator by recording the views of stakeholders, including beneficiaries who are the recipients of the programme outcomes.
- The security situation in Gaza, worsened by Israel's military offensive that began on 15th November and lasted for several weeks, prevented the evaluators from going to the field mission in Gaza that was scheduled to take place from the 18 – 21 of November 2012. Hence, the findings on Gaza were formulated based on the data collected in the first visit and through telephone interviews.

III. Description and analysis of the development interventions carried out

1. Relevance of the JP

a) To MDG 3 and the thematic window 2 under the MDG-F

This section assesses the extent to which the objectives of the JP met the national development priorities of oPt, the global MDG's (in particular MDG 3) and the ones of the thematic window 2 on gender equality and women's empowerment within the MDG Achievement Fund prior to the design phase.

In this respect, the evaluation draws on the JP documents and interviews conducted with the stakeholders during the field visit phase.

The JP came as a response to a call made by the Spanish Government in 2007 to fund the thematic window 2 on Gender Equality and Women Empowerment (GEWE) within the MDG Achievement Fund. The call identified seven areas of priority set by the task force⁵, which built on the ToR's of thematic window 2 on GEWE. The three outcomes set in the program document were derived from those priorities:

1. Responses to gender-based violence through improved policies, frameworks, protection systems, and legal enforcement and health protection and prevention services.
2. Increased representation of women and women's issues in decision-making bodies.
3. Enhanced opportunities for women's equal economic participation.

As such, the JP was very relevant to address GEWE issues in oPt according to the ToR of the thematic window 2 under the MDG Achievement Fund.

b) To the MDGs

During the JP implementation phase a Mid-Term Evaluation Report was conducted which scrutinized the relevance of the JP to other MDGs as well. The Report found out that the JP contributed also to MDG-1 "Eradication of extreme poverty and hunger", and that the outcomes two and three of the JP are related to two targets and four indicators under these goals. (Table 1)

-
- ⁵Eliminating gender inequalities in primary and secondary education by the earliest possible date and at all educational levels by 2015;
 - Guaranteeing the free and equal right of women to own and inherit property, and ensuring secure tenure of property and housing by women;
 - Ensuring access to reproductive health services;
 - Promoting women's equal access to labor markets, sustainable employment and adequate labor protection;
 - Ensuring women's equal access to productive assets and resources, including land, credit, and technology;
 - Eliminating all forms of discrimination and violence against women and the girls, including ending impunity and ensuring the protection of civilians - in particular, women and the girls during and after armed conflicts, in accordance with the obligations of states under international humanitarian law and international human rights law;
 - Promoting increased representation of women in government decision-making bodies, including through their equal opportunity to participate fully in the political process.

Selected MDG targets	Related Program outcomes
Target 1.B: Achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all, including women and young people. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Employment to population ratio • Proportion of own account and contributing family works in total employment 	Outcome 3 Outcome 3
Target 3.A: Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education, preferably by 2005, and all levels of education no later than 2015. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector. • Proportion of seats held by women in national parliament. 	Outcome 3 Outcome 2

Table 1, Excerpt from the Mid Term Evaluation Report from January 2011

The evaluation team verifies this finding. Hence, during the JP implementation, the JP reached out to the global as well as national MDG 1 goal as well.

c) To a national results oriented framework

From the time at which the proposal was drafted to the present day, there was no United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF)⁶.

The presence of such a framework would have facilitated the process of formulating UN priorities and ensured its adherence and response to national development needs and priorities. The MoPAD representative⁷ as well as the heads of UN agencies reiterated the importance of producing a UNDAF as soon as possible so that the UN could better address oPt's development needs, especially in implementing joint programs. The Palestinian Authority (PA) has been urging the UN to prepare a UNDAF since 2007, which however was not prepared. The first draft of the UNDAF was published only in November 2012, which however has not been endorsed yet.

d) To national plans and priorities

The evaluation team was able to confirm alignment between the JP, the Mid-Term Development Plan (MTDP 2005 – 2007)⁸, and the consecutive plan, Palestinian Reform and Development Plan (PRPD 2008-2011)⁹.

⁶UNDAF is a strategic document between a government and the UNCT that describes the collective actions and strategies of UN to the achievement of national development goals. The UNDAF includes outcomes, activities and UN agency responsibilities that are agreed by the respective government. UNDAF's typically run for three years and include reviews at different points.

⁷Dr. Cairo Arafat, Director General of International Aid and Cooperation, MoPAD

⁸ The Palestinian National Authority identifies two overarching goals of its Medium Term Development Plan of 2005- 2007: To address poverty in a sustainable way, by providing a framework to shift PNA and donor assistance from emergency relief to job creation, recovery and social and economic MDG-F Joint Programme on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in the occupied Palestinian territory (oPt)

It is clear that the JP came to build on government plans and policies that were already in place. In both plans there was a stress on gender equality as a basic principle in government policy; they each encouraged all attempts on the policy and program level to attain this goal. Moreover, both plans viewed political participation and economic empowerment of women as a major step toward reaching gender equality.

The 2005-2007 MTDP recognized the role of women in furthering development on the socio-economic and political levels, and encouraged the development of programs aimed at vocational training and job creation for women.

The PRPD reiterated the governmental commitment to democratic governance, rule of law and protection of the equal rights of all citizens. The plan promoted programs aimed at equality between men and women and those that provide social protection. The plan also stressed the importance of empowering public institutions, as the PNA's attempts to rehabilitate them were impeded due to enormous challenges it was facing at the time¹⁰.

Though there is no clear reference in the national plans to programs aimed at combating violence against women, the Palestinian Cabinet endorsed the formation of a National Committee to Combat Violence Against Women in 2008 and created gender units in the various ministries.

e) To strategic plans of line ministries

The JP was also aligned with the strategic and action plans of the leading ministry, MoWA and the implementing ministry MoL.

In fact, many of the activities undertaken in the JP were already ongoing in those ministries.

Leadership in implementation of the JP was divided among MoWA, MoLG and MoL consecutively, as they fall into their mandates and fit with their strategic objectives.

Outcome 1 of the JP was entrusted to MoWA, as it was directly linked to its strategic plan, in spite of the fact that the ministry did not have sufficient technical capacities. The first outcome of the JP - combating violence against women - responds directly to the fifth axis of the priorities in MoWA 's strategic plan of 2005-2007.

This was done in an effort to empower MoWA and to increase its capacities to lead on women's issues. The design of the activities stressed the creation of relevant data and baseline to inform policies and amend laws on gender-based violence.

development, particularly focusing to engage women in this process and to improve the effectiveness of PNA governance by building institutional capacity and accelerating reform. The MTDP will also enhance PNA accountability by providing clear and gender-sensitive development objectives, which are monitored throughout the period of implementation.

⁹ The Palestinian National Policy Agenda framework includes the following high level objectives that are of particular relevance to ministries and agencies in the social sector; social coherence, social protection.

¹⁰ The PRPD notes that the PA was forced to add more than 35,000 employees to the public sector without proper capacity of the PA to absorb and capacitate them. This step was taken in order to deal with the high level of unemployment (20% in WB and 35% in the Gaza Strip).

However, efforts were not concerted to build the institutional capacities of MoWA, emphasizing the building of systems and structures, such as the Monitoring and Evaluation Unit and Human Resources Department.

Outcome 2, regarding women's political involvement, was chiefly relevant to MoWA's strategic plan, specifically its objective to increase women's participation in political decision-making. That outcome was also relevant to the objectives of the MoLG, which was preparing for local council elections. The objective of the MoLG was to ensure that the 20% quota for female representation in local councils was met and that the participation exceeds the quota. Baseline data in PCBS on female participation on different political levels indicates that the participation in the PLC is 13% while in local councils the rate does not exceed 17%. This rate is very low compared to the 20% representation benchmark set in the law. The delay in general elections (PLC, presidential, and partially the local councils) does not allow for conclusive evidence of change, whether positive or negative.

Outcome 3, women's economic empowerment, is in line with the strategic objectives of the MoL, as stated in its 2004 plan – namely, improving the capacities of the labor force, building the capacities of the MoL, improving women and youth employment, improving the milieu for cooperatives, improving working conditions and dialogue with the Tripartite Committee.

It also complements one of the strategic priorities of the MoL included in the Palestinian National Policy Agenda (2008-2010) - specifically, the building of the capacities of public institutions to deliver on job creation and women's empowerment. As women's employment and participation in economic life is a crosscutting issue, it was imperative to form a National Committee for Women's Employment (NCWE). The committee includes representatives from ministries, trade unions and CSO's, and was formally endorsed by the Cabinet of Ministers in 2012. Though there have been draft amendments to the relevant laws (including labor law and cooperatives law), they have not been passed due to the inactive role of the PLC.

The JP came to endorse and strengthen these efforts and give it a stronger gender perspective. The same can also be said in regard to the mainstreaming of gender issues in the work of the different ministries. The placement of gender units in the different ministries was ongoing, but the evaluation showed that this process was supported and strengthened by the JP, especially in the line ministries directly involved in the program (MoL, MoLG and the MoJ).

f) To civil society organizations¹¹

There is strong evidence pointing to the relevance of the JP to the work of the CSO's involved in the implementation of the program. Many of the CSO's involved were partners of the UN agencies and the line ministries. The involvement of CSO's is

¹¹Historically the civil society organizations (CSO's) played a very important role in the life of the Palestinian people. Taking into consideration that they existed and were active in service delivery, and advocacy before the PA and its institutions were in place. The CSO's continues to provide services in areas not covered by the public sector, but most importantly it acts as a buffer between the citizen and government and advocates for equal rights and access to resources among all people.

imperative to the sustainability of the program, as they are more resilient to the fluctuation in the political situation - as evidenced within the Gaza Strip - and in implementing the media and advocacy components of the program. Many of the CSO's, especially women's organizations, confirmed that the JP built on their plans and responded to national priorities through questionnaire responses and interviews.

g) To the design period

The process of drafting the JP document started with the submission of a concept note. Upon approval of the concept note, a consultant was hired to complete the JP document. The time allocated to the writing of the document was reduced from eight to four weeks due to delays in hiring the consultant¹². The four remaining weeks were used to consult with the main stakeholders. A planning workshop was held with civil society organizations. Separate meetings were held with key relevant ministries, PCBS and the chief Islamic Judge. Three additional meetings were held with the NSC members.

The scope of consultations in these meetings was not sufficient to produce the in depth information required to produce a JP document. As a result of these meeting a number of recommendations were made. Some of the recommendations were integrated such as the utilization of local vs. international resources and capacities in implementing activities. Others and specifically those related to an elaborated analysis of the political risks identified and corresponding mitigation measures were absent from the document. Critical threats cited in the recommendations, included the collapse of the PA or the formation of another Hamas government,

The time constraint faced by the proposal writers compromised the level of participation of all stakeholders in an equal manner. Although MoWA was designated as the lead agency to design and prepare for the GEWE JP, evidence shows that involvement by the other main stakeholders remained limited. Most concerned ministries (MoL, MoEHE and MoLG) and UN agencies were consulted individually. Participation on the level of the CBOs and NGOs in the design phase was not conducted in a systematic manner, and while a number of NGOs were briefly consulted other important implementing partners were not¹³.

Although it was evident in the concept note that the program's outcomes and outputs were too general and over ambitious, this was not amended in the JP document.

The JP document does not reflect on the capacities of the main implementing partners such as the lead agency (MoWA) and other relevant ministries to reach the desired programme outcomes. However, a proper needs' assessment was not conducted neither in the design nor in the implementation phases.

The amended plans following the Mid-Term Evaluation Report reduced the number of indicators from 36 to 26. Although the report also suggested changes on the level of outcomes and outputs these were not made. According to the MDG Guidelines,

¹²Prodanovic, Marina - Lessons Learned and Key Recommendations; MDG Fund – Joint Programme Proposal Process, October 2007.

¹³The Union of Cooperative Associations for Saving and Credit a lead organization in women's cooperatives was not consulted in the design phase but was brought in to implement an important component of the program at a much later stage.

changes of activities that **do affect** outputs and outcomes, especially if this implies a change in the programme's strategy, must be approved by the NSC and then submitted to the MDG-F Secretariat (that will refer the issue to the Global Steering Committee of the Fund). Also in the MDG-F Secretariat mission report of March 2011 it was clearly stated that "Any adjustment to the proposed strategy must be discussed and decided within the PMC. However, as discussed with the team during the mission, if the problems identified have not substantially changed from the formulation stage, the strategy of intervention should not be modified. Therefore outcomes and outputs should not be changed unless sufficient justification is provided to the Secretariat with NSC endorsement. When readjusting or redefining implies fostering synergies between similar activities/agencies and more effectively responding to the population's needs and demands, changes in these activities are allowed".

Based on this the JP has therefore decided to maintain the formulation of the outcomes/outputs as is, as only 12 months remained, and strengthened the outcomes/outputs by 2 means:

1. Adding activities to strengthen the achievements of the outputs/outcomes (for instance, legal literacy capacity development + establishing the M&E unit)
2. Grouping activities under general thematic areas (studies, policies, capacity development etc...)

h) To the situation in Gaza

There was a 22-month time interval between the design, inception and the implementation phases of the JP. In this period, the situation in Gaza changed drastically, as explained previously in the situational analysis.

In both the design phase and the inception period, there was a chance to change the program framework to better suit the emerging needs and ensure sustainability. Unfortunately, such change did not take place at that time, nor did it after the mid-term evaluation; for example, in view of the UN's no contact policy with the government in Gaza, changes in programme activities geared towards public institutional building were never made.

2. Efficiency of the JP

For the purpose of this evaluation, efficiency is measured through an assessment of the extent to which the JP's activities have been achieved against the intended outputs, and particularly the quality of the designed activities.

The evaluation also assesses the role of management in the implementation of the JP's activities, managements' efficiency in implementing the midterm evaluation's recommendations as well as the disbursement of the JP's budget.

a) The main achievements on the level of JP's outputs

At the time of writing this report, and according to the latest information received from the programme manager the programme's implementers have managed to implement about 96% of the planned activities. It was not possible to verify this figure as the final narrative and financial reports were not yet produced. The **most important** activities accomplished under the programme's outputs are listed in the table below.

Outputs	Main activities achieved
1.1 Knowledge and baseline on VAW established to monitor gender equity goals and inform program development.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A <u>baseline national family violence survey</u> including key data about women in senior levels was conducted and its results were officially launched in December 2011. • The <u>JP has developed the VAW Strategy, and the PA minister Cabinet endorsed it in January 2011.</u> To ensure the implementation of the VAW strategy, the MDG has signed five MoUs with five ministries; the Ministry of Education and Higher Education, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Interior, Ministry of Social Affairs, and the Ministry of Justice. Five technical committees were formed to implement and follow up the strategy in the West Bank and Gaza Strip. • <u>A number of action oriented and policy researches were produced and disseminated on GBV,</u> such as, a study on the analysis of governmental policies and draft laws, a study on legislations related to women political representation, a PLC policy paper on "Suggested Policy Interventions for PLC members for decreasing GBV in the oPt", qualitative research on the causes of VAW in the oPt informs quantitative research and policies on VAW. • <u>A training manual on "GBV/VAW and advocacy" was produced.</u> This manual, which was endorsed by MOWA, is being widely used by women organizations and other NGOs in their trainings.
1.2 Address VAW by increasing the capacity of gender advocates to influence policy makers and legislators resulting in increased protection for women.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>830 staff members from the ministries, PLC, women and youth NGOs were trained on VAW/GBV related issues.</u> • <u>PLC members were trained and equipped with the needed knowledge to combat VAW.</u> • <u>A study on the analysis of governmental policies and draft laws was prepared to decrease gender discrimination and another study on legislations related to women political representation.</u> The findings of both studies are being used to train PLC members.
1.3 Capacity to	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>150 front line health providers in the Emergency Units,</u>

<p>provide refuge, security, basic services and access to justice strengthened.</p>	<p><u>Primary Health Care, and Districts clinics were trained to respond to incidents of VAW/G according to an established protocol for VAW/G. A user-friendly guide for health providers on dealing with GBV was produced in 2011.</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>UNRWA has run workshops and provided training and awareness-raising sessions to 19,006 women and 4289 men and 8 religious leaders in 19 refugee camps across the West Bank. In Gaza, 19495 women and 1656 men were reached.</u> • <u>The training curriculum for lawyers, judges and prosecutors has been developed, and it is being tested through using it in the training sessions. The final version of the curricula was disseminated after the completion of all the training sessions UNDP targeted 137 lawyers, 36 judges, 20 prosecutors, and 36 law students.</u> • <u>The inauguration of the first of its kind women shelter in Gaza took place in December 2011.</u>
<p>1.4 Awareness raised, behavior and attitudes changed amongst men and women on gender relations, women's entitlements and rights (social, political and economic).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>As part of a participatory joint communication and media strategy, a programme website was developed, films and documentaries on GBV and Gender Equality and Human Rights were produced and disseminated widely among media institutions, universities, women and youth organizations. A guidebook to eliminate violence in schools was developed and around 720 teachers and 240 school counselors were trained to combat violence in schools.</u>
<p>2.1 Increased capacity of local governments, authorities and grassroots organizations to identify, plan and deliver gender sensitive services and on MDGs.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Qualitative research has been used to inform the National Strategy to Combat VAW and subsequent action plans as well as the Family Violence survey conducted by the Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics (PCBS).</u> • <u>A policy paper was developed and divided into 4 main issues: Social Rights, Equality in the Workforce, Equality in Political Participation, and Gender Based Violence.</u> • <u>A database system on women decision makers (PLC, municipalities, ministries, and political parties) is being developed and updated. The database system is available now at www.pwrdc.co.cc and will be available at MoWA website later in 2012.</u> • <u>314 persons have been trained on the integration of Gender Standards into the work of Local Government.</u> • <u>UNRWA trained 198 women and 23 men from CBOs on developing women leaders on MDG and gender-sensitive services. As a result, 17 CBOs put forward proposals for various community initiatives, and 7 of these have been chosen to receive a small grant for implementation.</u> • <u>19 women clubs were equipped to receive women and host social activities.</u> • <u>300 young volunteers received training on gender equality, health and GBV and capable of transferring the knowledge to their peers.</u>
<p>3.1 Influence of gender advocates,</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>The National Women's Employment Committee was established to monitor and increase women economic</u>

<p>workers and employers org in decision making and planning is increased particularly in relation to reforming discriminatory labor laws and planning for gender sensitive employment opportunities.</p>	<p><u>participation.</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>3 labor institutions developed action plans based on the findings of the PGA.</u> The three are: FPCCIA, MoL and PGFTU. • <u>18 income-generating projects were established and employed 91 volunteers and created 44 permanent jobs.</u> In Gaza 9 income generation projects were established and employed 18 women. • <u>10 women cooperatives received grants to improve service delivery.</u> • <u>Regular meetings with PCBS were conducted to discuss the quarterly labor force survey from a gender perspective for developing new indicators.</u> • The <u>ILO established a National baseline on GBV in world of work</u> entitled “The Gender Dimensions of violence in the World of Work: Situation Analysis in the oPt” • <u>320 constituents’ members were trained on ILO knowledge and tools to develop new, or modify existing labor policies or laws focused on work-related gender discrimination</u> • <u>Three Participatory Gender Audits were conducted and the reports endorsed by MoL, PGFTU and FPCCIA.</u> 2 Labor Market institutions namely MoL and PGFTU have national development action plans in place that are gender mainstreamed, promote gender equality and women's economic empowerment • <u>A Policy brief in English and Arabic language was produced for Mainstreaming Gender Equality in Palestinian Cooperatives.</u> • <u>A Review of the labor law from gender perspective was conducted to promote women’s labor force participation.</u> • <u>The policy brief for the "Mainstreaming Gender Equality Concerns in the TVET Sector" was produced.</u> • <u>The Minister of Labor designated key staff to support the gender unit functionality in terms of analyzing existing plans of MoL, provide awareness raising activities and amend/develop gender sensitized plans and policies.</u>
<p>3.2 Employment opportunities for low-income women and female graduates including in refugee camps are increased.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SHAREK and ASALA apply the ILO technical assistance, training tools, and products • 17 young refugee women completed the vocational training conducted by UNRWA. As a result a number of new graduates manage to secure a job with a photography company located in their areas following their on the job training in photography. In Gaza, UNRWA, trained 845 female and 212 male university graduates who benefited from 147 workshops on Leaderships skills, communications, English courses and Career Development. • 43 unemployed women engineers were placed and offered on the job training in the construction sector in the Gaza Strip. The Civil engineers were trained on the management of construction projects. As a result of the training a number of women engineers managed to secure a job at construction Companies in the Gaza Strip. • A construction Project Management Handbook was

	<p>prepared and developed by the CSCED-IUG and reviewed by ILO skills development specialists.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A 7-days ToT workshop was conducted in March 2010 using MATCOM training materials, the training aimed at enabling participants to work as cooperative extension (field) workers to promote women cooperatives in Palestine through organizing cooperative management and leadership training. • UNRWA trained 339 women and 136 men in the income generating projects. In Gaza UNRWA trained 1033 women, and 30 young deaf females.
--	---

According to the latest information received from the programme manager of the JP, 96% of planned activities were achieved in the course of the program. Where outcomes are specific, it is easy to see that the implementation of the designed activities has led to a large extent to reaching the desired outputs.

However, and as has been stated earlier in this report as well as in the Mid-Term Evaluation Report many of the outputs were articulated in too general manner to accurately describe the result expected to be achieved upon completion of the program.

So, it remains difficult to conclude in these cases whether the activities lead to the achievement of the outputs. Since the outputs are the concrete products, services or results that are expected to be delivered at the end of the programme and since the programme managers and implementers are directly responsible for the achievement of outputs, it is therefore very important to be as accurate and specific as possible in identifying and defining outputs. For example, the output on “awareness raised, behavior and attitudes changed amongst men and women on gender relations, women's entitlements and rights (social, political and economic)”, is too long, too general and encompasses too many components. The main activities implemented under this outcome namely, the production of manuals and guidebooks or films, although directly linked to the awareness-raising component will necessarily not result in changes in attitudes and behaviors amongst men and women on gender relations.

b) Management of the JP

The management of the programme adhered to a large extent to the management structures and procedures as stipulated in the Implementation Guidelines of the MDG Achievement Fund. The programme was steered by the National Steering Committee (NSC), managed by the Programme Management Committee (PMC) and administered by the Programme Secretariat (PS) with the close involvement of the PMT, which was created during the implementation phase as the operational body of the PMC to speed up the implementation.

c) Management structures and responsibilities

- The **National Steering Committee** (NSC) was comprised of UNSCO, MoPAD and the Spanish Agency for International Development and Cooperation. The NSC had the mandate and responsibility of overseeing the whole programme and of providing strategic oversight to the PMC.

- The NSC managed to convene six times during the entire implementation of the programme and hence, fulfilled the requirements according to the ToR of the Implementation Guidelines.
- Some of the main issues discussed in the meeting included the revision and approval of the programme's work plans and budgets, ways in which to enhance the programme's ownership by the PA ministries and the programme's exit and sustainability plan. The meetings also discussed the second ongoing MDG-F Programme on Culture.
- It was expressed by the members of the PMC that more guidance should have been provided by the NSC especially in solving problems faced by the PMC such as the delays in implementation, delays in receiving the payments and the formulation of the exit and sustainability strategy.
- The **Programme Management Committee** made up of representatives of the six UN agencies, a representative of MoWA being the lead ministry and the programme manager had the responsibility of ensuring the implementation of the programme's work plans and coordinating joint activities.
- The PMC met seven times out of a total of twelve as stated in the Implementation Guidelines. According to the JP implementation guidelines, the heads of all UN agencies should comprise the PMC. In reality and according to the PMC minutes, some heads of agencies attended certain meetings while others designated their representatives, mostly coordinators of the GEWE programme to attend the PMC. This has created discrepancies and confusion on the roles and responsibilities of the PMC. It was therefore decided to establish the Programme Management Team to help the Programme Secretariat in managing the implementation of the programme.
- **The Program Secretariat and the Programme Management Team.** In the beginning of the JP, the PS comprised of the Programme Manager, the M&E officer and a liaison officer from MoWA. The Advocacy and Communications Expert was recruited by UNFPA and worked from August 2011- August 2012.
- Soon after the initiation of the programme it became clear that the programme manager's ToR and specifically his decision-making role was unclear. In order to facilitate his work and that of the PS, it was decided to establish a PMT, which worked closely with the PS to facilitate and ensure the proper implementation of activities.
- In spite of the high turnover of the PMT representatives, the PMT met on a monthly basis and were successful in the creation of thematic groups such as media, access to justice, income generating activities, the formation of the Gaza Management Team and the assignment of a technical lead agency for the programme as well as lead agencies for each of the programme's outputs. Also, they prepared a calendar of activities on a monthly basis that was disseminated to all agencies, prepared a pool of consultants and

contractors to be used by UN agencies. Needs assessments, development of ToR's, SWOT analysis as well as other documentation of information were compiled and shared with all agencies.

- PMC and PMT members expressed their appreciation for the work done by the PS and the Programme Manager. All agreed that managing such a large and complex programme was very challenging and required serious efforts on behalf of the PS. The programme manager and the team did not involve Gaza in the planning, monitoring and evaluation of the programme. Although a Gaza Management Team was established, communications between Gaza and the West Bank remained very weak. Throughout the duration of the programme, there were only a few numbers of attempts to coordinate with Gaza on the PMT level and that was via videoconference, emails, telephone calls and Skype. None of the programme secretariat staff managed to visit Gaza in the course of the programme due to security reasons.

d) Implementation of the Mid-Term Review Recommendations (Improvement Plan)

The JP was successful in implementing ten out of the fourteen mid - term evaluation recommendations whether fully or partially.

The four remaining recommendations were not achieved for the following reasons:

- The first suggested that the new work plan and budget should include as an Annex, disaggregated interventions and inputs specific to Gaza and the West Bank, so that the spatial distribution of efforts for both areas can be clearly established.
There was disagreement among the PMC members on the adoption of this recommendation as it was difficult to implement. For UN agencies the West Bank and the Gaza Strip are considered one area. UN agencies often use the same suppliers for the West Bank and Gaza to implement their activities and their systems are not designed to disaggregate the required data.
No accurate figures could be obtained on the actual expenditure in Gaza as compared to the West Bank. It is estimated by the programme management that 22% of the total budget was spent in Gaza, although Gaza makes up around 40% of the Palestinian population.
- The second proposed that the ToR for the various management structures (i.e. NSC, PMC, PMT, PS, Gaza Team, and Thematic Sub-Groups), as well as for the special function units (i.e. Technical Lead Agency, Coordination Office, Administrative Agent, and Programme Manager) should be revisited and improved, so that these can be clearly understood among the various institutions and positions involved. Based on these ToR, an organizational structure, which defines the lines of relationships and accountabilities of the management structures, should have been clearly defined and agreed upon. It was recommended that the JP may hire an independent organizational development expert for these tasks, or the MDG-F Secretariat may itself facilitate the process of coming to a common understanding on these during its upcoming mission to the oPt in early 2011.

The organizational development expert was not hired as was recommended, although all agreed that the ToRs pertaining to the programme management structures should be reviewed.

- The third recommendation suggested that the participation of non-state institutions in the JP can be made more meaningful by inviting this sector in the meetings of the PMC and NSC, albeit as observers, as originally envisioned in the JP document. In Gaza, the same approach could have been applied in the local management team.

All PMC members did not accept this recommendation. While some members felt that non-state members such as NGOs will add great value to the discussions at the level of the PMC being the ones in touch with the community and its needs, the recommendation was dropped due to the large number of non-state members to be invited.

- The fourth suggested that for a future JP, a technical review of the budget should be done prior to approval of the application and include an analysis of the annual allocations. Further, it recommended that the review should also appraise the accuracy of the costs. The evaluation specifically recommends the use of the Activity-Based Costing (ABC) method in preparing budgets, because this method is consistent with the concepts in RBM. The evaluation is also not recommending the use of the commitment rate method for fund releases in JP that may be supported by the MDG-F in the future. The recommendation was agreed upon by the PMC but could not be implemented as this had to be done at the beginning of the JP.

e) Management of the budget

Budget disbursement rate per agency

UN Agency	Total Amount Received	Total Amount Disbursed as of mid November 2012	Balance
UNDP	2,043,229	1,927,115	116,114
UN Women	2,026,484	2,001,050	25,434
UNESCO	776,525	764,996	11,529
UNFPA	1,325,163	1,306,038	19,125
UNRWA	1,179,354	1,126,486	52,868
ILO	1,649,245	1,582,811	66,434
Total	9,000,000	8,708,496	291,504

Table 2, Budget disbursement rate per agency, December 2012

The six UN agencies successfully disbursed 97.7% of the total budget.

f) Monitoring and reporting

Monitoring is the systematic process of collecting information to assess the progress made in a programme. The collection of data including what, when and where to collect the data is based on a set of measurable indicators both qualitative and quantitative that are defined on the level of outputs and outcomes. In joint programmes the availability of baseline information is essential in the formulation of MDG-F Joint Programme on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in the occupied Palestinian territory (oPt)

measurable and smart indicators. Where baselines are not available in the design phase and during the writing of the joint programme document, as was the case in this programme, the joint programme should design activities to address this problem. Without baselines it will be difficult to measure the impact made by this programme or other joint programmes. For monitoring purposes, data is collected and analyzed throughout the implementation of activities using various tools such as questionnaires, field observations, monitoring reports, interviews, etc.

Monitoring and evaluation plans and reports

The JP has recruited an M+E officer who worked on a monitoring and evaluation plan based on a relatively large number on indicators, thirty-six, to measure the programme's nine outputs.

Following the recommendation made by the midterm evaluation, the number of indicators was reduced to twenty-six and outputs to seven. The plan was designed to collect and analyze data to show i) the impact of the JP on the targeted population / institutions, ii) the effect of the joint programme on the development objectives of the country, iii) the contribution of the joint programme on other eight MDGF thematic windows and iv) the production of two midterm and final reports consolidating the data of the three above units of analysis.

The M+E plan outlined the activities to be undertaken in the course of the programme such as the collection of baselines, joint field visits, annual reviews and work plans, reporting (quarterly, bi annual, annual, request for 2nd and third year funding and the midterm and final evaluation reports), the midterm and final evaluations.

Evidence shows that the M+E plan was followed and implemented to a large extent. Two semiannual monitoring reports and a final narrative and financial reports were submitted as required. All reports were submitted on time and feedback from the MDG-F Secretariat in New York shows that the quality of the reports constantly improved.

The reports were successful in capturing the activities' implementation rate. However it is difficult to see from the reports whether these activities have lead to the achievement of the output – the output in many cases being too general. It is also difficult to understand from the reports the main problems and challenges being faced by the programme. It was only through discussions with the PMC members that the reasons for the delay in establishing the M+E unit at MoWA were understood. The quality of reporting and analysis on the level of outputs was lacking in the reports.

The M+E officer stopped working with the programme six months before the end of the programme, at a crucial time of the programme, when the final, reports and documentation of the programme had to be prepared. The officer was not replaced and the duties and responsibilities of the M+E officer were taken over by the Programme Manager. It was not possible to meet with the M+E officer during the field mission although all the literature regarding M+E was supplied by the programme secretariat.

3. Effectiveness of the JP

The “Delivering as One” approach of the six UN agencies within the MDG-F GEWE JP sought to bring a change on GEWE in oPt for the very first time through

- a) A broad based participatory approach process including stakeholders from all parts of the society (social, economic, political) of WB and Gaza equally and during almost each phase of JP PCM (needs assessment, design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation);
- b) The implementation of activities through a two-tier process: providing a holistic approach to problem-solving by linking research with policy action and service provision by the PA, its institutions and civil society organizations (CSOs), and
- c) To complement and strengthen the PA’s service provision capacity through the support of essential services, institutional capacity development and innovative projects¹⁴.

The application of these instruments across all three outcomes and seven output levels¹⁵ resulted in the attainment of tangible and measurable development results from which all target groups/beneficiaries have benefitted¹⁶.

According to the latest data received from the PS in December 2012, the total numbers of direct and indirect beneficiaries are indicated in the tables below:

Direct Beneficiaries

Beneficiary type	Number of institutions	Expected number of women	Number of women to date	Expected number of men	Number of men to date
National institutions	13	--	1.137	--	891
Local institutions	74	--	19.594	--	2.607
Urban	--	--	--	--	--
Rural/ refugee camps	48	12.575	40.570	3.035	6.461
Total	135	12.575	61.301	3.035	9.959

Table 3. Direct beneficiaries the JP has targeted, December 2012

¹⁴MDG-F GEWE, Joint Program Document, 2008

¹⁵ The total number of outputs decreased from initially nine to seven towards the end of JP implementation. Even the latest AWP covering the years 2011-2012 was consisting of nine outputs, which in 2012 have been reduced to only seven. The latest M&E progress reports prove this.

¹⁶ Following the recommendation on the review process of the initial JP document, the UN Interoffice Memorandum from 1 April 2008 requested that the target groups/ beneficiaries are specified more profoundly in order to measure the JP’s contribution on development results for each target group. Based on this, the beneficiaries were categorized into direct and indirect beneficiaries under each output. In addition, the M&E progress reports submitted to date to the MDG-F Secretariat in New York classified the target groups into public service institutions, private sector institutions, civil servants and citizens, which the M&E reports have followed through. However, the analysis under this chapter will identify only those direct/ indirect beneficiaries under each output, which have de facto benefitted from the JP. Moreover, the focus of the analysis will refer to the quality of development results initiated under the leadership of each UN agency and the change they initiated on behalf of the JP with regard to the different beneficiaries.

Indirect Beneficiaries

Beneficiary type	Number of institutions	Expected number of women	Number of women to date	Expected number of men	Number of men to date
National institutions	--	--	75	--	75
Local institutions	--	--	90460	--	10.000
Urban	--	--	--	--	--
Rural/ refugee camps	--	--	67127	--	8.820
Total	--	--	157.662	--	18.895

Table 4. Indirect beneficiaries the JP has targeted, December 2012

The tables indicate that whilst at the national level women and men were directly involved in the JP in a more or less equal manner, this situation was quite different at the sub-national and even more so at the local level, where the number of women as direct as well as indirect beneficiaries were eight- to nine fold higher than those of men.

The total number of men with 18.895 is equivalent to around 20% of those from women with 157.662.

Thus, although the JP has significantly exceeded the initial number of people which were involved in the awareness raising sessions, training on GBV, VAW, leaderships skills, MDG-related service delivery etc. during the course of the JP implementation, the gender ratio is not balanced and hence, favoring women over men¹⁷.

As each UN agency was mandated to carry out its role and function according to its specific technical expertise relevant and pivotal to achieve the outputs and outcomes under the JP, the initial JP document from 2008, the AWP's developed from 2009-2011, covering the years 2010-2012 (as AWP's were developed for the following years) and M&E reports were structured in such a way that each UN agency was responsible to take the technical lead of each output.

The establishment of the PMTs during the implementation phase (and as the executive body of the PMC) proves that this management arrangement was effective in order to attain all outputs.

In detail, the following development results have been achieved for various target groups.

¹⁷It could not be proven that during the JP implementation this trend was counteracted, despite the fact that the earlier produced ME& reports indicated a similar trend.

Outcome 1- Preventing and responding to gender based violence (GBV) and all forms of violence against women and the girl child reduced.

Output 1.1. Knowledge and baseline on VAW and GBV established to monitor gender equity goals and inform program development

Under the lead role¹⁸ of the technical lead agency of the JP, **UN Women**, several national institutions such as MoWA, PCBS, PWRDC, BISAN, MoH, BZU as well as UN agencies (ILO and UNDP) have collaborated in order to strengthen the foundation for an institutionalization of research and knowledge based systems on GBV and VAW at the central level so that a wider repository of surveys, data and research studies on VAW and GBV exist with the aim to provide policy makers with more evidence based data on how to reduce GBV and tackle VAW in oPt.

This intervention has mounted, inter alia, in the draft of the VAW Strategy, the first ever enacted Strategy in the history of oPt, which has been endorsed by the Palestinian Ministers Cabinet in January 2011.

Albeit the fact that PCBS, since its establishment in 1993, had already published a violence survey back in 2005-2006, capacity development interventions within the context of the JP, e.g. in the form of training delivery on gender disaggregated data for PCBS staff members, have resulted in the publication of the most gender sensitive "Violence Survey in the Palestinian Society 2011" the PCBS has ever published¹⁹. After these interventions PCBS has published also the survey on Women and Men in Palestine in 2011.

The delivery of training courses for judges, lawyers, prosecutors and forth year students in the Faculty of Law at the Birzeit University²⁰ in Ramallah has initiated a remarkable shift within the attitudes of training participants²¹.

The concept of gender as a fundamental principle of human rights broke taboos in the mindset of all lawyers the final evaluation team met in the Faculty of Law, Birzeit University, for a focus group meeting. In particular, female and male sharia court judges expressed their deep appreciation for this training, which according to them initiated a dialogue forum within the Sharia Court administration as well as within the trials/cases.

Although the plan to establish Gender Units within the Sharia courts (including the recruitment of social workers to mediate among the disputing parties) has been decided by a Presidential decree in 2007, this plan has not been carried further by

¹⁸The terminology „lead“ role, as stipulated under outputs, have not been specified, neither in the JP Document from 2008, nor in the AWP and M&E reports reviewed. Hence, it remains incoherent whether the lead role was referring to the managerial, technical or even thematic role.

¹⁹According to the Head of the Social Statistics, Gender, Child and Crime Unit, Mr. Khalid Abu- Khalid, the present survey has been the most gender sensitive survey ever published by PCBS. A look into the Violence Survey in the Palestinian Society, 2011 Main Findings, Ramallah, March 2012 proves this statement. The data collected in the survey is of high quality due to the profound elaboration of data collection methods, classification of types of violence (occupation, domestic, sexual, verbal, physical), profiling of victims of any type of violence into age groups, geographic location, social status (married or single) etc.

²⁰These activities are dovetailing with those listed under output 1.3. where 240 women and men (180 in WB and 60 in Gaza) judges, lawyers, prosecutors and fourth year law students at Birzeit University were trained.

²¹Birzeit University, Report on the Evaluation Workshop of the Training Programme on Integrating Gender Criteria in the Work of Judges, Prosecutors, Lawyers and Local Government Staff, 5 June 2012, oPt

the JP, due to the weak legal standing of Sharia courts compared to other jurisdictions in oPt.

Whilst access to rule of law and law enforcement issues²² are one of the major threats for Sharia courts to initiate a reform process, the JP has nevertheless affected the knowledge base of the Sharia court judges, lawyers and the clients enabling the latter to enjoy more rights. Gender sensitive trial processes guaranteeing the freedom of speech for women and making them more aware of their legal rights under the Sharia law, is one measurable progress made in this regard²³.

Another tangible result is the plan of Sharia court judges and lawyers to establish a Bar Association of Sharia Lawyers and Judges, the first ever to be established in oPt, for which however the Sharia law has to be equated with that of the civil court and operationally, the verdicts from the Sharia courts to be transferred to the civil courts. The Bar Association is considered to strengthen the role of the sharia courts and will advocate that it has its own enforcement mechanisms.

However, as Sharia courts still do not possess a computerized system of rendering verdicts and to record cases, although standard operational procedures are in place, e.g. submitting annual reports on the cases to the President's Office, this omission poses a threat to continuously make trials more gender sensitive and to build the knowledge base on GBV and VAW within Sharia court jurisdiction, which would have supported the full achievement of this output.

These key interventions carried out under output 1.1. have not only increased the technical capacities of all national institutions involved under this output with regard to gender related subjects, moreover they supported the fulfillment of the mission and mandate of each institution in order to deliver its services they are mandated to provide in a much more gender sensitive way, although the lack of an M&E Unit within MoWA from the outset of the program interlinking PCBS to MoPAD's DARP and to the Gender Units of other line ministries (including the establishment of Gender Units within the Sharia Courts) would have resulted that gender equity goals are de facto monitored.

In short: Whilst the first part of the output has been fairly achieved, the second is not achieved.

Output 1.2. Capacity of gender advocates to influence policy makers and legislators increased

Under the leadership of **UNESCO** and UN Women this output served two purposes:
a) Upgrading capacities of gender advocates at the central level (MoWA, MoH, CEC, women NGO's and PLC members) by training them in research and data analysis on GBV and VAW and to link it with the development of policies through action plans²⁴, and

²²UNDP, Public perceptions of Palestinian justice and security institutions, March 2012, p. 6; Access to legal assistance is inadequate, adversely affecting perceptions of justice and the integrity of security institutions.

²³ Meeting with Mrs. Sumoud A. Damiri, PNA, Supreme Judge Department, The Upper Council of Sharia Jurisdiction

²⁴ MIFTAH has delivered training sessions to PLC members, out of which male members were initially reluctant to receive training on gender concepts, GBV, VAW etc. However, once female members were trained, male members developed interest to receive training as well. Meeting with MIFTAH on 14 November 2012. See also MIFTAH activities report 2011, p.14-15

b) To support the capacities of women organizations in Gaza and WB on networking so that one action plan could be developed to do advocacy on all outcomes of JP to influence decision makers.

Basically, these two activities are complementing each other and are mutually dependent. Whilst UNESCO (through MIFTAH) has been focusing on a top-down approach to increase capacities of policy makers on GBV, VAW, statistical indicators and integration of gender sensitive indicators into various laws so as to develop action plans, which they can follow up afterwards, UN Women on the other side, has put emphasize on a bottom up approach by engaging CBO's through one advocacy strategy for WB and Gaza on their mandate to influence decision makers at the central level.

However, neither project documentation on part of UNESCO nor that from UN Women indicate that both activities have been meant to complement each other, as the role of CBO's as a bridge between citizen and policy makers has not been touched upon by both agencies.

In addition, the lack of documentation on the training impact assessment on part of UNESCO (e.g. how exactly are PLC members going to apply the acquired knowledge and how they will involve CBO's into their decision making processes on GEWE) supports this thesis. Moreover, the lack of causality of activities under output 1.2 in the JP document from 2008 has not been amended accordingly²⁵.

The user/ producer dialogue²⁶ has been contributing to this output by means of providing an understanding and a practical tool to both data users and producers on how to produce relevant data and how to utilize it in order to design appropriate policies to be implemented afterwards. The comprehensive data provided by ILO mark that this tool has been an important advocacy tool bringing data users and producers together in order to establish a system through which relevant data could be produced and utilized for better policy development. In addition, it supported PCBS as the data producer in oPt to continuously upgrade its capacity also at the organizational level by supporting it in specialization in population statistics, labor market statistics etc. However, the effect the user/ producer dialogue has initiated will be much more visible once the M&E Unit in MoWA will be in place. It will accommodate and make use of the relationship between data producers and users. Based on this analysis, this output has been only partly achieved.

Output 1.3. Capacity to provide refuge, security, basic services and access to justice strengthened

Under the leadership of **UNFPA**, UNDP, UN Women and UNRWA intensive training sessions were delivered for a variety of institutions and professions.

UNFPA's training sessions for 150 front health providers in the Emergency Units, Primary Health Care, and District Clinics improved provision of assistance to

²⁵Meeting held with Derek Elias, Representative of UNESCO and Majd Beltaji, Programme Officer, MDG-F GEWE JP UNESCO on 14 November 2012 in Ramallah. It was stated that there is no bridge between policy development at the central and the impact on the grassroots level, due to the political affiliation/ fragmentation of each CBO in WB and Gaza alike the political parties within PLC. However, a look into the JP Document reveals, that even in the design phase back in 2008 these two activities have not been recognized as a complementing output.

²⁶MDG-F Achievement Fund, ILO, Report of the main results of a field study of the reality of the relation between the producers and users of the labor statistical data in the Palestinian Territory, Ramallah 2010, p.7-11

victims of GBV have benefitted doctors to the extent that they gained knowledge and practical skills on how to deal with victims of GBV for the very first time²⁷.

However, it was reported that doctors bypassed the role of social workers when a victim of GBV was admitted to the hospital. Instead of referring the victim to the social worker who would provide counseling services and make her aware of her rights, the victim was directly referred to the Family Protection Unit of the Police, which did not always have capacities to deal with these cases due to the lack of standard operational procedures on how to deal with victims in general²⁸. In some cases police officers took these victims to the shelters and when they were released afterwards, MoSA was following up on their cases²⁹.

MoSA on the other hand could not provide information as to how their cases were followed up and whether this information was shared with MoWA so that it could record and take action accordingly. Documentation on this does not exist either.

The fact that social workers were not fully integrated into the referral system of the hospitals, poses a threat to the sustainability of UNFPA's approach to provide basic services to the victims of GBV under this output. This condition is even more aggravated when women admitted to the hospitals are not making use of their rights to file a complaint against the perpetrator due to the lack of knowledge on their rights (which is the duty of the social worker) or due to cultural constraints³⁰.

Finally, the surveillance system of the MoH, the so-called Health Information System (HIS), does not accommodate indicators for GBV cases (although it was planned), through which the MoH could track record of GBV cases in the hospitals³¹.

The MoH confessed that the HIS needed to be updated and that the ToR of the social worker needed revision in order to fully integrate this function into the organizational set up of the hospital as well as into the referral system guided by MoU (Family Protection Unit) and MoSA (shelter for women).

The fact that the protocol to establish a national referral system has not been endorsed by the Ministers Cabinet so far has been hampering the full support with regard to these interventions³².

²⁷Meeting with a female doctor recruited by MoH. MoH and UNFPA verified this information.

²⁸ Meeting with the Family Protection Unit of the Police in Bethlehem on 16 November 2012; A three year strategic plan of the Police is at present under preparation which is proposing to change the strategic as well as organizational set up of the Police in order to tackle GBV and VAW issue in a much more efficient way. Currently, the Family Protection Unit in Bethlehem was understaffed with having only 3 police officers dealing with victims of GBV. In addition, the presentation by Mrs. Wafa Mu'ammur (Police- Family Protection Department) at the Birzeit University within the framework of the „Conference on Gender as Entry Point to Development and Justice in Palestine“ on 19 November 2012, demonstrated the difficulties the Police was posed to due to the lack of a standard operational procedures at the beginning of the JP and the lack of a genuine Palestinian law to address GBV and VAW issues, as the mix of Egyptian, Ottoman and British rule were not applicable and favorable in this regard. Therefore, it was recommended that new Palestinian laws should be drafted in order to frame the legal basis for this action.

²⁹However, no documentation exists as to whether this referral system was appropriate to deal with GBV cases and whether the situation of the victim improved either during JP implementation or within the existing referral system.

³⁰Meeting with a social worker from the Tulkarim Hospital, 14 November 2012. MoH and UNFPA verified this information.

³¹Meeting with Dr. Souzan Abdo, Director of Women's Health and Development Directorate, 14 November 2012

³²The Women's Center for Legal Aid and Counseling (WCLAC) has submitted the Protocol with the financial support of the EC, as the EC funded a program to establish a national referral system. MDG-F Joint Programme on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in the occupied Palestinian territory (oPt)

The establishment of the Hayat multipurpose center (shelter) in Gaza however, initiated a breakthrough in the Gazan society in the sense that the Hamas government was forced to address GBV and VAW issues for the very first time at the national/ policy level. However, since the negotiation process with Hamas took long, the establishment of the shelter was delayed³³.

Despite the fact that the shelter still does not operate fully as a shelter since its establishment (Hamas still does not permit that victims can stay over night; no sustainability plan or a resource mobilization strategy to finance the center beyond the JP especially in view of the danger that few shelters have been closed down already in the WB), it is nevertheless the first physical structure for the protection of women, addresses the phenomenon of gender based violence within an integrated, human rights-based approach, working on prevention, while promoting a culture of gender-sensitive, violence-free family relations as well as protection and empowerment of women, girls and children victims and survivors of violence³⁴.

Another important intervention under this output was the further support and upgrade of the helpline services offered by SAWA, a CSO, which provided 24 hour a day services to victims (women, children, youth) being subject to various types of violence. The JP has contributed to a further institutionalization of the helpline by providing technical expertise, capacity building, supporting the adoption of new technology, database management and training to volunteers.

The establishment of the database covers very important data and information on the type of violence forced upon the victim, profiling of the perpetrator and information about questions raised by the victims on sexual health and STD.

The development of a resource mobilization strategy, networking and advocating on GBV and outreach of helpline services also to victims in Gaza, demonstrates that this intervention has contributed to this output significantly.

The last intervention the final evaluation team has surveyed under this output was the training conducted to 80 MoSA counselors and 20 disadvantaged youth. This intervention has supported the strengthening of the departments of Vocational Training and Education and the Department for Aluminum within MoSA.

Both departments were in charge of providing skills training and job opportunities for juvenile males between 14-18 years of age. The Project Coordinator of UNFPA seconded to MoSA, was in charge of training juvenile females on skills so that they could find employment after the training was provided.

Common criticism was raised on the issues that a) diplomas/ certification obtained by the graduates were not recognized by the MoEHE, hence aggravating the condition for juveniles to get appropriate accreditation in order to enter the employment market, b) lack of cooperation with MoL and its TVET Department in order to standardize training courses, c) the obsolete nature of existing laws on juveniles and d) lack of investment to integrate juveniles into the labor market. As the establishment of a full-

However, the PNA has only lately committed itself to ratify the a national referral system that defines and organizes work among institutions that offer protection to women who are victims of violence and to put it into practice (PNA, The National Strategy to Achieve the MDGs by 2015, June 2015, p. 37)

³³Skype meeting with Mrs. Alia El-Yassir, Head of UN Women, Jerusalem, on 17 December 2012

³⁴ MDG- Achievement Fund, Knowledge Management for Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment, Achieving MDG-3, Proposal for Knowledge Sharing Agreements for Joint Programs of the MDG-F Gender Window, p. 2-3

MDG-F Joint Programme on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in the occupied Palestinian territory (oPt)

Final Evaluation

28 December 2012

fledged national referral system has not been followed through, which has been pivotal for the achievement of this output, this output has been only partly achieved.

Output 1.4. Awareness raised, amongst men and women on gender relations, women's entitlements and rights (social, political and economic)

Under the leadership of UNFPA³⁵, the media and advocacy strategy for the JP was developed, although at a later stage of JP implementation.

A review of the Strategy proofs, however, that there was no unified/ core message, which would make the soul or identity of the JP as a holistic approach much more visible in public. The discrepancy between the numbers of women and men as indirect beneficiaries as has shown under table 3 proofs this. Hence, this Strategy has not been able to make the GBV issues more public in order to support all outputs in general and specifically output 1.2.

In addition, the early release of the Media and Advocacy Strategy would have guided and supported the activities herein to which however no direct causality exists (neither in the JP documents nor during the meetings held with UN agencies).

Despite this, however, measurable and tangible progress has been observed of activities within this output under the leadership of **UNRWA** in WB and Gaza.

Awareness raising campaigns on issues such as provision of assistance to victims of VAW and GBV, family and child protection, gender relations, CEDAW and women's rights and entitlements have benefitted 19,006 women, 4,289 men and 8 religious leaders in 19 refugee camps across the WB³⁶. The outreach of UNRWA activities through a ToT curriculum on family counseling training on the provision of psychological counseling in close cooperation with the Birzeit University has certainly contributed to the fact that a multiplier effect was initiated in this regard.

However, it was reported that after conducting awareness raising sessions, counseling services were seldom sought although the frequency of violence cases within refugees camps are much higher than in rural and urban areas³⁷.

As for Gaza, 19,495 women and 1,656 men have benefitted from the same session. In addition, a committee consisting of male stakeholders, key figures, professionals and leaders have undergone these sessions as well. The committee was tasked to change unequal power relations between women and men, whilst involving men in activities to end VAW within the established 7 WPCs. Training was conducted on the UN Resolution 1325 for 20 lawyers & counselors at WPCs, and 14 awareness raising workshops held on CEDAW and the same resolution at UNRWA schools, targeting around 500 UNRWA's teachers. However, no report from Gaza indicates how these training sessions have contributed to end violence, as can be seen in the M&E report of the JP too.

Overall and moreover, the fact that a referral system has been introduced within UNRWA at a later stage of JP implementation, as the introduction of GBV and VAW concepts have been very new to UNRWA's work, demonstrates that this output has been only partly achieved.

³⁵Under output 1.4., UNFPA was tasked to manage the development of the Media and Advocacy Strategy on behalf of the entire JP. As such, the JP did it in a concerted effort.

³⁶Presentation of UNRWA, Challenges, Lessons Learned, Achievements held at a meeting with Mrs. Hanan Jajjousi, Deputy Chief Field Relief and Social Services Programme in Ramallah

³⁷PNA, PCBS, Violence Survey in the Palestinian Society 2011, Main Findings, Ramallah, March 2012

Outcome 2- Representation of women and women's issues in decision-making bodies increased

Output 2.1.³⁸ Increased capacity of local government authorities and grassroots organizations to identify, plan and deliver gender-sensitive services on MDG's

Under the leadership of **UNDP** and the Gender Unit of MoLG, 300 members of the local councils in 15 districts have been trained on a modular designed training course comprising of subjects such as:

- Gender mainstreaming concepts
- Gender mainstreaming concepts in district planning
- Gender mainstreaming concepts and law
- Gender Responsive Budgeting in district planning
- Gender mainstreaming concepts in development

The aim of this modular training course was to raise awareness on the above and to provide skills training on how to develop and implement gender sensitive local development policies for the present local council members. The directorates of the MoLG, religious leaders and sharia court judges attended this training as well. Although the Training Unit of the MoLG took the leadership in providing training courses based on the technical input from the Gender Unit of the MoLG, several obstacles posed a challenge to achieve this output to its full extent³⁹:

- The absence of Gender Units or Women Affairs Directorates⁴⁰ within the governorates administration (sub-national level), putting an additional strain on the Directorates of Local Governance to mainstream gender within the governorates administrative structure as well as supporting the local councils to do the same due to the lack of human and financial resources and the lack of training impact assessment tools/mechanism in order to track the progress made on the various gender subjects⁴¹,
- The lack of coordination among CBO's, which have been conducting training courses for rural women as well as local councils, causing a duplication of training subjects for the local councils,
- The lack of openness on part of male council members to work along with women council members due to cultural constraints, and
- The inability of women council's members to attend local council sessions and their replacement by their husbands.

In order to counteract these threats as early as possible, the MoLG

- Initiated the development of a forum so as to coordinate the work of CBO's in training local council members and to avoid duplication of training courses,
- Prohibited to hold local elections in case the 20% quota for women seats was not abided by,

³⁸Under outcome 2, the earlier outputs 2.1. and 2.2. have merged into one single output.

³⁹Meeting with Mrs. Hanan Imseih, Head of Gender Unit within MoLG, 11 November 2012 in the premises of the MoLG, Ramallah; see also her presentation on MoLG's intervention under this output as shown at the Conference on Gender as Entry Point to Development and Justice in Palestine, 19 November 2012, Institute of Law, Birzeit University

⁴⁰MoWA has been defining its role within the JP as a policy-making ministry and not necessarily an implementing ministry, a reason why no MoWA's directorates do exist in the governorates. Refer also to the speech of Mrs. Fatima Radaidah, Experience of the MoWA's in gender policy making within the public sector, held on 19 November 2012 at the Conference on Gender as an entry point to development and justice in Palestine, Institute of Law, Birzeit University

⁴¹Meeting with Mrs. Intisar Hasiba, Directorate of Local Governance in Nablus on 13 November 2012
MDG-F Joint Programme on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in the occupied Palestinian territory (oPt) 43

- Incentivized local councils financially whenever they were involving women into local council meetings,
- Developed a procedural manual on how to run and manage local councils,
- Developed a procedural manual for the fulfillment of the mandate of the Gender Unit of MoLG,
- Development of a more gender sensitive National Strategy on Local Governance beyond 2013 so as to mainstream gender into the sectoral level of oPt, and
- The joint initiative with CBO's to draft a proposal advocating for an increase of women's representation in the local councils from currently 20 up to 30%.
- In addition, WATC complemented the training courses provided by MoLG on subjects such as advocacy and media and leadership skills and by involving marginalized youth in remote areas for the very first time into the training courses as well⁴².

A second major achievement under this output was the establishment of the NCWE, which has been established in February 2010 as an advisory body to the Minister of Labor after being endorsed by the Cabinet. MoL, MoWA, PGTTFU, Development Center of Birzeit University, Center for Democracy and Women's Rights are members of the NCWE. Its mandate is to advocate for gender sensitive policies, legislations, capacity building interventions, social safety net for women workers and a healthy work environment. Currently, they are in the process of developing their 3-year strategic plan. As the PLC is dysfunctional, the NCWE has not been able to carry out its mandate further, however, the fulfillment of their mandate under continuous support from UNDP and ILO might provide a basis through which discussions on minimum wages for women, introduction of social safety nets could be carried out further⁴³.

Based on the above, this output has been fairly achieved.

Outcome 3- Creating equal opportunities for women to participate economically⁴⁴

Output 3.1. Influence of gender advocates, workers and employers organizations in decision-making and planning is increased particularly in relation to reforming discriminatory labor laws and planning for gender-sensitive employment opportunities
Under the sole leadership of **ILO** and within the context of their tripartite agreement, ILO has taken the lead to carry out extensive capacity development interventions in the form of training courses for MoL, the Palestinian General Federation of Trade Unions (PGFTU) and the Federation of Palestinian Chambers of Commerce, Industry and Agriculture (FPCCIA) staff members on gender responsive quantitative and qualitative and process oriented labor market indicators as well as

⁴²Even though the integration of male youth into the work of WATC is not explicitly mentioned in the mission statement from 2012, WATC in itself undergoes a structural reformation process. The development of a resource mobilization strategy and a sustainability strategy proves this.

⁴³Meeting with the members of the NCWE in the MoL on 6 November 2012.

⁴⁴During JP implementation the initial amount of outputs under this outcome have been reduced from three to two according to the advice of the MDG-F Secretariat in New York to simplify and specify the aims of each output. Hence, activities under the former output 3.2. "Capacity of the MoL (including its institutions), workers' and employers' organizations developed to implement specific measures" have been shared among all other outputs.

training on how to do a gender review of all laws that impede women's labor force participation within the Directorate of General Affairs.

The Participatory Gender Audit (PGA) has been an important tool that was conducted within several institutions such as MoWA, MoL, PGFTU, FPCCIA, Ministry of Economics, Ministry of Culture, MoLG and private sector companies in order to promote organizational learning at the individual, work unit and organizational levels on how to practically and effectively mainstream gender. MoWA has benefitted from this intervention to the extent that it could better monitor, supervise, and plan for gender mainstreaming at the various governmental institutions that however will flow into the establishment of the M&E Unit within MoWA as of 2013. The development of the PGA Strategy under the lead of MoWA proves that this intervention laid the foundation for the institutionalization of PGA at the national level as such.

In addition, ad hoc workshops for gender advocates in developing and launching an advocacy campaign for the endorsement of draft laws were prepared.

These interventions aiming at strengthening the institutional set up of MoL as such have been more of a holistic and integrative nature in the sense that the mission/mandate of several departments have been further strengthened and linked with each other, although a comprehensive organizational strengthening process per se was not aimed at.

E.g. after provision of training on how to review laws that impede women's workforce participation and how to integrate labor standards into policies, the Inspectorate Department was provided with the tools/ mechanism for ensuring that workplaces were abiding by these laws and that abuses were detected immediately. On the other hand, training on part of the Inspectorate Department for the employers, employees and for the courts (judges, lawyers) was also ensuring that these new laws were introduced on a face-to-face basis.

However, due to the severe job prospects for women in the labor market and the cultural constraint imposing women to defer from complaints, the detection of abuse cases was limited. Nevertheless, due to the holistic nature of this intervention, the achievement of this output has been fairly achieved.

Output 3.2 Employment opportunities for low-income women and female graduates including in refugee camps are increased

Under the same leadership of **ILO**, around 700 cooperatives (women as well as mixed cooperatives) were established in the WB out of which the Cooperative Extension Unit of the MoL has classified 500 as active ones.

For the establishment of the cooperatives, ILO has adapted the MATCOM (Training Manual for the Management of Cooperatives) to the Palestinian context and trained extension workers, who in turn trained women cooperatives on subjects such as how to establish a women's cooperative, how to develop business plans, bookkeeping, leadership skills, reporting, marketing etc.

According to the Union of Cooperative Associations for Saving and Credit (UCASC), which took over the training of women cooperatives only in the middle of JP implementation and which is an umbrella organization of all women's cooperatives, the women cooperatives were more beneficial than the mixed ones, as women were more empowered, confident and capable in these ones. Criticism was raised with regard to the modalities of training delivery. It was stated that the development of business plans were done by experts and not by members of the women cooperatives.

Although the concept of cooperatives was comparatively new to the Palestinian labor market context and hence, a breakthrough was initiated in this regard, the lack of adequate quality control mechanism within the Cooperative Extension Unit of MoL, poses a serious threat to ensure continuous support and improvement of the cooperative structure in order to achieve this output. The concern raised by UCASC that external organizations are using the cooperatives to raise funding for projects, proves that cooperatives are running the risk of becoming dependent structures of dubious organizations.

Finally, the women cooperatives met during the field mission in Bethlehem (cooperative for handicraft), Qabalan (running of a supermarket and production of pastry), cooperatives for spices in Beit Anan-Jerusalem⁴⁵, demonstrated that the production of certain goods for the local market were meeting an actual demand and that products could be sold to retailers. A financial viability plan of the cooperatives were partly available, however, marketing concepts have the potential to be refined further so as to reach out beyond the local markets. The question whether registered cooperatives within the Cooperative Extension Unit of MoL have been also registered within the Ministry of Commerce in order to support them in marketing their products at fairs or to reach out to regional markets, could not be answered.

The skills development training program for 44 unemployed women engineers in Gaza were developed with the Community Service and Continuing Education Deanship (CSCED) of the Islamic University in Gaza. The training was aimed at a) providing the necessary skills to match the requirements of the local construction market, b) integrating the women engineers into the construction industry through placements in the contracting companies and c) encouraging the contracting companies to involve women engineers into their companies work.

After a three months job placement training, 11 out of 44 women engineers managed to secure jobs at SMEs in the construction sector. This is equivalent to a total employment rate of 25%. However, no indication exists on the remaining 75% of women that were not employed right after the accomplishment of the training course.

The Women Gain Employable Skills in Photography course enabled 17 young and unemployed women (mainly from the refugee camps) to acquire skills training on photography. This course responded to the lack of female photographers in the local market and hence, was a demand driven initiative. Participants were selected based on their vulnerability (victim of GBV and hardship families). Project documentation indicates that 5 out of 17 women were able to find a full time job or start up their own businesses. However, no indication exists on the remaining 12 training participants. Hence, the employment rate has been only around 30%.

The Gender and Entrepreneurship Together initiative (GET Ahead) has supported the training of 291 women from the projects conducted by ASALA and UNRWA.

Through UNRWA 111 refugee women received training on enterprise development whereby they learned how to be engaged in small-scale businesses. The training comprised of modules such as entrepreneurship skills from a gender perspective and in addition, it addressed the practical and strategic needs of low-income women in enterprise development by strengthening their basic entrepreneurial traits, and business and people management skills. Out of 111 graduates, 55 received further specialized vocational training provided by sector-specific providers on topics such as food processing, hairdressing, facial care, sewing, photography and filming, while

⁴⁵The organizational set up of the cooperatives need strengthening as several members who were not fully engaged in the activities did bookkeeping randomly.

85 received further training on soft skills, such as financial education, marketing, entrepreneurship and communication skills. According to the progress report from ILO, 43 micro and small business have been created for the most vulnerable women as a result of the trainings, which comprised of vocation/ skills training and the distribution of small grants ranging from \$500 and \$1.500. 51 permanent employment opportunities were created. Through ASALA's project, 15 micro enterprises were established. As the employment rate right after completion of training courses has been overall around 50%, this output has been fairly achieved.

IV. JP's contribution to the MDG Fund objectives, MDGs, Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness and UN reform

a) JP's contribution to thematic window 2 GEWE at local and national level

Outcome 1- Preventing and responding to gender based violence (GBV) and all forms of violence against women and the girl child reduced

- Through this outcome, which has been only partly achieved (see analysis under 1.1; 1.2; 1.3 and 1.4), the JP has been addressing the elimination of all forms of discrimination and violence against women and the girl child. Hence, it is in alignment with one of the seven priorities which have been identified by the UN Millennium Project Task Force on GEWE as stipulated in the ToR of the MDG-F GEWE 2, although it does not fully touch upon the aspect of ending impunity and by ensuring the protection of civilians, during and after armed conflicts in accordance with the obligations of States under international humanitarian law and international human rights law. This is rooted in the rather weak nature of law enforcement issues in oPt and/ the obsolete nature of existing laws.
- At the local level, it was reported, although not verified, that the JP interventions have resulted in a slight decrease of GBV cases in refugee camps. However, as there is no data on the decrease of GBV cases since the inception of the JP (see 3.3. of the last M&E report from mid 2012 "Variation of GBV cases as reported to the police from the beginning of the JP to present) and as the referral system is only partially functional within UNRWA as well as within MoSA and MoH interventions, the contribution of JP towards this end can't be assessed.
- At the national level, however, the JP has significantly contributed to the achievement of this outcome through the development and design of the VAW Strategy in January 2011, the development of the policy brief "Suggested Policy Interventions for PLC members for decreasing GBV in the oPt" in May 2011, the current revision of the penal code, personal status and the family law.
- The JP succeeded in building a database about VAW and GBV by the provision of statistical data, standardization of terminologies etc.
- In addition, this outcome is supportive of the sectoral strategies such as the Social Protection Strategy (2011-2013), target 4 in particular, which advocated for a strengthening of cohesive families, although VAW and GBV are not mentioned explicitly. Albeit the fact that the Health Sector Strategy (2011-2013) is also relevant for this outcome and vice versa, the improvement of the HIS to cover GBV cases and the improvement of the referral system have not been touched upon. This is a severe omission.

Outcome 2- Representation of women and women's issues in decision-making bodies increased

- Activities carried out under this outcome have been very much in alignment with the ToR for the Thematic Window 2 on GEWE⁴⁶.

⁴⁶ToR for Thematic Window on GEWE, p.5; Consolidating women's rights constituencies within and outside government; Fostering women's participation in the political sphere
MDG-F Joint Programme on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in the occupied Palestinian territory (oPt)
Final Evaluation
28 December 2012

- Although this outcome has been fairly achieved and it serves the Local Government and Administrative Strategy (2011-2013) headed by the MoLG, gender mainstreaming of the governorates (sub-national) is not included in the present Strategy, a condition which was expressed as an omission under elaboration of output 2.1. However, the Strategy stipulates that the Law on the Election of Local Bodies is safeguarding the representation of women. In short, the present Strategy does not indicate that the current quota of 20% should be increased into 30% and that the directorates of LG will receive support from MoLG to improve their services for the local councils on increase of women's representation and GEWE.
- Finally, there is no evidence that a mechanism is in place to mainstream gender equality in the new aid modalities with respect to the principles of the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness at the country level, although currently within MoWA an M&E Unit will be established which would ensure that as of 2013 the PD AE principles are gender mainstreamed⁴⁷.

Outcome 3- Creating equal opportunities for women

- Although this outcome has been fairly achieved, it has not been able to contribute to women's empowerment issues in national planning cycles including budgets and loan instruments, as was stipulated in the ToR for the Thematic Window 2 on GEWE, due to the fact that the PLC is not functional.
- However, the training conducted by MIFTAH (output 1.2. under the leadership of UNESCO) to PLC members on GRB might support this in the future. According to the latest M&E report, the amount of the national budget dedicated to GEWE issues is equivalent to 3%, which is not sufficient to pursue GEWE issues at the policy level as well as through PA's service delivery further.
- With the establishment of the NCWE (although this is an activity under outcome 2) an important move was initiated in order to examine the weaker forms of state social provisioning, so as to identify the mix of policies needed to reduce, support and redistribute care work to enable overall well being and enhance gender equality.
- As under outcome 3 no local indicators were developed as to how the JP contributed to the attainment of the MDG 1 in oPt, there was no contribution on the attainment of thematic window 6 (Thematic window on Development and the Private sector) either whereby to assess the impact of TVET, SME and the cooperatives towards achievement of this goal.
- As for the sectoral approach, the JP (under the leadership of ILO and UNDP) has very much contributed to the Labor Sector Strategy (2011-2013). By the

⁴⁷Meeting with the JP Programme Manager, Mr. Hanna George Nakhleh and the M&E Consultant, Mrs. Randa Hilal. The establishment of the M&E Unit and the recruitment of a person within MoWA will ensure that the sectoral strategies (2011-2013) lead by MoPAD are gender mainstreamed, which the Local Aid Coordination Secretariat (LACS) of MoPAD will be in charge of. To date, not all sectoral strategies are fully gender mainstreamed. This intervention will support MoPAD to develop a monitoring framework so as to monitor and evaluate the sectoral strategies. Within this, UNFPA supported MoWA and the PCBS to prepare and present a list of national gender indicators to be well reflected in the national Monitoring System under PCBS. In addition, UNFPA trained three MoWA staff members on how to monitor and produce progress reports.

same token, ILO and UNDP are in the process of developing an Integrated Human Resource Capacity Building Program within the MoL in order to implement this Strategy.

- However, neither the Agricultural Sector Strategy (2011-2013) nor the Economic Development Strategy (2011-2013) does highlight the importance of the 500 active cooperatives established under the JP to poverty reduction of vulnerable women, although the cash flow of the cooperatives have not only improved the situation of rural women from severe poverty into poverty, but also increased the nominal capital of the Union of Saving and Credit significantly, which has financed the cooperatives through the provision of loans. This has not been taken into account in the aforementioned strategies.

b)JP's contribution to the MDG's in oPt

- The relevance and contribution of the JP to the national MDGs goes beyond MDG 3, which, however, has not been adequately reflected in any of the documentation reviewed so far. Neither the M&E progress reports on part of the JP, nor the individual final evaluation nor the exist and sustainability strategies as well as other documents have been able to identify and establish coherence between the JP and its relevance to almost all MDGs at the national and global level.
- The activities carried out under output 1.1. (9. Develop a guidebook in a participatory approach on how to eliminate violence in school) and under output 1.4 (2. 720 teacher and 240 school counselors are equipped with the needed skills and knowledge to combat violence in schools⁴⁸) has been conducted to attain MDG 2 (Achieve quality primary education for all students within the 4-15 age group). As written in the National Strategy to Achieve the MDGs by 2015, the amendment of school curricula taking into consideration gender equality issues and the establishment of parent teacher councils are two major interventions addressing GEWE and GBV issues.
- The activities carried out under outcome 3 are very much in alignment with MDG 1 in oPt: Eradicate extreme poverty and alleviate poverty. The relevance of the activities is well reflected under the section policies and interventions although the establishment of the cooperatives, SME, TVET and other income generating projects as a means of poverty reduction mechanism is not mentioned at all.
- As for MDG 3, all JP interventions are well reflected in the Strategy.
- As UNFPA's intervention under outcome 2, upgrading the HIS in order to accommodate GBV cases in hospitals, has not been followed through (with focus on young mothers), the relevance of the JP to MDG 5 was not visible.

En detail:

⁴⁸MaDAD, a private consulting firm, has developed a „Manual empowering and disseminating of the policy of reducing violence and GBV“, for teachers and school counselors (14 October 2012) financed by UNESCO. The aim was to disburden teachers and to support them on how to deal with cases of violence and GBV. Although the MoEHE was part of the Steering Committee along with UNESCO, the MoEHE did not take ownership of this project, hence aggravating the condition, that projects in this field were duplicated.

MDG ⁴⁹ goals	Output/ outcome	Relevance / Contribution
1. Eradicate extreme poverty and alleviate poverty	Outcome 3	No local indicators developed and measured under outcome 3 of JP; e.g. contribution of TVET, SME, women cooperatives to improve the living conditions of beneficiaries and attainment of MDG1; however, JP's (e.g. ILO's and UNRWA's) interventions in alignment with the policy interventions as reflected in the National Strategy to Achieve the MDGs by 2015, p. 24.
2. Achieve quality primary education for all students within 4-15 age group	Outcome 1 (output 1.1 and 1.4)	Relevance of output 1.1. and 1.4. of JP to the attainment of MDG 2 not visible in JP documents. However, national MDG 2 has incorporated GEWE issues into curriculum development and parent-children counseling services under its policies and intervention section (source: ditto, p.30)
3. Empower the liberation of women and promote gender equality and social justice	All outcomes	Few crucial indicators relevant for attainment of MDG 3 not covered in the last JP M&E report (2.4.- 4. change of GBV cases/incidences since inception of JP, number of women who gained access to decision making through the JP and number of women and girls who have used anti-violence services under JP). Indication exists on the number of women in senior decision-making bodies of ministries. PGA conducted in few ministries to ensure gender mainstreaming in the organizational set up. Whilst relevance and contribution of JP to MDG 3 visible in terms of policies and interventions, indicators to measure the achievement not visible (source: ditto, p. 36-39)
4. Reduce infant mortality	N/A	N/A
5. Improve health of women and mothers	N/A	National MDG indicators do not take account of women and their health issue caused by VAW and GBV, instead MDG 5 is solely focusing on mothers and their health condition with regard to pregnancy. If appropriate indicators were developed for women's health issues caused also by VAW/GBV, then the relevance and contribution of the JP would have been very relevant to achieve MDG 5. Indicators to measure progress achieved in this regard are not visible. See analysis under output 1.3. and 1.4 (source: ditto, p. 45, 47).
6. Combat HIV infections (AIDS) and communicable diseases	Outcome 1 Output 1.3.	Relevance and contribution of JP to MDG 6 not established according to the JP documents. However, the counseling services provided by SAWA to victims of GBV (output 1.3.) and other forms of violence do track record of services answering questions on sexual health and prevention of STD. In addition, the interventions carried out by PCC in refugee camps on counseling services for parents and children and the observed trend that prostitution is increasing among young women and men, demonstrates that the JP has been very relevant to address MDG 6. If data produced by SAWA and PCC had been utilized to measure the effect of JP on MDG 6, then the JP would have directly contributed to the attainment of MDG 6 (source: ditto, p. 46-47).

⁴⁹The Palestinian National Authority, The National Strategy to Achieve the MDGs by 2015, Ramallah, June 2012

7. Ensure environmental protection and sustainable	Outcome 1 Output 1.4.	The activities carried out by the Women's Center in Jenin under the leadership of UNRWA were aimed at collecting the garbage produced by a nearby hospital in order to halt the spread of diseases and to protect children from infections caused by environmental degradation. This activity was very much linked to the attainment of MDG 7; however, the relevance and contribution was not visible in JP documentations (source: ditto, p.52-55)
8. Develop a global partnership for development	All outcomes	JP's contribution to the attainment of this goal is not visible. However, as soon as MoWA's M&E Unit (as of 2013) is going to provide data to MoPAD on how to mainstream gender into the sectoral strategies, the M&E of these gender sensitive sectoral strategies might support the DARP system and answer the question, how much funding is allocated for the implementation of it (source: ditto, p.60-62).

Table 4, JP's contribution to the MDGs in oPt

c) JP's contribution to the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness

The JP's contribution to the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness is, as written in the M&E reports, comprising of only some aspects, such as national ownership and whether and how the PNA is involved in the NSC etc.

Thus, as the M&E reports have not been required to answer all questions relevant to this and the Paris Declaration Monitoring Survey was first ever published in 2010 for oPt, the relevance/contribution of the JP outcomes can be summarized as follows:

Principle	JP's contribution	Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness' indicators
Ownership	Strong	<u>Indicator 1:</u> Does oPt have an operational development strategy? Although PLC is dysfunctional, MoPAD is in charge of leading the monitoring of the Palestinian National Development Plan (PNDP) 2011-2013. However, a monitoring mechanism of the PNDP is not fully in place right now. The JP contributed to the PNDP and it executed its mandate at PMC level through MoWA and at NSC level through MoPAD.
Alignment	Low	<u>Indicator 2:</u> Building reliable country systems As oPt did not undergo an assessment on this by OECD and the World Bank, the JP's contribution to this indicator can't be assessed. <u>Indicator 2a:</u> How reliable are country public financial management system? Ditto as above. <u>Indicator 2b:</u> How reliable are country procurement systems? Ditto as above. <u>Indicator 3:</u> Aligning aid flows on national priorities Not achieved, as JP through the AA UNDP has disbursed financial transactions directly through the ministries via its DIM modality, bypassing PNA's policy to pass aid through the Single Treasury Account (e.g. World Bank's PRDP Trust Fund) or through the European funding mechanism, PEGASE, which is very closely aligned with the government system.

		<p><i>Indicator 4:</i> Coordinated support to strengthen capacity At least 50% of JP's technical cooperation flow was implemented through coordinated programmes consistent with national development strategies.</p> <p><i>Indicator 5a:</i> Use of a country public financial management systems JP used UN's financial management system.</p> <p><i>Indicator 5b:</i> Use of country procurement systems: JP used UN agencies procurement procedures and systems; e.g. UNDP as the AA transferred funds directly to MoWA to cover the cost of the PS in order to organize workshops/meetings at MoWA. Hence, JP contribution in this regard was in compliance with PA's financial and procurement procedures.</p> <p><i>Indicator 6:</i> Avoiding parallel implementation structures JP has operated within the existing country institutional and administrative structures and did not undermine a strengthening of national capacities.</p> <p><i>Indicator 7:</i> Providing more predictable aid In year predictability of aid flow from JP to the government sector was guaranteed.</p> <p><i>Indicator 8:</i> Uniting aid JP in itself was aimed at uniting aid within the UN agencies in oPt. Ergo, fully achieved.</p>
Harmonization	Strong	<p><i>Indicator 9:</i> Using common arrangements JP has used the MDG-F programme based approach, its aid delivery procedures, thus reducing duplication of effort and lowering the costs associated with aid management.</p> <p><i>Indicator 10:</i> Shared analysis JP has coordinated the work of the final evaluation team with that of the Gender Task Force Evaluation Team from UNDP New York, so that duplication of analysis is avoided.</p> <p><i>Indicator 10a:</i> Joint missions Four joint missions were coordinated. a. Knowledge sharing initiative with the JP GEWE Morocco b. Shelter Management best practices (Exchange of visits between the WB and Gaza) c. Final Evaluation preparation exercise d. Documenting best practices in addressing Gender Equality</p> <p><i>Indicator 10b.</i> Joint country analytical work The JP has conducted 11 analytical works so far, however during JP implementation there was no clear baseline on this.</p>
Managing for results	Strong	<p><i>Indicator 11:</i> Do countries have results-oriented frameworks? JP contributed to the nationalization of the MDGs (The National Strategy to Achieve MDGs by 2015). JP contributed to the CSNSG. JP contributed to the Local Aid Coordination Committee Plan. JP contributed to the Gender Task Force Annual Plan. JP contributed to the UNDAF exercise towards end of 2012.</p>
Mutual accountability	Low	<p><i>Indicator 12:</i> Mutual accountability JP has not contributed to this, as MoPAD does not have a mutual aid effectiveness assessment in place.</p>

Table 5, JP's contribution to the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness

d) JP's contribution to the Delivering as One /UN reform

The data reviewed so far and the country profile of oPt⁵⁰ does not indicate that any concerted effort has been undertaken by the JP to contribute to the UN reform in oPt. In addition, the UN in oPt is only recently undergoing this reform process, which explains why the UNDAF process is taking place only recently.

Nevertheless, the "Delivering as One" approach of the JP has, despite its challenges, been a learning process for all UN agencies, which has resulted in the informal agreements of some agencies to formulate future JPs.

Hence, it is obvious that the synergistic effect of JP interventions is more pertaining to the achievement of development results than single interventions through which existing structures (whether governmental or institutional) are either duplicated or neglected.

In order to assess the JP's contribution to the UN reform, the following four principles will be scrutinized, which according to the UNDG are the criteria to contribute to the UN reform.

UN Reform	Relevance/Contribution
One Leader Low	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> UNSCO in its role as the RC has been part of the NSC and provided strategic oversight (along with MoPAD) to the JP. UNSCO has been coordinating the work of six UN agencies at the PMC level by creating a "mini PMC"⁵¹ to streamline the work of and to offer backstopping to the PS in preparation for PMC and NSC meetings, as well as to address problems arising during programme implementation that can't be solved at PMT level. However, no documentation exists on how UNSCO in its capacity as the RC has actually carried out its coordination functions. According to the UNDG webpage, a standard operational procedure/ manual exists on coordination functions, which however was not available in oPt.
One budget Low	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> JP did not contribute to the one budgetary framework or One Fund as this is non-existent in oPt. JP through the AA (UNDP) has channeled the funds to each UN agency, which in turn channeled the funds directly to the implementing partners by applying the DIM modality (except for UNFPA, which followed the NIM modality). As PLC is not functional and the national budget not assessed in order to decide whether donor money can be channeled to the national budget, the JP has not contributed to it
One programme Low	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> JP has been only recently and towards the end of the JP contributing to the development of the UNDAF, the first ever in its kind in oPt, which is going to cover the years 2014-2016.
One office Low	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The JP has not contributed to the one office concept, as UN agencies in Ramallah are located in various areas. It is not clear as yet, whether this is going to change in Ramallah, however ILO and UNDP are in walking distance, whereas UNFPA, UNRWA, UNESCO and UN Women are located in different places.

Table 6, JP's contribution to the Delivering as One/ UN reform

⁵⁰<http://www.undg.org/index.cfm?P=7>, Delivering as One: Making the UN system more coherent, effective and efficient

⁵¹Meeting with Programme Officer of UNSCO, Mr. Nicolas Rost on 15 November 2012 in the premises of UNSCO in Jerusalem.

V. Levels of analysis: Evaluation criteria and questions

Design level:

Relevance: The extent to which the objectives of a development intervention are consistent with the needs and interest of the people, the needs of the country and the Millennium Development Goals.

- a) To what extent was the design and strategy of the development intervention relevant (assess including link to MDGs, UNDAF and national priorities, stakeholder participation, national ownership design process)?
- b) How much and in what ways did the joint programme contribute to solve the (socio- economical) needs and problems identified in the design phase?
- c) To what extent was this programme designed, implemented, monitored and evaluated jointly? (see MDG-F joint programme guidelines.)
- d) To what extent was joint programming the best option to respond to development challenges stated in the programme document?
- e) To what extent the implementing partners participating in the joint programme had an added value to solve the development challenges stated in the programme document?
- f) To what extent did the joint programme have a useful and reliable M&E strategy that contributed to measure development results?
- g) To what extent did the joint programme have a useful and reliable C&A strategy?
- h) If the programme was revised, did it reflect the changes that were needed? Did the JP follow the mid-term evaluation recommendations on the programme design?

Process level

Efficiency: Extent to which resources/inputs (funds, time, human resources, etc.) have been turned into results.

- a) To what extent did the joint programme's management model (i.e. instruments; economic, human and technical resources; organizational structure; information flows; decision-making in management) was efficient in comparison to the development results attained?
- b) To what extent was the implementation of a joint programme intervention (group of agencies) more efficient in comparison to what could have been through a single agency's intervention?
- c) To what extent the governance of the fund at programme level (PMC) and at national level (NSC) contributed to efficiency and effectiveness of the joint programme? To what extent these governance structures were useful for development purposes, ownership, for working together as one? Did they enable management and delivery of outputs and results?
- d) To what extent and in what ways did the joint programme increase or reduce efficiency in delivering outputs and attaining outcomes?
- e) What type of work methodologies, financial instruments, and business practices have the implementing partners used to increase efficiency in delivering as one?
- f) What was the progress of the JP in financial terms, indicating amounts committed and disbursed (total amounts & as percentage of total) by agency?

Where there are large discrepancies between agencies, these should be analyzed.

- g) What type of (administrative, financial and managerial) obstacles did the joint programme face and to what extent have this affected its efficiency?
- h) To what extent and in what ways did the mid-term evaluation have an impact on the joint programme? Was it useful? Did the joint programme implement the improvement plan?

Ownership in the process: Effective exercise of leadership by the country's national/local partners in development interventions

- a) To what extent did the targeted population, citizens, participants, local and national authorities made the programme their own, taking an active role in it? What modes of participation (leadership) have driven the process?
- b) To what extent and in what ways has ownership or the lack of it, impacted in the efficiency and effectiveness of the joint programme?

Results level

Effectiveness: Extent to which the objectives of the development intervention have been achieved.

- a) To what extent did the joint programme contribute to the attainment of the development outputs and outcomes initially expected /stipulated in the programme document? (detailed analysis of: 1) planned activities and outputs, 2) achievement of results).
- b) To what extent and in what ways did the joint programme contribute:
 - 1. To the Millennium Development Goals at the local and national levels?
 - 2. To the goals set in the thematic window?
 - 3. To the Paris Declaration, in particular the principle of national ownership? (consider JP's policy, budgets, design, and implementation)
 - 4. To the goals of delivering as one at country level?
- c) To what extent were joint programme's outputs and outcomes synergistic and coherent to produce development results? What kinds of results were reached?
- d) To what extent did the joint programme had an impact on the targeted citizens?
- e) Have any good practices, success stories, lessons learned or transferable examples been identified? Please describe and document them.
- f) What type of differentiated effects are resulting from the joint programme in accordance with the sex, race, ethnic group, rural or urban setting of the beneficiary population, and to what extent?
- g) To what extent has the joint programme contributed to the advancement and the progress of fostering national ownership processes and outcomes (the design and implementation of National Development Plans, Public Policies, UNDAF, etc.)
- h) To what extent did the joint programme help to increase stakeholder/citizen dialogue and or engagement on development issues and policies?
- i) To what extent and in what ways did the mid-term evaluation recommendations contribute to the JP's achievement of development results?

Sustainability: Probability of the benefits of the intervention continuing in the long term.

- a) To what extent did the joint programme decision making bodies and implementing partners have undertaken the necessary decisions and course of actions to ensure the sustainability of the effects of the joint programme?

- b) At local and national level:
 - 1. To what extent did national and/or local institutions support the joint programme?
 - 2. Did these institutions show technical capacity and leadership commitment to keep working with the programme or to scale it up?
 - 3. Have operating capacities been created and/or reinforced in national partners?
 - 4. Did the partners have sufficient financial capacity to keep up the benefits produced by the programme?

- c) To what extent will the joint programme be replicable or scaled up at national or local levels?

- d) To what extent did the joint programme align itself with the National Development Strategies and/or the UNDAF?

VI. Conclusions and lessons learnt

The preceding chapters have analyzed the JP's contribution to a set of different development goals by scrutinizing aspects such as relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability as key indicators for such analysis.

Based on this, the following conclusions/ lessons learnt can be captured:

a) Relevance of the JP

- The JP was relevant and in alignment with national and sectoral plans as well as the thematic windows 2 of the MDG-F Achievement Fund.
- The JP was designed to built on and developed existing programs such as the revision of laws from a gender perspective, job creation etc.
- The JP contributed to minimizing the gaps in baseline data, research and policy papers.
- In depth joint planning and consultations were compromised for time constraints.
- Political risks and threats were not sufficiently analyzed and corresponding mitigation measures not suggested in the JP document.
- A comprehensive assessment of the main implementing ministries including their institutional capacity to achieve the programme's outcomes was neither conducted in the design phase nor in the implementation phase.

b) Efficiency of the JP

- The management and implementers were successful in implementing around 96% of the activities. The monitoring system was not designed in a way as to assess the quality of the activities. However, most stakeholders as well as direct beneficiaries interviewed have expressed that they benefitted from the activities they attended whether from trainings, the availability and use of baseline data, improved protection and services etc.
- Management had a key responsibility to consolidate the work of the UN agencies and ministries into a programme that delivers as one. More efforts should have been exerted in this respect.
- The monitoring and evaluation strategy and plan should have been designed in a way as to answer whether the activities implemented are directly contributing to the achievement of outputs and that outputs achieved are directly linked and contribute to the realization of the outcomes. The plans and reports were successful in reporting about the implementation of activities but less successful in reporting against outputs and outcomes.
- The roles and responsibilities of the NSC, PMC, PS and PMT members were not always clear. A review of the ToRs of the above was not conducted which weakened the management of the programme to a certain extent.

c) Effectiveness of JP to attain development results for various target groups

- The JP has reached out to a variety of stakeholders at the national, sub-national and local level, although the number of women at the sub-national and local level is far more exceeding that of the men, posing a threat to the

sustainability of the JP interventions due to the low ownership of men beneficiaries.

- Whilst the activities at the sub-national and local level (awareness raising, gender mainstreaming of local development planning, leadership skills e.g.) have been of a different nature than those at the national level (policy development e.g.), this imbalance does not allow to conclude how these two set of data were related to each other. This is even more striking, if both tables (direct and indirect beneficiaries) are standing alone and hence, do not reveal, which agency has exactly done what at what time with which result⁵². In addition, it does not indicate how relevant the figures are in order to answer the question which progress has been made on the decline of violence cases since the inception of the JP, how many of the indirect beneficiaries have received counseling services (outcome 1), % increase of women seats since JP implementation in the local elections as for outcome 2 (local elections held in October and November 2012) and the percentage of women who have improved their income level through interventions under outcome 3. The questions addressed in the M&E report are therefore blank. The focus on the percentage increase is process related and hence, more suitable to address the progress achieved in the aforementioned subjects.
- En detail: Outcome 1: Although measurable and visible progress has been achieved under all outputs and at all levels of JP implementation, outcome 1 is only partly achieved, as no indication exists whether and to what extent GBV and all forms of VAW against women and the girl child is de facto reduced as a result of JP implementation. This is due to the fact that an M&E system is not fully in place yet, lack of coherence of activities in order to do advocacy at the national and local level and the lack of a standardized national referral system to provide protection to the victims of VAW and GBV.
- Outcome 2: This outcome has been fairly achieved as the capacity of local government, authorities and grassroots organizations to identify plan and deliver gender-sensitive services and on MDGs are measurable and tangible. The capacity development interventions carried out by the MoLG have been of a more holistic nature (modular training course, development of procedural manual on how to hold meetings, incentivizing meetings into which women local council members were involved etc.) as well as the establishment of the NCWE, which are pillars of sustainable mechanism to initiate a change in women representation in the economic and political life of oPt. However, no indication exists on % increase of women seats since JP implementation in the local elections as for outcome 2 (local elections held in October and November 2012)
- Outcome 3: This outcome has been fairly achieved, although the change of living condition through all interventions (women cooperatives, women engineers, start up businesses through TVET) has not been measured and the question answered whether the poverty rate in the initial phase of the JP implementation has decreased towards the end of JP interventions.

⁵²UNRWA's and other UN agencies internal accumulative tables on the total number of women and men reached to date are excluded from this assumption. The statement refers more to the JP interventions as a whole.

d) JP's contribution to MDG Fund thematic window, MDGs, PD AE, UN reform and their prospects for sustainability and replicability

JP's contribution to the thematic window 2 GEWE:

1. The JP has been addressing GEWE issues according to the ToR's for the Thematic Window 2 on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment under UNDP- Spain MDG Achievement Fund⁵³ by means of:
 - Addressing three out of seven key challenges and opportunities in the sector⁵⁴, which have been formulated into the three outcomes of the JP.
 - The draft of the CSNSG as a means of integrating gender issues across sectors and to monitor and account for progress made in the context of SWAp, although the JP has not been contributing fully to this end, as MoWA is currently undergoing an institutional change process whereby GEWE results will be linked to the achievements of the CSNSG and in turn against the principles of the Paris Declaration of Aid Effectiveness and the MDG's. As oPt has been participating the very first time in the Paris Declaration Monitoring Survey in 2010, the contribution of the JP to these principles, is rather average.
 - On the contrary, the increase of capacities of the PCBS to conduct gender sensitive surveys through the application of gender disaggregated indicators, which has mounted in the publication of the most gender sensitive Violence Survey of the oPt, is a remarkable progress in this regard providing policy makers with accurate data on where and how to tackle GBV and VAW. One major finding of the recent violence survey is that types and incidences of violence cases are much higher in refugee camps in WB than in rural or urban areas.
 - With regard to GRB, whilst five ministries have been adhering to it, the national budget has not applied GRB tools per se due to the non functionality of the PLC, although the latest M&E report indicates that since the inception of the JP a 1,5% increase of the national budget is allocated for GEWE policies reaching all in all 3% of the national budget triggered solely by the JP. In order to increase this amount further, MoWA continues to reach out to other ministries by signing MoU with them.

⁵³Terms of Reference for Thematic Window 2 on Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment, UNDP- Spain MDG Achievement Fund, 25 April 2007

⁵⁴These are: 1. Promoting women's equal access to labor markets, sustainable employment and adequate labor protection, 2. Eliminating all forms of discrimination and violence against women and the girl child, including ending impunity and by ensuring the protection of civilians, in particular women and the girl child, during and after armed conflicts in accordance with the obligations of States under humanitarian law and international human rights law and 3. Promoting increased representation of women in government decision-making bodies, including through their equal opportunity to participate fully in the political process.

2. JP's contribution to the achievement of the national MDG's

- The relevance and contribution of the JP to the MDGs goes beyond MDG 1 and 3, which however has not been adequately analyzed/measured in any of the documentation reviewed so far. The M&E progress reports developed on part of the JP, the individual final evaluations, exist and sustainability strategies and other documents have been able to identify and establish coherence between the JP and its contributions to MDG 1, 2, 3, 6, 7 and 8 at the national level. This is a severe omission and a success story at the same time.
- As UNFPA's interventions under outcome 1, upgrading the HIS in order to accommodate GBV cases in hospitals with regard to women, mothers and pregnant women, has not been followed through, the relevance of the JP to MDG 5 and 6 was not visible.
- In general, none of the JP partners have actively contributed to "raise awareness of the community of the dangers of early marriage and to improve sexual education among young adolescents" as stipulated under MDG 5 of the Strategy to reach the MDGs by 2015 in oPt (p. 45). This is a severe omission. The cases reported by PCC and SAWA demonstrates very clearly that sexual education/health and the prevention of early marriage have been pivotal to be addressed by the JP.
- Although HIV/AIDS cases in oPt are not a priority yet, as reported in the same Strategy, the migration of male labors to the urban centers (see JP Document from 2008), the cases reported by PCC and SAWA and the continuous economic isolation of oPt, which might lead to a further increase of migrant workers to the urban centers, bears the risk that this might become a priority in future, which however has not been addressed by the JP yet.
- In short: The JP has been very relevant to the attainment of almost all MDGs, however, it contributed more to MDG 1 and 3 and to a much lesser effect to the other MDGs.

JP's contribution to the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness

- The JP has, despite the fact that oPt has been comparatively newly engaged in the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness Monitoring Survey, contributed with an average result to the fulfillment of the principles. This is a success story, in particular, as the JP M&E reports did not require the JP to contribute to all principles. As such, the JP has gone beyond this requirement.

JP's contribution to the UN reform/ delivering as one approach

- The JP has not been able to contribute to the UN reform, as the UN reform in oPt is in its infant stages. No indication was provided by UNSCO as the Resident Coordinator of UN in oPt, what and how the UN reform or the delivery as one was proceeding in oPt compared to other UN interventions in the region. Despite this, the JP has realized the significance of JP as the most efficient and effective way to initiate change.

VII. Best Practices/ Success stories

Success stories and best practices have been visible across all outputs and outcome levels, although they have been more visible at the national than the local level, despite the fact that the needs to address GBV, VAW, increase of women representation and equal access to women to the labor market were more important at the local level.

Based on the findings, the JP initiated a change on GEWE issues through the following best practices/ success stories:

- Through the development and endorsement of the *Violence Against Women (VAW) Strategy*, which was enacted in January 2011 by the Ministers Cabinet,
- The *implementation of the VAW Strategy through the line ministries* by developing action plans,
- In support of the above, the *draft of the Cross- Sectoral National Strategy on Gender (CSNSG) 2011-2013*, the very first in its kind advocating to mainstream gender across all sectors in oPt,
- The development of the *Media and Advocacy Strategy* on GEWE issues for the very first time in oPt,
- The *institutionalization of the national Gender Machinery towards the end of the JP* by means of establishing a *Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E) Unit within the Ministry of Women Affairs (MoWA)*, being in charge of developing and monitoring national gender indicators in close cooperation with the Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics (PCBS) and the Development Assistance and Reform Platform (DARP) of the Ministry of Planning and Administrative Development (MoPAD), whereby gender mainstreaming can be initiated through a three tier process: by linking the national level with that of the sub-national and local (tawassol) and vice versa,
- The *publication of the most gender sensitive “violence survey”*, the PCBS has ever published through capacity development interventions by the JP, hence enabling policy-makers to address violence cases in a much more targeted and comprehensive way,
- The *development of guidelines for Family Protection Units of the Police*, the curricula to eliminate VAW in schools and the one for lawyers, judges and prosecutors on how to deal with cases of VAW, which were institutionalized within the relevant departments.
- The establishment of the *National Committee on Women’s Employment (NCWE)* as an advisory body to the Minister of Labor. The NCWE was endorsed by the Cabinet of Ministers and is comprising of the Ministry of Labor (MoL), Ministry of Women’s Affairs (MoWA), Palestinian General Federation of Trade Unions (PGFTU), Development Center of Birzeit University and the Center for Democracy and Women’s Rights. Its mandate is to advocate for

gender sensitive policies, legislations, capacity building interventions, social safety net for women workers and a healthy work environment.

- *The JP allowed UN agencies to develop more holistic interventions in the field of GBV, VAW and GEWE. It also increased the organizations' technical expertise to mainstream gender within their programmatic areas.* UNRWA, for instance, adopted GEWE, GBV and VAW within its programmatic areas for the very first time in oPt, rightly so, as violence cases are more prevalent in the refugee camps, one finding the latest violence survey came up with.
- *The outreach of the JP went beyond the contribution to MDG 1 and MDG 3;* in fact it contributed to 6 out of 8 MDGs at the micro, meso and macro level, thus making the JP a success story.
- *The contribution of the JP via MoPAD to support the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness is rated as medium,* although oPt has been involved in the Paris Declaration Monitoring Survey for the very first time only two years ago. This is an average result.

VIII. Recommendations

Based on the preceding chapters, the following recommendations are proposed in order to maximize the synergistic impact of future JPs with regard to their sustainability and replicability at the local, sub-national and national level.

In this regard, proposed recommendations herein are to be regarded as pillars of sustainability as aptly stipulated in the exit and sustainability strategy of the JP.

The Strategy has fully recognized the importance of capacity development interventions and strengthening of institutional development processes as the trigger of change.

Thus, the following recommendations are proposed to continuously support the strengthening of national and local mechanisms:

With regard to:

Relevance

1. Upon hiring the proposal writer, a period of at least two months should be designated to the design phase and the writing of the JP document. This period is the minimum required time to ensure proper participation of the main stakeholders.
2. To conduct an in depth capacity development needs assessment of the capacities of the main implementing ministries at the design phase, in order to better address the structural / systematic weaknesses that exist within the PA institutions so as to ensure sustainability and impact. UNDP's and UN Women's wide repository of knowledge products on issues such as capacity development within public institutions/ for gender mainstreaming should be continuously utilized for this purpose in order to design a capacity development response strategy paper based also on the previous interventions. ILO's PGA Strategy should flow into the paper as well, a) in order to take up these relevant and appropriate success stories further in a possible future JP, b) avoiding costs and c) make the design phase more efficient and effective.
3. The design of the programme should be more results based oriented. The Results Based Management (RBM) tool of the UN should be more adhered to and the results and outputs as accurately as possible worded. The activities should then be designed to lead to the desired results, outputs and outcomes.

Efficiency

4. The monitoring should exceed the implementation of activities into monitoring and evaluating the achievements of outputs. Here reporting and evaluating on the problems and challenges faced by the implementers should be elaborated to include main discussion points and suggested solutions.
5. A proper review of the ToRs of the NSC, PMC, PS and PMT should be done at the inception phase in order to elaborate whether the proposed governance structure is a) applicable to the current context and b) by taking into consideration local needs and existing capacities. This is particularly relevant,

when the general and generic nature of the implementation guidelines is taken into consideration. Therefore, in order to contextualize the ToRs to the specific needs of joint programmes, it is advised that all ToRs be revised and reviewed at the inception phase.

6. The UN agencies financial systems should be adjusted to produce disaggregated financial data on the West Bank and Gaza by showing the amounts disbursed in Gaza and the West Bank separately, so that financial imbalances favoring West Bank over Gaza are not occurring.
7. A technical review of the budget- as recommended in the midterm evaluation- remains also valid in the final evaluation. It should be done prior to the approval of the application and include an analysis of the annual allocations. Further, it recommended that the review should also appraise the accuracy of the costs. The evaluation specifically recommends the use of the Activity-Based Costing (ABC) method in preparing budgets, because this method is consistent with the concepts in RBM. The evaluation is also not recommending the use of the commitment rate method for fund releases in JP that may be supported by the MDG-F in the future.

Effectiveness

8. In order to reach out to all direct and indirect beneficiaries in an equal manner and to support the achievement of all outputs and outcomes in future JP interventions, it is recommended that the Media and Advocacy Strategy is developed at the outset of program implementation (design phase). The capacity development strategy paper (see recommendation 2) should entail what type of messages, advocacy campaigns and strategy should be used in this regard by making the JP spirit more visible. The current Strategy could be amended accordingly in order to avoid costs.
This new Media and Advocacy Strategy should include more men, youth male, children and marginalized groups into awareness raising sessions on GBV, VAW, women's rights etc. with the close cooperation of MoEHE and MoSA, as the imbalance of direct and indirect beneficiaries at the national, sub-national and local levels have demonstrated that the JP has been favoring women over men.
9. Establishment and continuous strengthening of the M&E Unit within MoWA to monitor gender equity goals at the national, sub-national and local level (tawassol) and to provide support to MoPAD so that all sectoral strategies are gender mainstreamed and monitored based on harmonized national gender indicators. For this intervention, MoLG should revise its sectoral strategy as of 2013 in order to incorporate the role of MoLG to support the development of local indicators on gender and all MDGs. All UN agencies should support the MoLG in order to do so by providing technical expertise on what type of and how to develop local indicators relevant to achieve all MDGs in oPt.
For the further fulfillment of the national MDGs, the following UN agencies (in close cooperation with ministries and CSOs) should be engaged in the following interventions:

10. Strengthening of and aligning the referral system created by MoH/ MoSA and Family Protection Unit of Police (MoI) with that of UNRWA.

Even though UNRWA is operating under a different legal environment to which the one of the national institutions do not apply, the further institutionalization of the referral system within UNRWA is pivotal to address the highest amount of GBV and any other type of violence cases in the future. Alliances should be build with the EU funded projects on the establishment of a national referral system.

11. Gaza

The no contact policy with the existing de facto government and public institutions in Gaza should be revised, as the humanitarian as well as the developmental needs of Gaza is serious. Gaza has been suffering under Israel's military blockade since 2006 and has survived two devastating military offensives.

In addition and operationally, the UN should consolidate their inter agency relations and implementation with clear managerial structures. Flexibility with budgets and programs as the needs in Gaza vary rapidly and priorities are shifted with little predictability.

Finally, more focus on building the capacities of public sector organizations to ensure sustainability. There should be stronger networking on the ground to maximize benefit and impact.

Proposed future JP interventions to accelerate the attainment of the MDGs in oPt

MDG 1	<u>ILO and UNRWA</u> should continue their income generation projects (TVET, SME, cooperatives and women engineers placement projects) in the next phase, by putting more emphasize on the integration of women and marginalized groups (youth criminals, youth that are trafficking etc.) into the local labor market and measuring the impact of such interventions by developing local indicators with regard to improvement of income, decline of poverty rate, increase of GDP in oPt, social coherence (differentiation into Gaza and WB) through JP intervention. These indicators could be developed with MoLG, MoSA, MoEHE and MoL through a bottom up approach and channeled through the relevant sectoral strategies (Employment, Social Protection, Agriculture and Economic Development). Emphasize should be also given to standardization and equalization of certification received by youth criminals with that of students certified by the MoEHE. UN agencies should facilitate this process by enabling MoSA, MoEHE and MoL to develop a policy paper to take action in this regard.
MDG 2	<u>UNFPA and UNRWA</u> should work closely with MoEHE and MoSA to contribute to the further development of school curriculum, training of teachers etc. by integrating awareness raising and prevention of GBV, VAW and other types of violence into school curriculum. PCC, MaDAD and other CSO's working within the education sector and in refugee camps should be further involved in the actual implementation by providing continuous support in parents-children counseling, counseling of teachers dealing with violence cases and prevention of VAW. The consultation of the CSO's for the further development of the Education and Social Protection Strategy is pivotal, from which the M&E Unit of

	MoWA will benefit too.
MDG 3	<p>As this goal is very holistic and cross cutting, <u>each UN agency should and could contribute to this</u> as done under the current JP. However, the</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Establishment of a full fledged and standardized national referral system (MoSA, MoH, UNWomen, UNFPA), b) Improvement of the legal standing of the Sharia law (personal status law, setting up Gender Units in the court administration, education of female lawyers and judges by interventions of UNDP, UNWomen, BZU, MoJ), c) Design of an advocacy campaign targeting more youth male, marginalized groups at the local level (UNFPA, UNRWA and UNESCO), d) The fulfillment of NCWE's role (ILO, UNDP, MoL), e) The further support of the Family Protection Units of the Police (UNWomen, UNFPA, UNDP, MoI, MoJ) and f) The further revision of laws (election, labor, women representation by ILO, UNWomen, UNDP, MoL, MoJ, MoLG) <p>are major interventions that should be addressed in future joint projects that will support the attainment of MDG 3.</p>
MDG 4	The national indicators developed under this goal are very vague, although the causes for infant mortality are plausible. Therefore, this MDG goal should be further elaborated at the national level under the leadership of UNFPA, WHO and UNICEF.
MDG 5	<u>UNFPA, MoH and MoSA</u> should improve the HIS system of the MoH by developing more appropriate indicators on GBV and various types of violence as part of a standardized national referral system. <u>UNRWA</u> should be involved in this intervention by conducting awareness raising sessions on early dangers of early marriage and sexual education/ safe sex consulting with PCC and SAWA.
MDG 6	<u>UNFPA and UNRWA</u> should address this goal; even if HIV/AIDS is currently not a serious threat in oPt, by providing awareness raising sessions on sexual education/ safe sex in close alignment with the activities under MDG 5.
MDG 7	All UN agencies can contribute to the achievement of this goal by involving ministries such as MoH, Ministry of Agriculture, MoWA, Water Authority and CSO's to integrate environmental indicators into the programmatic areas. As <u>UNRWA</u> covers currently 19 refugee camps in WB and 8 camps in Gaza they could initiate and support more projects in this regard, as shown in the case of the refugee camp in Jenin.
MDG 8	<u>UNWomen</u> , MoWA, PCBS, <u>UNDP</u> and MoPAD should contribute to this by upgrading the M&E Unit within MoWA, reviewing and modification of all sectoral strategies (2011-2013) from a gender perspective and the further support of the DARP system to improve oPt's contribution to the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness Principles and the UN reform process in the wider sense.

IX. Annexes

Annex 1- Terms of Reference of the final evaluation consultancy

The MDG-F Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment Programme in the oPt is a joint initiative implemented in the occupied Palestinian territory by six UN Agencies, namely UN Women, UNDP/PAPP, ILO, UNESCO, UNFPA, UNRWA, and Palestinian Authority ministries led by the Ministry of Women's Affairs (MoWA) thanks to the generous funding from the Government of Spain. The Programme began in 2009 and will end in September 2012

A result oriented monitoring and evaluation strategy is under implementation in order to track and measure the overall impact of this historic contribution to the MDGs and to multilateralism. The MDG-F M&E strategy is based on the principles and standards of UNEG and OEDC/DAC regarding evaluation quality and independence. The strategy builds on the information needs and interests of the different stakeholders while pursuing a balance between their accountability and learning purposes. The strategy's main objectives are:

- To support joint programmes to attain development results;
- To determine the worth and merit of joint programmes and measure their contribution to the 3 MDG-F objectives, MDGS, Paris Declaration and Delivering as one; and
- To obtain and compile evidence based knowledge and lessons learned to scale up and replicate successful development interventions.

Under the MDG-F M&E strategy and Programme Implementation Guidelines, each programme team is responsible for designing an M&E system, establishing baselines for (quantitative and qualitative) indicators and conducting a final evaluation with a summative focus.

Duties and Responsibilities

Objectives of the Assignment:

Final evaluations are summative in nature and seek to:

- Measure to what extent the joint programme has fully implemented their activities, delivered outputs and attained outcomes and specifically measuring development results;
- Generate substantive evidence based knowledge, on one or more of the MDG-F thematic windows by identifying best practices and lessons learned that could be useful to other development interventions at national (scale up) and international level (replicability).

Scope of Work:

This final evaluation has the following specific objectives:

- Measure to what extent the joint programme has contributed to solve the needs and problems identified in the design phase;
- To measure the joint programme's degree of implementation, efficiency and quality delivered on outputs and outcomes, against what was originally

- planned or subsequently officially revised;
- Measure to what extent the joint programme has attained development results to the targeted population, beneficiaries, participants whether individuals, communities, institutions, etc.
- To measure the joint programme contribution to the objectives set in their respective specific thematic windows as well as the overall MDG fund objectives at local and national level. (MDGs, Paris Declaration and Accra Principles and UN reform);
- To identify and document substantive lessons learned and good practices on the specific topics of the thematic window, MDGs, Paris Declaration, Accra Principles and UN reform with the aim to support the sustainability of the joint programme or some of its components.

Responsibilities:

The national and international consultants involved in the final evaluation will be selected jointly between UNDP and the implementing partners. UNDP/PAPP will help to facilitate the final evaluation exercise and provide support where feasible.

The programme coordinator as evaluation manager will have the following functions:

- Contribute to the finalization of the evaluation TOR;
- Provide executive and coordination support to the reference group;
- Provide the evaluators with administrative support and required data;
- Liaise with and respond to the commissioners of evaluation;
- Connect the evaluation team with the wider programme unit, senior management and key evaluation stakeholders, and ensure a fully inclusive and transparent approach to the evaluation;
- Review the inception report and the draft evaluation report(s);
- Ensure that adequate funding and human resources are allocated for the evaluation.

The Programme Management Committee that will function as the evaluation reference group, this group will comprise the representatives of the major stakeholders in the joint programme:

- Review the draft evaluation report and ensure final draft meets the required quality standards;
- Facilitating the participation of those involved in the evaluation design;
- Identifying information needs, defining objectives and delimiting the scope of the evaluation;
- Providing input and participating in finalizing the evaluation Terms of Reference;
- Facilitating the evaluation team's access to all information and documentation relevant to the intervention, as well as to key actors and informants who should participate in interviews, focus groups or other information-gathering methods;
- Oversee progress and conduct of the evaluation the quality of the process and the products;

- Disseminating the results of the evaluation.

The MDG-F Secretariat that will function as a quality assurance member of the evaluation in cooperation with the commissioner of the evaluation:

- Review and provide advice on the quality the evaluation process as well as on the evaluation products (comments and suggestions on the adapted TOR, draft reports, final report of the evaluation) and options for improvement.

The evaluation team will conduct the evaluation study by:

- Fulfilling the contractual arrangements in line with the TOR, UNEG/OECD norms and standards and ethical guidelines; this includes developing an evaluation matrix as part of the inception report, drafting reports, and briefing the commissioner and stakeholders on the progress and key findings and recommendations, as needed.

All payments will be issued upon certification of UNDP MDG-GEWE-JP Programme Manager and Programme Associate.

Deliverables:

The consultant is responsible for submitting the following deliverables to the commissioner and the manager of the evaluation:

- Inception Report

This report will be 10 to 15 pages in length and will propose the methods, sources and procedures to be used for data collection. It will also include a proposed timeline of activities and submission of deliverables. The desk study report will propose initial lines of inquiry about the joint programme. This report will be used as an initial point of agreement and understanding between the consultant and the evaluation managers.

Outline of the inception report

0. Introduction
1. Background to the evaluation: objectives and overall approach
2. Identification of main units and dimensions for analysis and possible areas for research
3. Main substantive and financial achievements of the joint programme
4. Methodology for the compilation and analysis of the information
5. Criteria to define the mission agenda, including “field visits”

- Draft Final Report

The draft final report will contain the same sections as the final report (described in the next paragraph) and will be 20 to 30 pages in length. This report will be shared among the evaluation reference group. It will also contain an executive report of no more than 5 pages that includes a brief description of the joint programme, its context and current situation, the purpose of the evaluation, its methodology and its main

findings, conclusions and recommendations. The draft final report will be shared with the evaluation reference group to seek their comments and suggestions. This report will contain the same sections as the final report, described below.

- Final Evaluation Report

The final report will be 20 to 30 pages in length. It will also contain an executive summary of no more than 5 pages that includes a brief description of the joint programme, its context and current situation, the purpose of the evaluation, its methodology and its major findings, conclusions and recommendations. The final report will be sent to the evaluation reference group.

Outline of the draft and final evaluation reports

1. Cover Page

2. Executive Summary (include also Glossary page)

3. Introduction

- Background, goal and methodological approach
- Purpose of the evaluation
- Methodologies used in the evaluation
- Constraints and limitations on the study conducted

4. Description of the development interventions carried out

- Detailed description of the development intervention undertaken: description and judgment on implementation of outputs delivered (or not) and outcomes attained as well as how the programme worked in comparison to the theory of change developed for the programme.

5. Levels of Analysis: Evaluation criteria and questions (all questions included in the TOR must be addressed and answered)

6. Conclusions and lessons learned (prioritized, structured and clear)

7. Recommendations

8. Annexes

Payment Terms:

Payments are based upon output, i.e. upon delivery of the services specified in the TOR:

- Completion of the inception report – 25% - 15 days of the submission of all JP documents and signing the contract.
- Completion of the draft final report – 50% - Within 20 days after the completion of the filed visit.
- Completion of the final evaluation report -25%- Within 10 days after reception of the draft final report with comments.

Evaluation:

Preliminary examination

UNDP/PAPP will examine the Proposals to determine whether they are complete, and whether they are substantially responsive to the qualification and experience minimum requirements. A Proposal determined as not substantially responsive will be rejected by UNDP/PAPP and may not subsequently be made responsive by the Applicant by correction of the non-conformity.

Detailed examination

A two-stage procedure is utilized in evaluating the proposals, with evaluation of the technical proposals prior to any financial proposal being requested and compared.

The technical proposals are evaluated on the basis of its responsiveness to the Terms of Reference (TOR).

Below please find the evaluation form for the technical proposals. The obtainable number of points specified for each evaluation criterion indicates the relative significance of weight of the item in the overall evaluation process.

Evaluation Criteria

Level of Expertise:

- Experience in conducting final evaluations (five to ten – 10; 10 to 15 – 15; >15 years projects – 15 points);
- Experience in similar projects of comparable size, budget, complexity and technical specialty (< two projects – 5; two to four projects – 10; > five projects – 15 points);
- Experience in developing countries under comparable conditions (1 to 2 countries – 5; 3 to 5 – 8; > 6 countries – 5points)
- Knowledge of the MENA region (5 points).
- Total (40 Scores)

Proposed Methodology:

To what degree does the applicant understand the task? Have the important aspects of the task been addressed? Is the scope of task well defined and does it correspond to the TOR? Is the conceptual framework adopted appropriate for the task? (25 points)

Is the presentation of the work-plan clear and is the sequence of activities and the planning logical, realistic and promise efficient implementation to the project? (25 points)

Total (50 Scores)

Reputation/Credibility:

Quality of recommendation letters (10p)

Total (10 scores)

In the Second Stage, UNDP/PAPP will request Financial Proposals from applicants who attained the minimum technical score of 70% of the obtainable score of 100

points in the evaluation of the technical proposals.

IMPORTANT: PLEASE DO NOT SUBMIT YOUR FINANCIAL PROPOSAL. THE FINANCIAL PROPOSALS WILL BE REQUESTED AT A LATER STAGE FROM APPLICANTS WHO ATTAINED THE MINIMUM TECHNICAL SCORES.

Lump Sum Approach

The financial proposal shall specify a total lump sum amount. The total lump sum shall be all-inclusive and shall take into account various expenses incurred by the Consultant/Contractor during the contract period and shall form the amount of the resulted contract between the winning Consultant/Contractor and UNDP. No other entitlements will be considered after submission of financial proposals.

The financial proposal shall include a breakdown of this lump sum amount (number of anticipated working days, all envisaged travel (such as but not limited to all travel to join duty station/repatriation travel), per diems/daily allowances).

Payments are based upon output, i.e. upon delivery of the services specified in the TOR.

1. Award of Individual Contract

The procuring UNDP entity reserves the right to accept or reject any Proposal, and to annul the solicitation process and reject all Proposals at any time prior to award of contract, without incurring any liability to the affected applicant or any obligation to inform the affected applicant or applicants of the ground for the UNDP's action.

The UNDP procuring entity will award the Individual Contract to the First Lowest Technically Responsive Candidate.

Competencies

- Fluency in written and spoken English;
- Excellent report writing skills;
- Ability to communicate in one or both of the local languages is an asset;
- Proficiency in Microsoft Office: Word and Excel;
- Ability to provide orientation and guidance to staff;
- Effective planning and management skills;
- Able to communicate with diverse audiences;
- Effective training, facilitation and presentation skills;
- Strong inter-personal and teamwork ability;
- Willing to travel to West Bank and Gaza;
- Ability to obtain necessary permits for entry/exit to Gaza.

Required Skills and Experience

Education:

- PhD in Economics, Social Policy Analysis, preferably a combination of academic and technical experience in both social and economic fields. A master's degree and at least 10 years of experience would also be acceptable.

Experience:

- A minimum seven years of experience in the areas of gender equality, economic development, poverty analysis, development and planning, strategic planning of the projects focused on economic development through providing evidence-based policy advice;
- Minimum five years in practical experience in organization management, strategic planning of associations and public organizations at the national and regional level;
- Experience in formulating development strategies and policies;
- Excellent public speaking and presentation skills
- Excellent writing, editing, and oral communication skills in English; and
- Ability to meet deadlines and prioritize multiple tasks.

UNDP is committed to achieving workforce diversity in terms of gender, nationality and culture. Individuals from minority groups, indigenous groups and persons with disabilities are equally encouraged to apply. All applications will be treated with the strictest confidence.

Documents comprising the Technical Proposal

Interested individual consultant must submit the following documents/information, which comprises the Technical Proposal:

- 1) Provide personal CV including all qualifications and past experience in similar projects.
- 2) Explain why you are the most suitable for the work.
- 3) Provide a brief methodology and/or work-plan on how you will approach and conduct the work.
- 4) Kindly upload the following documents:
 - Two (2) up-to-date recommendation letters.
 - Submit sample report/project document or relevant Deliverables

Annex II

Time schedule for the field visit from 4-22 November 2012

5 November, MON	MDG-F GEWE JP PS MoWA, Directorate MoWA, H.E. Minister MoWA, Directorate
6 November, TUE	NCWE (MoL, MoWA, BZU, PGFTU) MoL, Directorate on Cooperative Extension Unit MoL, Directorate of General Affairs MoL, Inspectorate Department MoL, Gender Unit Union of Cooperatives of Associations for Saving and Credit
7 November, WED	Amari camp, UNRWA Jenin refugee camp, Women Center Salfid refuges camp, Disabled Center Sabaya Women´s Center, Jerusalem Amari camp, beneficiaries from film making project Amari camp, Head of LAC
8 November, THU	WATC PCC Helpline SAWA
9 November, FRI	UNFPA - Jerusalem
11 November, SUN	PCBS MoLG, Gender Unit
12 November, MON	MoPAD Faculty of Law, BZU
13 November, TUE	Directorate of LG, Nablus Women´s Cooperative Qabalan, Nablus refugee camp Disabled Center Tulkarim
14 November, WED	UNESCO MADAD MIFTAH and PARC MoH MoSA
15 November, THU	ILO - Jerusalem UN Women - Jerusalem AECID – Jerusalem

	UNSCO – Jerusalem
16 November, FRI	UNRWA - Jerusalem UNDP - Jerusalem
17 November, SAT	Women Cooperative Beit Anan – Jerusalem UNRWA food processing project – Hebron Family Protection Unit, Police – Bethlehem Women Cooperative for Handicraft – Bethlehem
19 November, MON	BZU Conference
21 November, WED	Presentation of preliminary findings to ERG

Evaluation Reference Group members

#	Name:	Organization	Email address
1	Hanna George Nakhleh	MDG-Secretariat – Evaluation Manager	Hanna.nakhleh@undp.org
2	Carol Ziadeh	UNDP-PAPP	Carol.ziadeh@undp.org
3	Siham Rashid	UN women	siham.rashid@unwomen.org
4	SuheirSawalha	UNRWA	S.SAWALHA@UNRWA.ORG
5	Rawand Al-Madmouj	ILO	al-madmouj@ilo.org
6	MajdBeltaji	UNESCO	m.beltaji@unesco.org
7	Sana YasinAsi	UNFPA	asi@unfpa.org
8	SumoodYassein	Ministry of Women's Affairs	ysumood@yahoo.com
9	ImanAssaf	Ministry of Labor	imanassaf1@hotmail.com
10	HananEmseeh	Ministry of Local Governance	hananemseeh@gmail.com
11	HebaZayyan	UN women – Gaza	heba.zayyan@unwomen.org
12	Said Abughazza	UNDP-PAPP-Gaza	said.abughazza@undp.org
13	HishamObaid	UN women – Gaza	hisham.obaid@unwomen.org
14	Natali Abu Shahla	UNFPA-Gaza	abushahla@unfpa.org
15	Hind El Arabi	UNRWA-Gaza	h.el-arabi@unrwa.org

PMC members

#	Name:	Organization	Email address
1	Nicolas Rost	UNSCO	rosth@un.org
2	Covadonga Bertrand	UNDP-PAPP	covadonga.bertrand@undp.org
3	Alia Elyassir	UN women	alia.elyassir@unwomen.org
4	Hanan Z. Al Jayyousi	UNRWA	h.jayyousi@unrwa.org
5	RashaElshurafa	ILO	elshurafa@ilo.org
6	Derek Elias	UNESCO	d.elias@unesco.org
7	ZiadYaish	UNFPA	yaish@unfpa.org
8	FatinaWathaefi	Ministry of Women's Affairs	f_wathaefi@yahoo.com

Annex IV

Key References

1. MDG-F GEWE, Joint Program Document, 2008
2. MDG-F GEWE JP, Mid Term Evaluation Report, January 2011
3. MDG-F GEWE JP, Minutes of the PMC meetings
4. MDG-F GEWE JP, Minutes of the NSC meetings
5. MDG-F GEWE JP, Annual Work Plans
6. MDG-F GEWE JP, M&E Reports
7. MDG-F GEWE JP, Exit and Sustainability Plan, May 2012
8. MDG-F GEWE JP, Monitoring Plan, May 2012

9. MDG-F Achievement Fund, MDG-F Implementation Guidelines, July 2012
10. MDG-F Achievement Fund, Terms of Reference for Thematic Window 2 on Gender Equality and Women’s Empowerment, 25 April 2007
11. MDG- Achievement Fund, Knowledge Management for Gender Equality and Women’s Empowerment, Achieving MDG-3, Proposal for Knowledge Sharing Agreements for Joint Programs of the MDG-F Gender Window
12. MDG-F Achievement Fund, ILO, Report of the main results of a field study of the reality of the relation between the producers and users of the labor statistical data in the Palestinian Territory, Ramallah 2010

13. ILO, Executive Summary of the Participatory Gender Audit Strategy, November 2012
14. Presentation of UNRWA, GEWE in oPt- JP (2008-2011), Challenges, Lessons Learned and Achievements
15. Prodanovic, Marina - Lessons Learned and Key Recommendations; MDG Fund – Joint Programme Proposal Process, October 2007
16. UNDP, Public perceptions of Palestinian justice and security institutions, March 2012
17. UNDP, A review of Palestinian Legislation from a women’s rights perspective, March 2012
18. UN Interoffice Memorandum from 1 April 2008
19. MaDAD, Manual Empowering and disseminating of the policy of reducing violence and gender based violence, 14 October 2012
20. MIFTAH Activities Report 2011, oPt
21. Report published by the Palestinian Independent Commission for Human Rights, 2012/08/03, http://www.upi.com/Top_news/World-News/2012/08/03/Protesters-ask-crackdown-on-honor-killings/UPI-62991343996034/

22. Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics, Policy paper on “Women in public life” funded by the MDG-F GEWE, 2011, oPt
23. Birzeit University, Report on the Evaluation Workshop of the Training Programme on Integrating Gender Criteria in the Work of Judges, Prosecutors, Lawyers and Local Government Staff, 5 June 2012, oPt

24. The Palestinian National Authority, Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics, Violence Survey in the Palestinian Society 2011, Main Findings, Ramallah, March 2012
25. The Palestinian National Authority, The National Strategy to Achieve the MDGs by 2015, Ramallah, June 2012
26. The Palestinian National Authority, Medium Term Development Plan 2005-2007, oPt
27. The Palestinian National Authority, Palestinian Reform and Development Plan 2008-2011, oPt
28. The Palestinian National Authority, Ministry of Planning and Administrative Development, Results of the 2010 Paris Declaration Monitoring Survey for the occupied Palestinian territory, September 2012
29. The Palestinian National Authority, Ministry of Labor and ILO, Decent Work in the Palestinian Territories, September 2011
30. The Palestinian National Authority, Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics, Women and Men in Palestine, Issues and Statistics, Ramallah 2011
31. The Palestinian National Authority, Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics, Palestine in Figures 2011, Ramallah, May 2012
32. The Palestinian National Authority, Ministry of Women's Affairs and UN Women, Cross-Sectoral National Gender Strategy 2011-2013
33. <http://www.undg.org/index.cfm?P=7>, Delivering as One: Making the UN system more coherent, effective and efficient
34. http://www.mopad.pna.ps/en/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=35&Itemid=138 (Sectors Strategy 2011-2013)
35. United Nations Evaluation Group, Standards for Evaluation in the UN System, April 2005