

United Nations Trust Fund to End Violence against Women

## **Project Evaluation Report**

Mongolia

Project : **Strengthen the implementation of laws on Violence  
Against Women in Mongolia**  
(2006-2008)

Implemented by:

Centre for Citizens' Alliance (CCA)  
Centre for Human Rights Development (CHRD)  
National Centre Against Violence (NCAV)

**Evaluation Report**  
**by Vanessa Griffen, Phd.**

**October 2009**

## Contents

<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>4</b>
1.1 Background	4
1.2 Aims of the project	4
1.3. Project objectives	4
<b>2. Evaluation - Terms of Reference</b>	<b>5</b>
2.1. In the Terms of Reference	5
2.2. Outputs expected	5
<b>3. Methodology</b>	<b>5</b>
3.1. Field visit to Mongolia	5
3.2 Interviews	5
3.3 Interview method	6
3.4 . Desk review of documents and materials	
<b>4. Outputs expected from the Evaluation</b>	<b>7</b>
4.1 Outputs as presented in the TORS	7
<b>5. Output 1 – Assessment/evaluation report based on findings of key documents, materials and reports related to the project</b>	<b>8</b>
5.1 Documents and materials assessed	8
5.2 List of documents and outputs reviewed	8
<b>6. Output 2 – Assessment/Evaluation report of the project, activities and accomplishments based on interviews with key stakeholders</b>	<b>14</b>
6.1 Project activities and objectives	14
6.2 Views of the project activities and accomplishments – NGO implementers	15
6.3 Key activities – views and assessment of implementers	15
6.4 Overall assessment of the project by the Project implementers – CCA, CHRD and NCAV	15
<b>7.0 Project activities and accomplishments - Views of other stakeholders</b>	<b>21</b>
7.1 State Agencies	21
7. 2. Key Government Ministries	23
7.3 UN Agencies	26
7.4 Funders/Financial Institutions	28
7.5 Other Women’s Non-Government Organisations	29
7.6 Other project activities and outputs - special verifications of impact	31

7.7 Evaluation Conclusion on the views of other stakeholders	33
<b>8.0 Output 2 - Evaluation Conclusion - Assessment of Project activities and Achievements</b>	<b>34</b>
8.1. Achievement of short, middle and long term objectives	35
8.2. Newly developed research work and activities	38
8.3. Achievement of goals and objectives of UNIFEM Trust Fund	38
8.4. Combating VAW in Mongolia	38
8.5. Good Practice models	38
<b>9. Recommendations from the Evaluation</b>	<b>39</b>
9.1. Sustaining the project	39
9.2. Programmatic approach	39
9.3. Broader Funding sources	39
9.4 Support for NGO Leadership on VAW	39
9.5 VAW Issues	40
9.6. Dissemination of project information	40
9.7 Maintaining the local level networks	41
9.8 State budget support	42

## 1. Introduction

### 1.1 Background

The project aimed to address the most prevalent forms of violence against women in Mongolia, with a focus on the following four areas: domestic violence, human trafficking, sexual harassment and rape. The implementing organizations were: the Centre for Citizens' Alliance(CCA), Centre for Human Rights Development( CHRD) and National Centre against Violence(NCAV).

The project period was from 2006-2008 but was extended to 2009 due to the political crisis that occurred in Mongolia from July 2008, in which rioting and violence followed election results. The political crisis that ensued interrupted project implementation. Some of the implementing organizations were involved directly in human rights protection and advocacy during this period.

The evaluation field visit was from September 1-15th. 2009.

The project was funded by the United Nations Trust Fund to End Violence against women, which is administered by the United Nations Fund for Women (UNIFEM).

### 1.2 Aims of the project:

The overall aims of the project were<sup>1</sup>:

- “1. To conduct lobby and advocacy activities to improve the laws and programmes to combat violence against women.*
- 2. To improve the monitoring process on implementation of laws and programmes through wide involvement of civil society groups and strengthen their capacity to pressure state agencies.*
- 3. To conduct action research to define strategic entry points for further advocacy to change behaviour and attitudes on issues such as women's human rights in general and VAW in particular.*
- 4. Train media in campaigning on issues of VAW through voices of children and youth in order to change public attitudes in respect to women's human rights and social and cultural stereotypes on women's status”.*

### 1.3. Project objectives<sup>2</sup>

The objectives were:

---

<sup>1</sup> Project proposal for UNIFEM - Section 2 (B)

<sup>2</sup> Project proposal for UNIFEM –Section 3 (C)

- “1. To develop recommendations to amend laws and provisions to respond adequately to crimes on VAW and to lobby regarding these.*
- 2. To improve the capacity of partners and media for legislative advocacy and monitoring of law implementation.*
- 3. To promote civil society participation in local and state budget allocation for implementation of the laws and programmes.*
- 4. To raise awareness and knowledge of NGOs and civil society groups and the public as a whole on issues of VAW and empower them to demand rights, to improve capacity to monitor laws protecting women’s human rights”.*

## **2. Evaluation - Terms of Reference**

2.1. In the Terms of Reference, the evaluation of the project is to be in two stages:

- “1. To assess key documents such as research materials, quarterly and yearly reports, materials on lobby, advocacy and media campaigns, some related laws of Mongolia, concept and policy papers and TORS of co-ordinators..*
- 2. Assess the project through target groups such as victims, staff members, researchers of three NGOs implementing the project, journalists and some media organizations, women’s NGOs, Ministries such as the Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Social Welfare and Labour, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Education and some parliamentary members and chairs of sub-committees, some UN agencies such as UNDP, UNFPA and some donors such as the Swiss Development Agency, ADB, World Bank, Asia Foundation”.*

2.2. Outputs expected:

1. Assessment/evaluation report based on findings of the key documents
2. Assessment/evaluation report based on interviews with named and unnamed stakeholders. Evaluation of the project, activities and accomplishments based on interviews with key stakeholders.

## **3. Methodology**

3.1. Field visit to Mongolia

The evaluation was conducted with a visit to Mongolia and interviews over a period from September 1-15th. The list of persons, organizations and schedule of the interviews is attached in Appendix 1.

3.2 Interviews

The schedule of interviews proceeded with few changes of personnel or organizations selected. The evaluator made some suggestions for meetings (with the Ministry of Health and with sample users of the project Guidelines) which were adopted by the organizers of the evaluation.

All the interviews were substantial in content and most lasted an hour or more. The interviewees and organizations selected by the project implementers were well chosen and relevant, with few gaps. Meeting arrangements for the evaluation, transport and a translator for the entire evaluation period, were provided by the project co-ordinator, Centre for Citizens' Alliance.

One or two scheduled interviews changed due to the unavailability of officials but these were very few. The interviews and timelines are contained in Appendix 3.

### 3.3 Interview method:

The evaluation adopted an open ended approach to interviews. In interviews with project implementers, staff of the three organizations, researchers and partner institutions, the project evaluation process was briefly explained by the evaluator, followed by presentations on the project activities, questions and answers. Presenters on project activities were organized by the project implementers. Each partner organization (CCA, CHRD and NCAV) presented on its respective area of responsibility within the project, and were interviewed together in a project team interview at the end of the week. Project presentations were organized by CCA, CHRD and NCAV in the following clusters: legal activities, research activities, campaign and advocacy activities, media and public relations campaign, documentation of good practices. *(See Appendix 1 for list of interviews).*

At the request of the evaluator, a supplementary interview for more questions and answers was requested following the session on legal activities. This was held in the project team interview session attended by the sub-co-ordinators from CHRD and NCAV. The supplementary interview at the end of the first week, allowed a check on background facts (particularly related to the political crisis and state institutions) and some specific aspects of VAW from the presentations and reports.

In the project team interview with the two sub-coordinators (directors of CHRD and NCAV), an open shared interview was conducted with the project implementers, to hear their evaluation and reflections on the project. The project co-ordinator (CAA) was absent on medical leave but was interviewed at the end of the field visit for the evaluation.

The second week consisted of meetings with stakeholders from different Ministries and state agencies, select UN agencies, funding organizations, national institutes and other women's non-government organizations. These interviews provided feedback on the project and on the VAW situation and legal framework in Mongolia. The interviews with all stakeholders, with one or two exceptions, had a common thread of enquiry to assess 1) awareness of the project and its outputs, 2) usefulness of the project outputs and trainings, and 3) assessment of the project's activities in contributing to combating VAW in Mongolia. To put each interview in context, questions were asked on the individual/, institution/organisation's work in relation to VAW, women's rights or law reform issues.

and opinions also invited on specific needs and ways forward in combatting VAW in Mongolia from their organisation's position. Three interviews focused on specific questions on project activities or outputs - with the national broadcaster on the media campaign, with the local level network on impact of setting up a local network, and with a district level social worker, on use of the Guidelines.

#### 3.4 . Desk review of documents and materials

Documents of the project research studies, reports, training and campaign materials were provided for the evaluation. Most were in Mongolian but key documents were available in English, including the Research Reports, the Research Summary (of all the Research Papers), yearly project reports to UNIFEM from 2006-2009(4), a media campaign report and a comparative report of the local networks on VAW. The report on the project funded by the Swiss Development Agency, was also used because of the close connection between the two projects.

Documents in Mongolian that had been submitted to UNIFEM and filed, were reviewed by the evaluator with assistance of the translator. Selected documents were chosen for translation into English - of titles, headings and subheadings to gain an overview of the texts' contents. The list of documents in English and those in Mongolian reviewed with these translations, is contained in Appendix 2.

The partial translations requested provided a reasonable insight into training programmes, selected speeches, papers presented at workshops, publications, posters and small leaflets. Key published outputs that were only available in Mongolian ( the four Factsheets, the publication on Guidelines for services), were also accessed in this way and were important for the evaluation - Output 1 and Output 2.

Most of the main project documents in English and Mongolian were sufficiently translated for an assessment to be made of the project outputs for Output 1 of the evaluation.*(For requirements of the evaluation - see below)*

### **4. Outputs expected from the Evaluation**

#### 4.1 Outputs as presented in the TORS:

##### *Output 1*

1. Assessment/evaluation report based on findings of key documents.

##### *Output 2*

2. Evaluation/assessment based on interviews with named and unnamed stakeholders, evaluation of the project activities and accomplishments based on interviews with key stakeholders.

## **5. Output 1 – Assessment/evaluation report based on findings of key documents, materials and reports related to the project**

### 5.1 Documents and materials assessed

*[See Appendix 2 for a full list of materials viewed].*

Key documents in English that were reviewed included the following: Research Reports, Research Summary, Annual project reports to UNIFEM for 2006 2007, 2008, 2009, Local Network Comparative Report, Media Campaign report. A related document in English, the final report for the Swiss Development Agency (SDC) which funded the establishment of local level VAW networks, was also viewed.

Documents in Mongolian that were reviewed with select partial translations of the text identified by the evaluator, included reports or programmes of training workshops and seminars and samples of media and public information outputs. Eighteen partially translated items were thus added to be part of the review (see list Appendix 2).

In the visit to a local level (aimag) network on VAW, the evaluator also was shown several outputs produced (published and unpublished) by the local (aimag) network on VAW. These samples were also translated as above and used for the evaluation.

### 5.2 List of documents and outputs reviewed <sup>3</sup>

The following appear to be the main documents of the project (in English and Mongolian, published and unpublished):

#### 5.2.1. Research Studies:

*Research studies* on the four areas of VAW covered by the project: domestic violence, rape, trafficking and sexual harassment. The total contents contain ten studies, which are discussed more fully below. The research reports have been translated into English but are in editing stage and are being prepared for publication.

*Research Summary* – This is a separate document that is not a simple summary but presents the main findings, analysis and recommendations for each study. It present the project analysis of all the studies. For its consistency in format of presenting all the findings and listing recommendations, the Research Summary was used for the evaluation, after a brief reading of each the research studies

#### 5.2.2. Guidelines for service delivery

**Guidelines on services to victims and procedures for responding to victims by multi-disciplinary teams.** Publication, reference book.

---

<sup>3</sup> Full reference given in Appendix 2 – List of Documents.

5.2.3. Factsheets on the four areas of VAW for public dissemination

**Factsheets (4) on Domestic Violence, Rape, Human Trafficking and Sexual Harassment** based on the Research Studies. Each provides a situation analysis, national data and review of the legal framework on VAW in Mongolia.

5.2.4. Publication of the children and young people's competition

**Violence against women is a violation of Human Rights – Essays and paintings** – Publication of the results of the essay and art competition for children and youth organized as part of the project.

5.2.5. Training programme for improving services for victims and training staff

*Working with Survivors of Domestic/Intimate violence and/or other forms of violence or abuse* (a training document) by Marion Oke, Australian psychologist and family therapist.

5.2.6. Training programme

*Training of Trainers programme – 26-30 January, 2008.*

5.2.7. Project-related documents

*Annual reports to UNIFEM for 2006, 2007, 2008, 2009.*

5.2.8. Policy paper

*“Policy Document on Combatting violence against women”*. Concept paper for policy advocacy summarizing all the issues and recommendations on VAW from the research studies.

5.2.9. Draft amendments to the laws

*“Law of Mongolia: 1) Amendments in the law against domestic violence; 2) Amendments in the Law on Proceedings of Imposing Civil Case liabilities in the Courts 3) Amendments in the Administrative Law of Mongolia; 4) Amendments in the Criminal Code of Mongolia (Provision of article 126). Developed by B. Arvintaria.*

5.2.10. Related document (which used some of the findings from the research reports)

**Implementation of CEDAW in Mongolia, Shadow Report.** 2008. Funded by Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC).

5.2.11. Workshop report

*“Reflecting Human Rights Concepts in the Content of Every Lesson”*, Workshop report, 2008, Amnesty International and Center for Citizens Alliance. Workshop for teachers in many disciplines, on incorporating human rights concepts in the secondary school curricula.

5.2.12. Select media, advocacy and campaign materials

*Pamphlets* – “Recommendations for Secondary School Teachers on reflecting Human rights Components in their teaching”; Pamphlets on Maths, Social and Natural Sciences, Arts and Music lessons; Curricula and handouts for themes/topics; Human Rights

recommendations; Handouts on basic human rights. Published by Amnesty International and Center for Citizens Alliance (CCA).

5.2.13. *Posters* –printed by Amnesty International, UNIFEM, CCA – “Children’s Human Rights: “Do you know you have a right to learn about your rights?” etc. (In Mongolian).

### **5.3 Assessment of each document/output’s contribution:**

#### **5.3.1. *Research studies* (translated into English -drafts)<sup>4</sup> – core outputs of the project**

The full Research Reports in English were viewed but the Research Summary used as it provided a clear overview of all the research studies in terms of content, methodology, main findings and recommendations.

The research studies have been carefully chosen, covering both the legal framework and practical needs. Specific areas where new information was needed were studied (for example, “ Marriage as a form of human trafficking”) and new areas of research initiated where no information was previously available (for example, “Sexual harassment in educational sector”). The research methodology and survey numbers (in some, 600 participants for example) were sufficient to provide a sound basis for the researchers to make conclusions and recommendations on the national situation and legal framework though researchers admit more research is needed. Experts were part of the research team and have done considerable work in drafting amendments to the law or identifying areas where new laws are needed..

The studies provide substantive information for future work, policy advocacy and programmes on VAW in Mongolia. Several stakeholders in interviews, rated the achievements of the project highly, based on the research achievements. The involvement of expert partners from academic and legal institutions in the research, added greatly to the credibility and quality of the studies.

New areas were covered in the studies, including research on contemporary influences on Mongolian attitudes to VAW and women’s rights embedded in Mongolian traditions and culture;new social/cultural art forms such as comedy and what these mean for negative portrayals of women and gender relations, were also astutely studied. The research studies not only addressed VAW and the legal framework in all four areas of focus, but recognized resources are needed for implementation of new laws. A study on state budget processes was added to address the need for implementation and the project objective of empowering women and civil society organizations to participate in resource decision making.

Assessment:

---

4 (a)“Strengthen the implementation of the laws on VAW in Mongolia. Research Summary.” 2009. UNIFEM. 54pp.

(b)“Strengthen the implementation of laws on VAW in Mongolia: Research Reports” n.d. (Consisting of: 8 main research articles; 4 general research articles; 2 additional research articles). Draft.

The Research Studies have undoubtedly provided a very solid foundation for actions and decisions on future strategies, lobbying, services, legal advocacy and legal reform on VAW in Mongolia. The studies formed the cornerstone of information for much of the later project activities and continue to be used for lobbying, advocacy and strategizing on VAW, not just by the partner organizations but other NGOs and UN agencies. The Fact sheets and policy document based on the studies findings, were other means of disseminating the results.

### **5.3.2. The Guidelines - direct influence on improving quality of services to victims of gender-based violence and data collection**

This reference book contains: a service module for responding to victims in the four forms of violence –domestic violence, rape, trafficking and sexual harassment. For example, it contains a module on rehabilitation and reintegration for trafficking victims; a tripartite agreement on safe work conditions between trade unions, employers and employees and a commitment by the Government of Mongolia to include services to victims of sexual harassment. The report includes guidelines for working as a multidisciplinary team for domestic violence.

As the Guidelines were frequently mentioned on different occasions by the NGO partners in their assessment of the project achievements, the evaluator requested a meeting with any users of the Guidelines as a means of judging if they were being used or were reference guidelines only. A meeting was arranged with the Social Worker of a district of Ulaanbataar, the capital city of Mongolia. The usefulness of the Guidelines was directly witnessed and positively confirmed in the interview - the social worker of in the district Social Welfare department showed her daily use of the forms from the Guideline book, and discussed its usefulness for service providers. Her experience as a newly appointed social worker was recounted, where “I knew what to do from the guidelines”. In the course of the evaluation interview, when a question was asked about other users of the guidelines, she conveyed a message forwarded for the evaluation from her district health and police colleagues– that the guidelines were very helpful in their work.

From this brief example of use of the Guidelines, they provide guidance on proper responses to victims, on the roles of other service providers/colleagues and assist in building co-operation and co-ordination of multidisciplinary teams. The forms are used to for documentation also, to note client details and procedures. The documentation use of the guidelines was directly displayed in the district office, of folders of records shown the evaluator. These records are kept based on the instructions on data collection for social workers, police and health workers. The Guidelines are apparently in the process of being approved by the Ministry of Social Welfare and Labour, for use by all social workers.

The documents of the project have been both analytical and practical, with the Guidelines an example of improving services to women and documentation.

### **5.3.3. Factsheets – brief, accessible yet substantive information on four areas of VAW**

The Factsheets are fold-out A4 size brochures/papers on domestic violence rape, sexual harassment and trafficking. The format of each factsheet was determined through meetings held on the common features to be displayed in each factsheet, reflecting the results of the research studies.

The Fact sheets appear very useful – containing graphs and tables of national data, key findings and recommendations from the research studies on the four issues. The Factsheets were distributed by the project co-ordinators but more copies are required, funding permitting. Some government officials and non-government representatives interviewed had not seen the Factsheets, which is regrettable.

The Fact Sheets are well presented, succinct forms of dissemination of the national situation and legal framework on VAW in relation to domestic violence, rape, sexual harassment and trafficking. The sheets should be reprinted in much larger numbers for continued use and distribution at state and aimag levels, for NGO partners, academic institutions and for the general public. This use of the Factsheets should be budgeted for in future proposals and hopefully funds would be sourced internally or externally for this distribution.

### **5.3.4. *Concept paper* – Brief paper for policy makers and to guide future non-government advocacy and lobbying on VAW**

A concept paper was drafted following the research studies, to present the main policy findings and recommendations. The concept paper is titled “Policy Document on combating violence against women”[as translated], it consists of three parts: on domestic violence (current policy and legal environment, law enforcement assessment, means of reforms and improvements in combating domestic violence); similar sections follow on sexual harassment in work places and on human trafficking.

The section on sexual harassment in the workplace is followed by recommendations on legal reforms and amendments. There is a detailed analysis of sexual harassment in current laws and procedures in Mongolia (in the Constitution, Criminal law, labour law, privacy law, labour code, state civil service law etc). Specific recommendations are provided on sexual harassment in the work place.

### **5.3.5. *Legal amendments paper* – assisting Ministry of Justice and Labour with high-quality draft amendments to the laws**

These draft amendments (in this paper prepared by B. Arvintaria) are detailed and specific. According to the project implementers, they have found the capacity of the Justice Ministry to draft laws based on their recommendations, is sometimes a frustrating experience as Ministry capacity is limited. The project partners have therefore found it necessary to draft the amendments to the law themselves, to provide the draft

amendments to the laws that have been critiqued. Despite their analysis of existing laws on VAW, the NGO partners do not feel these would change without the amendments being drafted by them. These documents drafted by legal experts, represent the serious intention of pressing for legal reform.<sup>5</sup>

#### 5.3.6 *Other materials – public information, media and awareness campaigns (excludes TV programmes)*<sup>6</sup>

There are numerous other materials. The list of these “on the spot” translated materials is in Appendix 1. Speeches, workshop presentations and programmes, research articles, training of trainer programmes, seminar workshop programmes, and training courses, were viewed.

The essay and drawing competition publication is excellent for use in schools. Workshop reports (in Mongolian) could be reviewed for content which could be more widely circulated. For example, the publication of the report on introducing human rights into the secondary school curricula (workshop organized in partnership with Amnesty International and Centre for Citizens’ Alliance) could be used with a wider circulation than actual attendees.

Additional:

#### 5.3.7. Administrative project reports –**evidence of skilled management, careful planning, capacity development while implementing the project, continuous analysis of project strategies, documentation and accountability**

Although these are usually considered routine documents, and not key documents representing significant outputs, the administrative reports to UNIFEM on the project warrant a brief comment here.

Although the 4 reports for 2006-2009 follow the required results framework project reporting format, they document an impressive list of accomplishment of activities (although presented in a routine tabulated manner). These documents are brief but show the range of activities accomplished during this project. They also show the careful reflection, re-direction of strategies and well chosen complementary activities initiated by the project implementers. This careful leadership taken in planning, re-conceptualisations where needed and frequent reassessment related to the activities by the project implementers is evident in the UNIFEM report documents.

Research methodologies, even the format of Factsheets, were all consulted on and agreed to before implementation. This accounts for the high quality and level of the outputs and the consistent achievements of the project.

---

<sup>5</sup> Interviewees in and outside government, confirmed this view throughout – that law reform on VAW would not happen without the work of NGOs.

<sup>6</sup> Comments on the media programmes were obtained to gauge their impact and can be found in two interviews reported below (with the Mongolian National Broadcaster and the WHO gender focal point).

#### 5.4. Evaluation/Assessment of documents

The project has made a major contribution to knowledge on VAW in Mongolia, in providing a situation analysis and assessments of the legal framework in four areas – domestic violence, rape, human trafficking and sexual harassment. In addition, new studies were done on issues that had not been studied previously – sexual harassment and legal analysis where laws do not exist (human trafficking). Additional studies were done to address gender violence and rights in Mongolian traditions and culture, while studies of new cultural forms such as comedies and their portrayal of women showed perceptiveness to cultural forms that undermine women's status. For practical information on resources for funding implementation of VAW laws, a study was done on the state budget allocation process.

The Guidelines for services are a major contribution of the project. The reports on trainings, competitions and media campaigns, indicate the high number of activities carried out through the project.

The documents produced by the project have established a higher profile of public awareness on VAW issues in Mongolia. Many interviewees later expressed great gratitude or excitement that the work had been done for Mongolia.

These outputs of the project have also contributed to discussion, awareness raising, lobbying and advocacy on VAW in Mongolia and provided specific recommendations on actions needed on the four areas of VAW.

The process of attitudinal change is a long term one and all participants in the project recognize that Mongolia has a long way to go before traditions and cultural attitudes change. The documents address the long term, medium and short term objectives of the project. A substantial body of work on the law and VAW has been produced by the project.

### **6. Output 2 – Assessment/Evaluation report of the project, activities and accomplishments based on interviews with key stakeholders**

#### 6.1 Project activities and objectives

The main activities of the project were in the following areas:

- Research
- Legal advocacy
- Training and workshops
- Media and public relations campaigns
- Documentation of good practices

The long-term objective was to build an environment in Mongolia where violence against women and gender-based violence would no longer be considered tolerable to the next

generation, to promote respect for human rights and build a safe environment for all citizens.

The medium term objectives of the project were to build capacity of civil society and non-government organizations for legal advocacy, monitoring of implementation of laws on VAW and to improve provision of quality services for victims of violence. The project also wished to raise public awareness of VAW through media campaigns and to train journalists to contribute to this effort.

## 6.2 Views of the project activities and accomplishments – NGO implementers

### 6.2.1 Implementing organizations

The 3 implementing organizations and their respective co-ordinators were:

-**Centre for Citizens Alliance (CCA)** – Director Zanaa Jurmed (overall project co-ordinator and liaison with UNIFEM; sub-co-ordinator media and advocacy team)

-**Centre for Human Rights Development (CHRD)** – Director Urantsooj Gombosuren (sub-co-ordinator research team)

-**National Centre against Violence( NCAV)** –Director Enkhjargal Davaasuren (sub-co-ordinator legal team )

All three organizations have been working on the issues of women’s rights, gender equality, human rights and violence against women/gender based violence for many years.

The three organizations’ staff also participated in the evaluation, as well as researchers, lawyers, sociologists and other individuals who had helped implement the project activities, particularly the research studies.

The field visit was hosted by CAA and informal discussions with its staff in the office also allowed for daily interactive commentary on the project. Ms. Bayarmaa Luvsandorj who arranged the field visit interviews provided many useful clarifications on the project activities. The assistance and clarifications provided by the translator, Ms. Uranchimeg, were also very helpful.

## 6.3 Key activities – views and assessment of implementers

### 6.3.1. Research studies

The project implementers saw the research studies as one of the main achievements of the project. The research activities had been valuable because they had produced both quantitative and qualitative; new knowledge had been gained on existing laws, gaps in the law, amendments needed and issues in implementation; general areas of relevance to VAW were also studied, including Mongolian traditions and customs, showing deepseated attitudes to women, VAW and gender. Innovative studies included adding a research on the budget process when the project implementers realized it was necessary

to pressure for resources from the state to support full implementation of the laws and services. Capacity building of civil society to participate in the budget process was the intended use of the research.

Local level participation in the research was also a unique feature of the VAW research in this project. Through the establish of local level networks, research in the rural areas was also carried out.

*Assessment of implementers:* The research was a main achievement and an important part of the project's contribution on combating VAW in Mongolia. It had uncovered information that was not known (for example, on human trafficking and the lack of laws on this issue and on sexual harassment, which was made visible as an issue) and built on previous studies on VAW. It was felt by the implementers that all the studies had produced many excellent recommendations to guide policy advocacy and future activities by NGOs, including their organizations.

*[Evaluation comment:* Despite the obvious strengths of the outputs, the evaluation took time to establish what was the link between the research and influence on the state or other actors on VAW issues]. The response was that policy recommendations from the studies, had been forwarded to the state by NCAV, the partner with the strongest voice on VAW. The guidelines prepared for better quality services for victims of violence, also came from the findings. The media campaigns based on the project and its research findings, had also generated much public discussion and more women were reported coming forward in the rural areas to use services and seek help on the four issues].

The project implementers view of the impact of the research was that: *"It was no longer possible, nationally, to deny the existence of VAW in Mongolia in those four areas"* [domestic violence, rape, trafficking and sexual harassment.

Difficulties encountered included too little funding; sometimes the late arrival of funds did not allow a research team to be set up. The small staff of the NGO organizations, who had many other activities to carry out in their own organizations, also was a constraint at times in undertaking the research.

The project team considered the research studies had been timely for Mongolia, especially for policy advocacy and legal reforms.

Assessment of project team-

The research had the following impacts:

- new knowledge on VAW
- substantive information on the national situation and laws on the four areas
- guidelines for services could be drawn up from the research studies
- doing the research had built the capacity of staff in the implementing organizations
- better analysis and strengthened skills amongst the NGOs participating
- greater co-operation and strengthening of partnerships.
- the research had been very effective with wide outcomes

### 6.3.2 Media and public information campaigns.

The media campaign followed the research and main activities were 5 radio and 5 TV programmes conducted with the Mongolian Public Broadcasting Radio and TV station. . The programmes covered the research studies, aims of the project and the findings on VAW in Mongolia. Television was used rather than other media, because "it reaches every herder in Mongolia" while print and other media had been found to be less effective; there were difficulties using print media.

Constraints in the media campaign included the high cost of TV broadcasting which has to be paid for. The public broadcaster producer later confirmed in the evaluation interview that due to budget limits, no free public broadcasting was available.

Other media forms were also used for the campaign – a competition for school children on gender based violence was later published in a book which could be used more widely in schools, but funds are not available for distribution. A postcard campaign, described as "new for Mongolia", was also launched, in which 5000 postcards were distributed to the public for sending to the Prime Minister demanding resources be allocated for the protection of victims of violence. Of the total print run, 4700 postcards on VAW were sent to the Prime Minister, considered a good number by the organizers, as these sorts of campaigns were unknown in Mongolia and the postcards were voluntarily posted.

*Assessment of implementers:* The media campaign was considered successful as it raised discussion on the four issues of VAW focused on in the project - domestic violence, rape, sexual harassment and trafficking. As indicators of the successful outreach to rural areas through the media (TV) campaign, the project implementers reported hearing from aimag dwellers about information heard in the programmes when the project held local level meetings. In the interviews with stakeholders, the evaluator was also able to confirm from the stakeholders (the Mongolian National Broadcaster, WHO representative) that the media (TV) campaigns had produced a high level of response and were successful in stimulating a lot of public debate.

Lessons learned reported by the project implementers included realising that the language professionals on VAW and rights issues does not necessarily communicate well with the general public and language had to be comprehensible to their public. The media campaigns had also informed the public on where to get help. Reports from the aimag networks indicated that more women came forward for services at the local level.

### 6.3.3 Establishing local level networks

This activity was initiated by the project implementers as necessary for the project to be successful. The networks were not funded by UNIFEM<sup>7</sup> but closely tied to the VAW project implementation.

---

<sup>7</sup> Funded by the Swiss Development Agency, Ulaanbataar, Mongolia.

Local level networks against violence against women were established in 7 aimags, as project implementers realized that capacity development, advocacy, information and services had to take place at the local level if the project was to be successful. With funding received from the Swiss Development Agency, pilot local networks were established.

The local level networks are recognized by the implementers as one of the main achievements of the project. The networks conducted their own local research and helped improve services for victims. Although funding is finished, the networks still are maintaining their activities with funds obtained from the local aimag budgets or seeking funds through the network. The project implementers would like the local level networks to continue, but viewed the success of the local networks as varied. The project implementers gave honest opinions on the activities of the networks – and regarded two as perhaps being successful.

*Assessment of implementers:* The view of the project implementers is that setting up the local level networks has had long lasting impact. Local officials and NGOs collaborated and became part of the project; the network coordinated officials in providing better services to victims of violence. A lot of new information was obtained through the local level networks work in the aimags. Government officials, including governors in some aimags, became involved in the project following attending some activities, and this had a big impact on support for VAW activities in some aimags.

The project team wish to gain funds to sustain the local level networks and not lose the momentum; more local networks could also be established in other aimags in Mongolia.

#### 6.3.4. The legal framework

The legal team was coordinated by the National Centre against Violence, which has been in existence for 15 years. It has 19 branches in the rural areas, 5 shelters and a 24 hour hotline. The organization does legal counselling, provides legal representation and offers child protection services also. The NCAV was instrumental in getting the Domestic Violence law and Family Law adopted in 2004. In 2006, it commented on the implementation of the Domestic Violence law in the Supreme Court.

In 2010, the Domestic Violence law will be amended and the NCAV has lobbied the Ministry of Justice and the Standing Committee of Parliament on a list of amendments. The Domestic Violence law will be reviewed for amendments and the NCAV and partners have the support of the Vice Speaker of Parliament and two members of parliament on the Standing Committee, who have agreed to present on the amendments recommended.

The main achievements of the legal activities implemented by the project (carried out by a combined legal team consisting of researchers, lawyers and experts from other institutions, including the Human Rights Center for Citizens) were the following:

1) research on the laws, rules and procedures on the four areas of VAW, some of which were new topics; 2) Domestic Violence Act amendments prepared for lobbying in 2010, which will be a critical time; 3) the four Factsheets given to the Ministry of Justice have been effective in influencing legal opinion in the ministry. The Ministry has committed to provide funds to reprint the Factsheets.

The project did not only make recommendations for amending the law, but also had analysis and recommendations on how to improve rules and procedures for implementing the laws and on the provision of services. Guidelines were developed to change procedures and improve services provided to victims of violence. The UNDP fund, "Access to Justice" provided support for trainings on the guidelines after seeing the document.

*Assessment of the implementers:* Significant contributions have been made to law reform. The project has been important in pushing for new laws on VAW and making amendments. The amendments to the Domestic Violence act were now on the list for 2010 with other laws, as a result of the project's lobbying and advocacy. The project team felt there is a need for continuing legal reforms and much work needs to be done. One of the problems encountered in working with government, is the frequent change of officials, so that individual partnerships within the Ministry of Justice have to be constantly built again.

*[Evaluation comment:* In discussion with the project co-ordinators, they indicated they would like to sustain the project's momentum and to apply to UNIFEM for further funds. *[Comments on future funding and sustaining the project are made in the **Evaluation Conclusion** at the end of the report].*

The legal team's suggestions for new areas to cover in the future included: violence against children and the elderly and incorporation of the project findings into the CEDAW Shadow Report. The project implementers are concerned that there is a great need to protect victims of human trafficking, as no laws exist in Mongolia to protect victims presently. They also noted that there are no laws on sexual harassment.

#### 6.3.5. Trainings

The main reported trainings were :

i) *Training of Trainers* conducted in January 2008 to present the research findings to key state and NGO stakeholders; ii) a training for counselors on legal assistance and psychological counseling for victims of violence; iii) a training for teachers (with Amnesty International) on introducing human rights in the school curriculum; iv) an aimag training for social workers

The project implementers refer mainly to the Training of Trainers (i) as the most significant. Other trainings were mentioned with very little detail. The TOT presented the project and its findings to a wide range of stakeholders. The organizers presented the policy recommendations from the research.

*[Evaluation comment:* The project implementers have not remarked on the other trainings in the project, but a reading of the Project annual reports to UNIFEM and the training documents and programmes that were partially translated for the evaluation, indicate the content of training activities. The evaluator rather than the implementers, gives more significance to these many project trainings –formal (public) and “inhouse” or process trainings(e.g. for the research; on how to set up a network at local level). Considerable “on the job” training occurred in every step of the project, at the initiative of the project implementers and these training activities added considerably to the quality of the outputs and strengths of the outcomes of the project overall.

On trainings, the views of the project implementers during the evaluation were relatively brief, as it was probably taken for granted that these trainings were accomplished. In the evaluator’s view, all the training provided throughout the project (public/formal and “in house/preparatory trainings) consistently led to capacity development of the implementing NGOs’ staff and partners, as well as providing skills training and support for other stakeholders to contribute better to combatting VAW in Mongolia. This attention to training – both “events” trainings and as background preparations - for implementing the project, contributed to the high quality implementation of the project as a whole and is a credit to the project management team.]

#### 6.3.6. Documenting good practices

*[Evaluation comment:* The project implementers report that they were not strong in this area. The evaluation concurs but has not made much of this admission, as the documentation for the project is quite extensive and secondly, other outputs and activities in the period of the project, can account for the project implementers not being able to analyse their own activities to identify good practices.

There has been little time for documenting of best practices with the full occupation of the NGO team in implementing the project. Best practices can sometimes only be analysed later in the project implementation, on defining what this means and coming to agreement on the selection of best practices.]

#### 6.4 Overall assessment of the project by the Project implementers – CCA, CHRD and NCAV

*Assessement highlights by project team:*

The project team consider the following as the project’s main achievements:

- Substantive research and information gathered on VAW in Mongolia in the 4 areas
- Capacity development of their own organizations and other NGO partners
- Policy recommendations and amendments to the law proposed to the state based on solid research
- Training of Trainers on the situation of VAW in the four areas – TOT including police, social workers, academics, women’s rights NGOs, trade unions, teacher training institutes, social workers and participants from the Human Rights Commission, University of Mongolia

- TOTs for the local networks and local NGOs.
- Conceptual development – had progressed considerably through the project. The key principles of rights and the obligations of government to combat VAW have been established.
- More work needs to be done on public education and training of the media
- Mongolia has adopted standards and principles but is not implementing them

## **7.0 Project activities and accomplishments - Views of other stakeholders**

### 7.1 State Agencies

#### *(i) The National Authority on Children*

The Authority was complimentary on the three implementing organizations and their work on VAW and interested in collaborating with them in future research on the issues, by partnering on the issues of violence against children. But the Authority had not heard of the project research studies or findings.

The Authority does similar work and felt very strongly that violence against children could not be separated from violence against women. It also forwarded its own recommendation that in future project work, the Authority could cover issues of violence against children.

The National Authority on Children is set up directly under the Prime Minister’s department and is chaired by the deputy Prime Minister. It has 21 branches and operates shelters in two districts. Its role is to increase awareness of violence against children and ensure children’s protections and rights. It conducts research. The close connections between customs and traditions and violence against children was regarded as a ‘huge problem, particularly in schools’. The Authority has similar issues of concern regarding violence against children: the need for policy and laws on violence against children, shelters, protection and public awareness.

The evaluator noted in this and subsequent interviews with several representatives in strategic government institutions, that they had not received the research studies nor heard of them. A recommendation is made at the end of this report on how to address this issue.

The National Authority on Children spokesperson felt it could strengthen the NGO partnership in policy advocacy on VAC and VAW. There was also potential for media collaboration, for example, violence against women and violence against children issues could be done together in the media.

The message of interest and willingness to work on future research was strongly expressed and the Authority itself pointed out that they were doing similar work. Its position could be supportive and it showed a great interest in also being a partner in future research.

*(ii). The National Committee on Gender Equality*

The Committee consists of 25 members who are appointed. It is under the Prime Minister's department and has four staff. It has two national programmes of focus now, on domestic violence and gender equality. It is concentrating on the passage of a new Gender Equality law for Mongolia which, in its view, the four issues of VAW should be reflected. With funding from UNFPA, the Committee is working with the Women's Lawyers' Association on amendments to the Domestic Violence law. It has applied to the UNIFEM Gender Equality Fund for assistance with work on the Gender Equality law.

The Committee was unaware of the project work on VAW and was not aware of the research studies on the four areas. It had not received the research reports or other outputs. Although this was acknowledged as possibly due to the new appointment to the position, the evaluation recommendation below on dissemination of information, will also apply particularly to this Committee.

The evaluation recommends that the project studies, key documents and recommendations be routinely sent to the National Committee on Gender Equality, and to its Chair, the Deputy Prime Minister, as the Committee is the equivalent to the national machinery for women in the government structure. Although newly created from formerly being in the Ministry of Social Welfare, the national machinery/Committee could be an ally and supporter for policy advocacy on VAW.

There does appear to be a separation made by the project implementers, between the Committee and other Ministries working on VAW. The Committee's focus is clearly on the Gender Equality law which is highly relevant to VAW law and reforms. As the Committee presumably represents Mongolia externally, on all gender and women's rights issues, including in the United Nations and CEDAW presentations, as the Mongolian gender focal point in government, it should receive the key project outputs, reports, publications and notices of training, on issues related to gender, women's rights and violence against women.

The Committee had very positive remarks to make on the project and its implementing organizations and the contribution of the work of NGOs to actions on VAW in Mongolia

-

“The NGOs concentrating on violence against women are carrying out excellent work in these fields. Due to their efforts, Mongolia can go in the direction of changing public opinion, for example, on sexual harassment which is now discussed for the first time”.

The National Committee on Gender Equality's view was that the work of the NGOs and the project had “laid the foundation that can be reflected in the law on gender equality”.

*(iii) The Human Rights Commission*

The Human Rights Commissioner interviewed was the only person in the Commission who worked on women's rights, gender equality and violence against women issues – by her own reporting and that of project's implementing organizations.

The Commissioner initially was somewhat startling in her comment that she had not heard of the project or its work. This information gap seemed, after the interview with the National Committee on Gender Equality and the National Authority on Children, a serious drawback in the project implementers' dissemination of documents and findings of the project to key sections of government. It was later found that as Commissioner she was invited to the TOT on the project but was unable to attend.

The Commission was established in 2001. The Commissioner has made presentations on domestic violence, human trafficking and sexual harassment. Her main concern, which she wished conveyed also to NGOs, was that they were not paying enough attention to minority groups and women in Mongolia, and their rights. She urged that minority groups not be left out of NGO work on women's rights. For example the Reindeer people – there is no work being done on women's or children's rights of this minority group.

The Commissioner had attended the training course in 2008 on human trafficking for agencies and has a close working relationship with CCA and CHRD. Her assessment of their work on VAW was that "it is very effective work, well recognised by the public" compared to government institutions which "are still not doing much on the issues".

The Commissioner recommended that the NGOs collaborate more with state institutions also working on raising public awareness on similar issues and affirmed that public awareness was still needed on VAW issues in Mongolia.

7. 2. Key Government Ministries

*[A meeting with the Ministry of Finance was arranged but cancelled by MOF, due to a schedule clash] .*

*(i) Ministry of Justice and Home Affairs*

The Director of the Information, Monitoring, and Evaluation Department was interviewed instead of the gender focal point and project contact person, who was unavailable on the day but this proved a fortuitous change. Although the Director was unaware of the details of the project or the work relations with her Ministry, useful comments were made on NGO work on VAW and on co-operation with the Ministry. As Director of the Information, Monitoring and Evaluation Department of the Ministry of Justice, this is an important post for communications and contact in the Ministry.

The Department is responsible for monitoring implementation of the laws in Mongolia. In her view, a lot of laws needed implementation, including those being lobbied for successfully by NGOS. Strongly positive remarks were made about the NGO work on VAW; also that co-operation was important: “The NCAV and co-ordinators are working very hard and sincerely for society and its well being but they cannot do much on their own. There is a need to co-operate with government agencies”.

Her views on monitoring and implementation of the laws were also critical of government implementation; her unit was trying to improve their own work and monitoring procedures.

The Director was keen to co-operate with NGOs but the current situation seemed to present “the government on one side and NGOs on the other”. In her view, the government also had not been supportive in the past, but the situation was improving. She considered that NGOS should continue to pressure government and institutions to implement the laws.

*(ii) Ministry of Social Welfare and Labour, Policy Implementation and Co-ordination Department, Family Development Department.*

The representative from the Policy Implementation section had attended the project’s Training of Trainers workshop in 2008 on the research findings. She considered the project was very useful to police officers, social workers and health workers. When asked to elaborate on the project’s usefulness, the following areas were identified as contributions of the project: 1). Forms for database collection. 2). Guidelines on how to register cases of victims of violence. The Ministry would formally approve these guidelines for use by social workers.

On the situation of work on VAW in Mongolia, the Ministry’s suggestions were on the need to improve the skills and knowledge of professionals. Human trafficking was acknowledged as an issue that needed more work. The adoption by the government of the Declaration to Combat Human Trafficking in 2009 meant a work plan would be developed and draft laws. This was being worked on in collaboration with the Human Security and Safety Research Centre (NGO).

The Ministry response to the project outputs and activities was positive. *[See below for district social welfare office’s use of Guidelines].*

*(iii) Media organization – Mongolian National Broadcaster.*

The General Producer of the Mongolian National Broadcaster (MNB), the institution used for the media campaign using TV, reported that the NGO had conducted “very effective training of staff”, the collaboration had helped staff learn more and write reports on the issues, particularly as there was only one professional staff in the institution who wrote on gender/women’s rights/VAW. The collaboration with the NGO (CAA) was

welcomed and it had helped that the NGO staff was a former journalist, so the collaboration with MNB was easier.

The MNB viewed the radio and TV broadcasts on the project as very successful. When asked on what grounds, the indicator for this was the level of response from the public -; responses had increased after the programmes, through faxes, emails and phone calls. There was a high level of response to the programmes produced for the project.

In regard to future broadcasts and opportunities to continue with a series of programmes on VAW, the MNB was non-committal. A key issue is funding. Frequent reference was made to the lack of funding, the very small budget available and the many issues the public broadcaster was expected to cover in the public interest. Therefore programmes could be run only if funding was available and subject to approval of the programme directors.

For future work on VAW with the broadcasting station, the MNB had good observations and suggestions for what may be programmes of interest: 1) learning the good practices of other countries – “their laws, social mechanisms and cultural practices and economic practices regarding VAW”; 2) practices in Europe would be of more interest than South East Asia where conditions regarding women were well known and similar to Mongolia. The MNB Programme suggestions were for a set of lessons on showing respect for women that children could learn. MNB could use ready-made programmes or programmes written by their staff in collaboration with NGO partners.

The producer viewed the project as very good but had concerns about what happened when it ended – as more information was needed on the four issues.

*(iv) Ministry of Health. Division of Policy Planning and Implementation*

The Ministry of Health was not originally scheduled for an interview, but was requested by the evaluator. The Deputy Director of the Division of Policy Planning and Implementation who was interviewed on the one stop service centre for victims of violence that the government had agreed to set up in three hospitals.

The evaluation of the VAW project was explained and some time spent on the planned establishment one stop centers. The one stop service was an MOH initiative to be implemented in collaboration with the Ministry of Justice and Home Affairs and the Ministry for Social Welfare and Labour. The one stop service would be established, but an obstacle to this service happening soon would be how slowly the government worked on approvals, decrees etc. A manual would be developed on the one stop service.

On the issue of VAW in Mongolia, a comment was made on the poor implementation of the Domestic Violence law and the crucial role that NGOs had played in its adoption.

The director was unaware of the research studies or guidelines on provision of services produced by the project on VAW and expressed an interest in receiving these documents, particularly the Guidelines, in MOH preparations for the manual on the one stop centres.

This MOH request again pointed to the fact that the project outputs are not being widely disseminated in government to strategic departments or Ministries or to individuals in strategic positions.

### 7.3 UN Agencies:

#### *(i) UNFPA - (Gender focal point and chairperson of UN Theme Group on Gender-based Violence)*

The UNFPA representative had a very enthusiastic response to the research findings of the project and immediately conveyed this to the evaluator. She had attended the Training of Trainers on the findings of the research and had “a very enthusiastic response” (in her own words), to the project outputs which she had conveyed at the meeting. When asked what particular features were positive about the research, the following were cited immediately:

- 1) the quality of the research
- 2) the research had identified the problems of VAW in those four areas
- 3) the research study methodology was sound

Her conclusion was: “They did a very good job”.

UNFPA is the Chair of the UN Theme Group on Gender based Violence, which has GO, NGO and UN agency participants. It is a means of sharing information and networking among members. CCA is a member of the Theme Group.

On questions on the usefulness of the research studies – the response was that the research: 1) indicated where resources were needed; 2) had been used by UNFPA for its Mid-Term review as chair of the UN Working Group on Gender Based Violence; 3) UNFPA and other agencies had got ideas for their own work from the research particularly in (i) indicating where resources were needed; (ii) avoiding duplication of effort and work.

UNFPA was strongly supportive of the project achievements, particularly its research studies and was “very excited by their work presented during the two day evaluation [The Training of Trainers workshop held in January 2008]

UNFPA supports and works with the National Committee on Gender Equality on the gender equality law. It also works with the Ministry of Social Welfare and Labour on legislation and the domestic violence law. UNFPA is funding the Women’s Lawyers’ Association to study gaps in the domestic violence law. UNFPA is also working on men on gender based violence through its Safe Motherhood Forum on Men’s Issues.

On the present situation of VAW in Mongolia, UNFPA's view was that the problem was lack of implementation of the laws. NGOS were regarded as crucial in combating Gender Based Violence in Mongolia and raising public awareness on the issues.

Recommendations for the project in future: to keep UN agencies informed of the work being done, as there was also expertise in the agencies that could be used.

*(ii) UNDP – Governance Practice Manager*

UNDP manages the UN Joint Project on VAW. It found the research studies were very good, particularly on the policy side and in declaring the state's responsibility for services to victims of gender violence. The representative had not seen the research studies yet, which again pointed to an inadequate distribution of documents and outputs to key UN stakeholders even though the project VAW advocacy itself was well publicized.

Strongly positive remarks were made about the awareness raising activities of the project implementers; this was declared "good work" and it was noted that one of the partners, NCAV, was recognized as the leading national NGO on VAW in Mongolia, with expertise in that area.

The UN Joint Project on VAW had desk reviewed all projects on VAW (two documents were shared with the evaluator). UNDP will fund the one stop centre that was about to be set up by the Mongolian government in three hospitals.

UNDP noted that funding for VAW projects, even by UN agencies in Mongolia, was not easy. UNDP itself had applied for UNIFEM funding on VAW.

Some discussion on funding possibilities in Mongolia took place with UNDP, which confirmed the evaluator preliminary finding on the need for the project to broaden its scope of funding sources in the future, if long term programmatic work on VAW was to be done.

*iii) WHO Representative Office in Ministry of Health – National Professional Officer, Environmental Health*

The National Professional Officer was interviewed at the suggestion of the Deputy Director of Policy Planning and Implementation, Ministry of Health, as a person who would also know about the one stop centre and VAW issues. Ms. Enkhtsetseg Sh, is working on injury and protection issues.

Positive commendations were made on the VAW project and NGO implementers. The NGOs were considered "very strong on policy development", on improving the capacity of national staff, and in public information and awareness raising. A positive confirmation was given of the effectiveness of the TV programmes produced by the project, as this had been the means of the WHO officer first hearing about the research and the project as a TV viewer. The TV programmes on the project were viewed as very

good and informative, including for persons such as herself in an agency working on related issues of violence, protection and injury prevention. The project information was a major entry point into understanding the VAW situation in Mongolia and the legal framework.

The WHO will have a 5 year programme on violence and injury. It could be possible to have an NGO/s work on some implementation and have access to the resources, but this would need to be done through an application from the Ministry of Health for the NGOs participation in the project. For example, an NGO could offer training or capacity development and be given this task. WHO also wants to integrate a “Healthy Work Place” programme which could integrate the non-physical environment also, an possible avenue for covering such issues as sexual harassment and psychological injury.

Recommendations made regarding future work on VAW if the project continues: 1) public awareness should be scaled up; 2) co-ordination mechanisms are not clear. There is a need for a multisectoral approach which would require co-ordination. 3) MOH/WHO is not clear on who is leading the VAW advocacy and programmes – is it government or NGOs and the policy leadership on VAW is also not clear.

The WHO representative did not know about the project specifically but thought very highly of the NGOs work on VAW in Mongolia. She considered them “very brave” and seemed actively considering ways to link this project work with WHO and Ministry of Health programmes. WHO confirmed that the VAW project work, even through the hearing of it from the television programmes of the media campaign, were very helpful in her work.

Of concern again - a key stakeholder and potential ally, a UN agency gender focal point, did not have the research studies or research summary.

#### 7.4 Funders/Financial Institutions

##### *(i) Swiss Development Agency – National Programme Officer/Gender focal point*

The Swiss Development Agency funded a project for the establishment of 7 local networks on violence set up by the project implementers during the course of implementing the UNIFEM VAW project. SDC had high praise for the project it funded, of establishing local networks against violence against women. Implementation of the project by the three organizations had been well received. She described the three organizations as being “very well known in Mongolia for their work on VAW and human rights”. SDC found their implementation of the SDC-funded project was efficient and well documented. No problems were encountered.

On the need for follow-up to the VAW UNIFEM project to maintain its momentum and results, SDC commented that it would like to further support the project but would find it harder to do so with a shift in SDC’s development focus to three main areas - natural resource management, poverty and livelihoods. Its previous theme of governance and

gender has been removed, to be implemented in these three areas, making it more difficult to directly fund VAW projects. Some discussion ensued on the possibilities of addressing the economic environment and livelihoods for men and women as factors in VAW, as a possibility under the new SDC focus areas.

SDC said it could consider supporting further work on the issues, particularly if other donors and UNIFEM were involved. The representative concluded that violence against women was a very important issue still in Mongolia and it strongly supported the work being done by these NGOs on the issues. Further work was needed.

*(ii) Asian Development Bank –Gender Expert Consultant*

The interview with ADB was an informal one suggested by the evaluator, due to her awareness of the Gender Expert's role in assessing gender impacts of all ADB-funded projects in Mongolia. It was also an opportunity to get an opinion from ADB on issues of VAW and the work generated by the project.

The Gender Expert had also recently attended the 2009 ADB External Forum on Gender, attended by the evaluator, so her informal in-country assessment was considered useful background for the evaluation..

The ADB gender consultant's view of the project work and its implementation was that "without a doubt" it was highly regarded and considered very useful in Mongolia. It had provided a solid framework for other organizations work on VAW.

*[Evaluation comment: The role of the ADB Gender consultant is expected to monitor, analyse and make inputs into all ADB-funded projects in Mongolia. It would be useful for the project implementers to also increase communications and sharing of information with ADB on its major development funding in Mongolia, to keep track of economic and infrastructure developments that may have effects on livelihoods and gender relations. Avenues for inputs to and from ADB through the gender focal point could be mutually beneficial].*

## 7.5 Other Women's Non-Government Organisations

Three organizations attended the meeting – the Mongolian Women's Fund, The Centre for Gender Equality and the Mongolian Association of Women Lawyers.

The organizations were invited to make comments on their work and the work of the project, or make suggestions for improvements and comments on future work. They also were invited to introduce themselves and the work of their organizations as background.

The Mongolian Women's Fund raises funds and distributes it to bring practical benefits to other organizations. It found the research useful for its work and had used its resources to raise funds on sexual harassment in the workplace, raising \$25,000. Its recommendation for the future was to suggest that Mongolia perhaps needed a to set up a

strong coalition of all NGOs working on VAW, to design and implement projects. This idea was later discussed as it seemed relevant to provide co-ordination to a number of VAW activities in Mongolia.

The Centre for Gender Equality works on trafficking prevention and services. It works particularly focuses its work on the border with China, which is a high risk area for trafficking in Mongolia; it has a service centre there. The organization did not participate in the project and did not know the details of the research work on human trafficking. It recommended that projects on VAW should have a mechanism to improve co-operation between government and NGOs. There was little co-operation on shelters for victims of violence and too little funding given by the state for these shelters, which were solely established and run by NGOs.

She reported that human trafficking shelters were too few for the user requirements. the Centre for Gender Equality has two shelters supported by International Organisation on Migration (IOM) funding – one in Ulaanbataar and one on the border with China.

The Mongolian Association of Women' Lawyers had 14 branches, 1000 members and does legal counseling to victims of violence. It is also working on the Domestic Violence Law and held a seminar in June 2009 on it, funded by UNFPA. It is studying trafficking law at the request of ADB. The Association had no information on the project research. When informed by the evaluator on the general scope of the project and the research studies on the four areas of VAW, the representative indicated they would like to receive the studies and would be interested in the amendments proposed in the studies and the methodology of the research.

A discussion was held with all three representatives on their work on VAW and on VAW in Mongolia generally. All organizations agreed that although good work was being done on the VAW law and amendments, there was a need for greater implementation.<sup>8</sup> Training at grassroots level for officials and NGOs to be aware of VAW issues, was needed. General problems amongst NGOs working on VAW included the need for funding support and lack of support for shelters. The responsibility for shelters for victims is still carried by NGOs alone, with small, inadequate government support.

*[Evaluation comment:* Lack of communication and information sharing amongst NGOs and possible duplication of work, is a risk factor in projects on VAW. Two out of the three organizations had not heard of the VAW project research or work (but it was agreed this would be verified as information may have been shared with the heads of their organizations). The Mongolian Women's Fund reiterated the suggestion that a strong coalition of all NGOs working on VAW was needed at this time, to improve communications and information sharing.

There could be a duplication or overlap on amendments to the Domestic Violence law ( work is being done the Women's Lawyers Association, funded by UNFPA, and the

---

<sup>8</sup> This comment was reflected also in many interviews with state agencies and Ministries, including critical views expressed by the Ministry of Justice and the Human Rights Commission.

National Committee against Violence(NCAV)); the work on human trafficking, if continued, should also include the few organizations working on the issue.]

## 7.6 Other project activities and outputs - special verifications of impact

### *i) Local level network on violence against women –example - Tuv aimag*

Although the local level networks were interviewed as part of the project implementation, the local level aimags are key stakeholders. Their experience of the project is as stakeholders also. The local level networks were set up with Swiss Development Agency funds to be part of the implementation of the UNIFEM project.

The Tuv local level (aimag) network on violence against women consists of 14 organisations, both government and non-government. It has a volunteer co-ordinator who made the presentation on the network activities in the small room of the local level community library. Tuv is a town/aimag approximately 45 minutes drive outside Ulaanbataar, the capital.

The Tuv local level network against violence against women, had an impressive display of activities and documentation. It has a notice board which advertises key contacts for any victims or members of the public needing the network and its services. The network provides regular services on VAW, holds trainings on domestic violence and has extensive documentation on its work, including photo albums of school VAW activities, income generation for women in the aimag, shelter and service experiences. Its Work Plan highlighted joint activities carried out on human rights. The resource room had a Legal Corner where legal information is provided.

The volunteer lawyer for the network also attended the presentation and affirmed that public awareness had “definitely increased as a result of the network”. When asked to elaborate on this, she indicated that people now approach the network for help where before they would have thought help was only available from the National Centre against Violence(NCAV). There is increased co-operation and co-ordination amongst local officials. The Male Association of Tuv aimag is part of the network. Although the project funding has ended, the network is trying to get funds to continue.

The local level network had greatly improved local research, services and information on VAW. “The work of the local courts and local police has improved tremendously. The police have improved a lot”, said the network lawyer who had come in from her personal leave to contribute to the evaluation presentation.

The documentation of all its activities by the Tuv aimag network was impressive to observe. Records were kept of school competitions and events related to VAW and human rights education, showing halls full of local participants; photo records have been kept of different classes and their artwork or essays on the issues; local level co-operation amongst officials was indicated by a long list of names of network members attending a training (see Appendix 1).Network members were in touch even during the interview

period, to convey positive comments on the project's impact. There is also work being done by the network to provide income generating opportunities for women, with a quite extensive collection of books and samples on new and craft production being shown, part of the efforts by the network to address the need of income for women.

*[Evaluation assessment:* The Tuv aimag seemed very active and committed, months after the NGO project had officially ended, and this was proof of the sustainability of the project being maintained by the local level networks to continue the work on VAW at local level. As an outcome, this seems one of the high points of the project's achievements.

The potential of the local level networks to address VAW issues successfully has been shown by the pilot local level networks, even though the project implementers are very cautious in crediting the project with achievements yet. With funding, this innovative initiative could be further developed in Mongolia, in other aimags.]

*(ii) Social Welfare Department, Songino District, 10th. Horoo (small unit of the District office), Ulaanbataar – example - use of Guidelines for social workers, health workers and police.*

At the request of the evaluator, a meeting was arranged with any stakeholders who use the **Guidelines** for services to victims, a key output of the project. A visit was arranged to interview a social worker at the Songino District, 10th. Horoo, in Ulaanbataar.

This self-described as a “very poor area of Ulaanbataar”, a expanding ger [traditional Mongolian dwelling] suburb where many of the urban migrants to the city live in partly urban/partly unplanned ger settlements.

This interview was specifically to check on the usefulness of the project's guidelines to service providers. The social worker in the 10th. Horoo demonstrated her use of the guidelines. She was relatively newly appointed to the position and had found the guidelines very useful in guiding her in her work with domestic violence and VAW cases. She indicated that she “used the guidelines in her everyday activities, ever since taking up the position”. The guidelines, in her view, “helped in providing services to citizens and [in]data collection”. They made her work easier. A work file of the form from the guidelines, being used for recording each case, was shown in folders of well-kept records.

Other uses of the guidelines, according to the social worker, were for helping identify risk levels in different clients - for example, suicide risks. When asked what happened with the forms and the documentation, these were sent to the NCAV. Asked if others used the guidelines, she informed the evaluator that the local police officer uses them. She added that she had been given a message to pass on for the evaluator from the local police and health officer – both wishing to pass on their opinion on the usefulness of the guidelines. The social worker also reported that they were all collaborating well – the health, police

and social welfare officers –in their provision of services and responses to victims of violence as the guidelines also showed what the different roles were.

There is approximately 30% of the population under the poverty line in Songino District.

The evaluator was invited to meet the governor of the office. A brief discussion took place on the VAW project and its evaluation, and interest in use of the guidelines. Although not directly involved in service provision, the governor reaffirmed seriousness of the problem of VAW in the district, the importance of work of the NGOs generally and their district office's own commitments to work on VAW. She said she was aware of the use of the guidelines on a daily basis in the office.

On leaving, the evaluator and translator had some time to informally talk with the social welfare officer and to observe the setting outside the district office. Children and mothers were evident walking in and around the office, returning from school and walking the dusty streets; the area is densely populated and the district offices are very small. The social worker later indicated that she had a CD of their training on use of the guidelines, with further information on the conditions in the district. This was received for the evaluation.

*[Evaluation comment:* It is evident that in this corner of Ulaanbataar, where some of the poorest citizens live and are serviced by the small district office, the Guidelines (a project output) for service providers on how to respond to gender based violence in their daily work, are being thoroughly and repeatedly used. The social worker's files and records using the Guideline forms were evident. Photos albums of women and children assisted in the centre and explanations of which children were in temporary shelters, were also shown. There can be no doubt that this output from the project has been institutionalized in many social welfare offices. The social worker and the Ministry of Social Welfare and Labour representative had earlier indicated that the guidelines would soon be formally approved by the Ministry for use by social workers. That NGO efforts to improve the quality and procedures of responses to violence against women and children do reach women and assist them directly, was clearly demonstrated in this visit].

## 7.7 Evaluation Conclusion on the views of other stakeholders

### 7.7.1 *Evaluation assessment of the project activities and achievements, based on interviews and field visits with stakeholders*

Some key government stakeholders were not aware of the research studies or findings on violence against women. This included senior officials in the Human Rights Commission, the National Authority on Children, the National Committee on Gender Equality. Some UN agencies that were interested in and appreciated the public information of the three NGOs, were also unaware of the substantive research from the project. An improved mechanism for dissemination of key documents to key institutions and agencies, many of whom are potential allies, should be made a routine practice by the project implementers.

Some NGOs did not know of the project research studies or conclusions, where these would be relevant to their work. This could be due to a senior staff being the main contact with the implementing organizations, or a lack of dissemination of the studies and recommendations to all relevant civil society organizations and NGOs.

The evaluation conclusion is that dissemination of information to strategic government institutues, UN agencies and relevant NGOs, whether partners or not, needs to be systematized and regularized to avoid gaps in receipt of information by critical government ministries, departments or institutions and UN agencies.

Academic researchers who had done some of the studies, were unaware of the later developments or conclusion of the project and had no idea how the studies had or would be used. There is a need to retain individual partners as allies and keep them informed of uses of the research, particularly if they have contributed to the studies. Potential for greater use of individual allies in academic institutions could result from maintaining contact with all project researchers to indicate the use of research studies in lobbying and policy advice. It is a common problem that can occur in any project, that the organizers are unable to get back to all participants as the project proceeds.

In the course of participating, some individuals in academic or research institutions, appeared to be committed to the project objectives and could be involved in follow-up activities. Maintaining a loose network for communications with all project participants to share occasional information and news on the project outcomes/or use of the outputs, could be mutually beneficial.

Overall, the assessment of the project by other stakeholders, government and non-government and by UN agencies, was unequivocally positive. The evaluator was frequently told of the integrity and public good standing of the three implementing organizations and their directors. Many government officials remarked without hesitation on the work of NGOs in achieving any progress in Mongolia in combating violence against women.. Senior managers in the Ministries made critical observations on the slowness of government actions, including on changing laws and on the lack of implementation. The Ministry of Justice was quite strong on the need for better monitoring mechanisms also.

All stakeholders, government and non-government, agreed that now the main issue for Mongolia was implementation of the VAW laws.

## **8.0 Output 2 - Evaluation Conclusion - Assessment of Project activities and Achievements**

The evaluation will address the questions posed in the Evaluation TORS.

- 1.To what extent has the project achieved the short, middle and long-term objectives?*
- 2.To what extent the Project achieved newly developed research work and activities?*

*3. Do the documents incorporate the Goals and Objectives of the Project funded by UNIFEM Trust Fund?*

*4. How much has the project contributed to combating VAW in Mongolia?*

*5. What specific issues and areas of the Project combating VAW in Mongolia can be a good practice model in Asia-Pacific region?*

8.1. Achievement of short, middle and long term objectives.

Long term objectives:

*“To build a society where the next generation will not tolerate violence, where violence would be avoided as a solution for problems, to build capacity for a safe environment where all persons can live without fear; to build respect for each citizen's human rights and have human development based on those principles encouraged at all levels of life.”*

*Evaluation:*

Any long term objective remains exactly that – long term. However, the project has made a strong step forward in helping establish a framework for laws, law reform and amendments on VAW which puts on the national agenda the principle that violence against women cannot be tolerated in Mongolian society. Through its substantive and methodologically sound research, the project has also shown that violence against women exists and is tolerated in Mongolia. The project created awareness on specific VAW issues through its research, advocacy and media campaigns on VAW in the four areas - domestic violence, rape, sexual harassment and human trafficking. The project addressed the next generation and long term attitudinal change through its activities with schools on how to introduce human rights education in the curricula. In the aimags, through the pilot local level networks against VAW, a considerable number of activities with youth in schools, also were directed at creating an environment for continuous learning on gender based violence and human rights.

The project is building the capacity for a safer environment without fear, particularly for women, but achieving this objective has a long way to go as traditions and customs are hard to change as the project implementers would acknowledge.

The project has been admirable in interweaving activities that are intended to build the respect and understanding of human rights principles in Mongolia. It has done so at national and local levels as part of a long term vision of bringing change in Mongolian society.

Medium term objectives:

These objectives are stated in the Project proposal under 3B.

*The project's achievement of the following objectives:*

*1. Laws and regulations addressing violence against women will be adequate.*

The project has made a substantial contribution to meeting this objective. It has provided a situation analysis and critique of existing laws on VAW in four areas –domestic violence, rape, sexual harassment and trafficking – through solidly-based research. It has also examined implementation of the law, including amendments, and identified rules and procedures as areas of the law requiring further change. This work on legal reform and advocacy is not complete and will need to continue.

*2. Law implementation monitoring mechanism to be built at all levels of state institutions.*

The project has not managed to build a monitoring mechanism at all levels of state institutions – but neither has the state managed this. The Project has contributed building a monitoring mechanism through its research and training, which built the capacity of the organizations themselves, partners organizations and other stakeholders, to be aware of the limitations of the law and to monitor implementation of new laws( for example on domestic violence). A monitoring mechanism has not yet been built at all levels of the state, but this is perhaps an overly ambitious objective for this first stage project.

It would be an important feature of the next stage of the project, to focus on building up a monitoring mechanism in civil society and also in government, to more strongly pressure for implementation of the laws on VAW. Training of government officials in the police and justice ministries is also needed for monitoring internally.

*3. Financing national programmes related to women’s human rights will be secured with the state budget.*

This would be a better objective for phase two of the Project, or any follow-up proposal. The Project was innovative, however, in initiating one research study on the state budget process and in planning to build the capacity of women’s NGOs and civil society groups, to participate more effectively in the budget process to demand funds for VAW responses. National programmes are a long way off the moment but state financing of shelters for victims of violence could be made the core for the next phase of lobbying for more financing from the state and local level budgets.

*4. The public will be informed on laws and regulations against VAW and be empowered to demand proper implementation in case of failure.*

The project has achieved this objective undoubtedly. The project research has provided substantiated information on the laws and regulations against VAW and this has been empowering for the organizations involved in VAW activities, and also for a range of other key actors that have expressed being empowered by this project data and analysis, presented in a training of stakeholders. Public information on the laws and procedures on VAW is more substantive now through the Project research, which is a strong foundation for lobbying and advocacy demanding implementation.

*5. Women's NGOs and human rights groups will become capable of analyzing cases on VAW from women's human rights perspectives, define a strategy to deter root causes and conduct successful advocacy activities.*

The project has helped women's NGOs and human rights groups become more capable of analyzing VAW, through the project's research studies and other outputs. The Project has also guided other agencies define their strategies and use of resources on VAW. The project has been empowering for many organizations. Its particular success has been to empower local level networks to do their own research on VAW. Both the national and local level organizations and groups have become more capable of analyzing and acting on VAW through the Project. The challenge for phase two is to use the information to define strategies on VAW and human rights and initiate successful advocacy on applications of the law, provision of better services and more financial resources from the state for implementation. Strategies to address root causes may be more explicit in the next phase of this VAW work.

Short term objectives:

*These objectives are stated in the Project proposal under 3C.*

The Project has indeed provided **recommendations for amendments to the laws** and procedures on VAW. Its drafting of actual amendments, is a strong feature of the project and the successful preparation for legal reform. Due to the weak capacity of the Ministry of Justice to make the necessary amendments without mis-conceptualisations of the law and requirements, the NGO implementers have ensured the preparation of amendments during the project – and have drafts for the four areas of VAW which can be lobbied for.

The Project has **improved the capacity of partners for legislative advocacy and monitoring of law implementation**. For the media, the Project has impacted on those that took part in the first media campaign, but more work will need to be done with the media to train staff and to raise the level of knowledge of VAW, before the media reliably contributes to legislative advocacy and monitoring.

The objective of **increasing civil society participation in budget allocations** has not been achieved but is an activity that is just beginning. More has been achieved at local level, with some local level networks successful in securing aimag funding, but this is not the scale that the Project objectives intend. Capacity development for budget influence at national level, will require more analysis and is a major political undertaking, getting to the heart of democratic participation and political power. The Project has not addressed the political context in Mongolia where NGOs will need to have enough power to influence political parties and coalition governments to participate in budget decisions. The Project pilot work on budget allocations is a critical area and could be continued in the next phase of the project.

The Project has **raised awareness and knowledge of NGOs, civil society groups and the public on issues of VAW**. The empowerment to demand rights and to improve

capacity to monitor laws to protect women, will happen over time and needs further funding support.

## 8.2. Newly developed research work and activities

The Project has **contributed significantly to newly developed research work and activities**. The research work has also been timely and the project outputs are highly regarded by other active stakeholders. The contributions of the new research to addressing VAW issues in Mongolia, including law reform, have been discussed throughout the evaluation.

## 8.3. Achievement of goals and objectives of UNIFEM Trust Fund

The Project has **contributed to the achievement of goals and objectives stated in the project funded by UNIFEM**.

See 8.1 above.

## 8.4. Combating VAW in Mongolia

The Project has been timely, substantively implemented and has built the capacity of the participating organizations and partners. It has provided the conceptual foundations for combating VAW in Mongolia from a human rights and women's rights perspective. The implementing organizations have played a strong leadership role in seeing the Project's objectives are met - in order to contribute to a national women's rights and human rights agenda, rather than short term immediate organizational goals.

A solid foundation has been established through the Project, building on work of many actors over the previous decade on VAW. Implementation of the laws is the critical issue in combating VAW in Mongolia as both government and non-government stakeholders recognize. The work ahead is to make the legal analysis and recommendations become effective in law and for the state to provide adequate resources for implementation and provision of better services for victims of violence.

## 8.5. Good Practice models

Specific issues and areas of the Project that could be good practice models for the Asia Pacific region. One area that could fit this objective is the establishment and working of the **local level networks** against violence against women. This initiative by the implementing organizations led to a structural development that can be built up in Mongolia, for ongoing relevant and aimag-specific work on VAW that will have local and national impact. Policy advocacy and lobbying still needs to happen at the state level to address VAW in Mongolia, but during this Project, the establishment of pilot local level networks has been an innovative achievement that could be documented as a good practice for sharing in the Asia Pacific region

[Evaluation comments on the local level network have been made elsewhere in the report].

## **9. RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE EVALUATION**

### **9.1. Sustaining the project**

The Project has made a significant contribution to combating VAW in Mongolia. It has laid a strong foundation for future work on VAW at national and local levels and should continue with much larger funding.

*Recommendation: that the project work continue and larger funding be sought for followup immediately.*

### **9.2. Programmatic approach**

A longer term (3 years minimum) programmatic response (rather than a project by project approach) and larger funding is needed to fully capitalise on the gains made from this important VAW project. Legal, social and human rights campaigns and training planned over a longer period with sufficient funding, is needed; a much larger budget would allow this strong partnership of NGO co-ordinators, to fully expand the VAW campaign and release them from continually needing to apply for small project funds to continue.

*Recommendation: The implementing organizations follow-up with a long-term programmatic approach and plan and seek a much higher level of funding.*

### **9.3. Broader Funding sources**

The project implementing organizations should seek funding from a wider range of sources, not just known donors in Mongolia and in the Asia Pacific regional offices. A bigger funding amount is needed to fund the activities already highlighted by the project implementers for future action.

Time is important – the project has generated momentum and has had impact. It is important to investigate funding sources and seek assistance for other NGO partners in the region, on funding contacts for programmatic funding.

*Recommendation: Global, European and other funding sources should be pursued.*

### **9.4 Support for NGO Leadership on VAW**

The management, leadership and commitment of the three implementing organizations is consistently modest in self-assessments but recognized by many stakeholders. Their

management, skills, judgement and integrity give them a recognized leadership position on VAW issues.

Through the project, they now present a strong front for leadership on VAW issues in Mongolia. Stakeholders in government and non-government organizations have interest in working with the partners in future.

*Recommendation for UNIFEM: Funding proposals be positively received and/or assistance given to the 3 project implementers to seek adequate sources of funding for follow-up on the VAW project. .*

## 9.5 VAW Issues

The project implementers have identified issues for follow-up, including the urgency in working on human trafficking and continuing work on sexual harassment. Their judgement on priorities and needs is impeccable and would guide any future work accurately and strategically.

The evaluation noted the project findings that Mongolia is “very backward on rape”. Procedures in courts, assumptions on the victim that are still practiced, do indeed seem far behind agreed legal standards and public awareness campaigns initiated in many countries decades ago.

*Recommendation: The specific factors of Mongolia’s backwardness in the law and in procedural responses to rape may need to be put on the national agenda to challenge archaic legal procedures practiced regarding this form of violation of women’s rights.*

## 9.6. Dissemination of project information

Many key institutions, position holders and possible allies in Ministries and UN agencies, were not aware of the research studies and had not received copies of the project outputs. This was particularly noticeable in successive meetings with government representatives in positions covering VAW or women’s rights issues. UN agencies also had not received reports. It was a noticeable gap encountered in the second week of the evaluation, at the start of interviews. Many stakeholders simply did not have the project outputs or publications.

The project implementers need to urgently address this gap, as a lot of goodwill resides in these offices and with individuals who have no means of receiving these important research findings, research summaries, policy recommendations and publically-disseminated materials, unless they are forwarded to them.

It is a small, easy step to ensure all relevant institutions, key position holders, and individual allies, receive the project outputs routinely – to maintain good will and interest. More importantly, direct support and influence could come from these institutions, particularly in government, and this support is not being utilized. Distribution

and communications only to individuals or direct participants in the project, may be too limited.

Key organizations would include: The Committee on Gender Equality, The National Authority on Children, Human Rights Commission of Mongolia, etc. The UN Working Group chair (UNFPA), UNDP and WHO, could also receive reports.

*Recommendation: That the project implementers organize a routine system for disseminating VAW documents and findings to key organizations and individuals in government, UN agencies and other NGO organizations.*

*For immediate action:*

*Recommendation: That the research studies, summary, guidelines, policy paper and other documents be sent to the stakeholders interviewed for the evaluation in: a) government institutes and Ministries; b) UN agencies; c) other women's NGOs.*

### 9.7 Maintaining the local level networks

The project implementers correctly identified the local level networks as an outcome of the project that they would particularly like to maintain. The evaluation supports this conclusion. The local level networks seem the most promising structural development for long term actions on VAW spreading throughout Mongolia, and should be made a key feature of funding proposals on VAW.

*Recommendation: The local level networks on VAW be made a core part of future work on VAW and be adequately budgeted for in funding proposals for follow-up support.*

### 9.8 State budget support

The project initiated an activity to build capacity of women's NGOs to demand support from the state for implementation of VAW laws and action on VAW through participation in the budget process. This is an innovative and timely focus as the project implementers correctly assessed that much implementation is not taking place because there is no budget allocated. Incorporating lobbying and pressure on the state for budget allocations on VAW should continue as part of the VAW campaign.

*Recommendation: Building capacity for lobbying and pressure on government for resources for VAW actions should continue and be part of future funding proposals.*

## Appendix 1

## List of Interviews

Name	Organisation	Date: September 2009
<b>WEEK ONE</b>		
<b>Advocacy Team</b>		
Bayarmaa Luvsandorj Davaasuren	Centre for Citizens Alliance Centre for Citizens Alliance	1 September “ “
<b>Research Team</b>		
Urantsooj Gombosuren (Subcoordinator)	Centre for Human Rights and Devt.	2 September
P. Amarjargal L. Badamtsegseg S. Dondov Bayarmaa Luvsandorj S. Tumendelger	Centre for Human Rights and Devt. Child Rights Protection Centre Centre for Human Rights and Citizens Centre for Citizens Alliance Lecturer of Sociology, University of Education	
<b>Media Campaigns</b>		
Bayarmaa Luvsandorj	Centre for Citizens Alliance	2 September
<b>Legal Team</b>		
Enkhjargal Davaasuren (Sub-coordinator) X. Monxyn S. Dondor(sp) Bekhat Bolel	National Centre against Violence NCAV, Coordinator of Legal Unit Human Rights Center for Citizens(Chairperson) Legal Adviser, Centre for Citizens Alliance	3 September
<b>Project Team</b>		
Sub-co-ordinators of project: Enkhjargal Davaasuren	National Centre Against Violence	4 September

Urantsooj Gombosuren	Centre for Human Rights and Development	
Oyunbileg (Gender Specialist)	Asian Development Bank	4 September

## WEEK TWO

Name	Organisation	Date
<b>Government and UN agencies</b>		
Tsolmon Lkhagvadash (General Producer)	Mongolian National Broadcaster	7 Sept
Narantuya (Director) Amarsanaa (Foreign Relations Officer)	National Authority for Children “ “	8 Sept
Oyun Banzragch (National Programme Officer)	United Nations Population Fund	8 Sept

## Ministries/Government offices

Tumurbaatar Batulzii (Director of Information, Monitoring and Evaluation Department)	Ministry of Justice and Home Affairs of Mongolia	9 Sept.
D. Enkhtuul (Policy Implementation and Coordination Department, Family Development)	Ministry of Social Welfare and Labour	9 Sept.
Enkhsaikhan Baasankhuu (Head of Secretariat)	National Committee on Gender Equality	9 Sept.
Purev Oyunchimeg (Commissioner)(focuses on women's rights, minority groups rights)	National Human Rights Commission of Mongolia	9 Sept.
Ts. Davaadulam (Governance Practice Manager)	United Nations Development Programme	10 Sept.
Uranbileg Jamba (National Programme Officer)	Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (Gender Focal point for SDC)	10 Sept.

## Women NGOs

Ganbayasagah (Ckhishgee)	Mongolian Gender Equality Centre	10 Sept
Enkhzaya (Volunteer)	Mongolian Women Lawyers Association	
Chinchuluun (Grant making program co-ordinator)	Mongolian Women's Fund	

## Local VAW network - Tuv Aimag

Yo Laisinkhand (Network co-ordinator)	Tuv Aimag Community Library	11 Sept
------------------------------------------	-----------------------------	---------

Narantuya (Local network co-ordinator)		
Tsetsgee (Lawyer)	Local governance office	

(Other Tuv network members

(not interviewed –names and positions as translated)

Jadambaa, Chairman of Men's Federation; Tsetgee – Health Department; Enkh TUYA, Lawyer consultant; Odontungelag, IT engineer; Badamtsetseg, Chairman, Centre for Children; Tsendsuren, Bag's employment( what does this mean?); Batssetseg, Lawyer, Local Government Office; Uunkhtuya, Judge( does this mean?) Judge? Enkhjargal, Secondary School worker; Oyundelger, Prosecutor; Suvdmaa, lawyer consultant; Urenchimeg, doctor; Dashmag, NCAV coordinator; Oyunchimeg, "Manduchai", LCC, director; Tserendorj, Inspector of Children, Police Department).

## District office, Ulaanbataar

Uugan Jargal (Social Worker)	Songino District, Ulaanbaatar, 10th. Horoo	11 Sept.
---------------------------------	--------------------------------------------	----------

(also gave verbal report from colleagues in police and health departments)

## Overall Project Co-ordinator

Zanaa Jurmed (Director)	Centre for Citizens Alliance	14 Sept.
----------------------------	------------------------------	----------

## Other Ministries

Davadorj I. (Deputy Director)	Ministry of Health, Div. of Policy Planning and Implementation	15 Sept
----------------------------------	----------------------------------------------------------------	---------

## WHO

Dr. Enkhtsetseg Sh, World Health Organisation  
(National Professional Officer/Environmental health)  
(Focus area: violence and prevention)

15 Sept

## **Appendix 2 List of Documents**

### **A. Project Reports - unpublished**

#### 1. Reports for UNIFEM

2006 “UNIFEM SIX-Month Progress Report for Trust Fund 2006 Project Done”

2007 “UNIFEM A Year Progress Report for Trust Fund 2007 Project Done”

2008 “UNIFEM Annual Report 2008”

2009 “UNIFEM Annual Report of the project “Strengthen the Implementation of laws on Violence against Women in Mongolia”, UNIFEM Trust Fund. Implemented by Center for Citizens Alliance(CCA), Center for Human Rights and Development (CHRD), National Center against Violence(NCAV). Period December 2006 – June 2009, Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia 2009.

Annex 3 “Local Network Comparative Report” (Bayankhongor, Dornod, Dundgobi, Ovorkhangai, Selenge, Tuv, Khovd), n.d.(no date). From report submitted to UNIFEM(2007?)

Annex B – (Outline) Title: Budget. Mongolia. [Lists activities and inputs under: 1. Legal advocacy activities; 2. Research activities; 3. Campaign and advocacy activities; 4. Documentation of good practices].

“Media Campaign”, project report 2009. Paper

#### 2. Project documents

Project proposal: ‘Proposal for Funds from the United Nations Trust Fund to end Violence against Women 2006’

#### 3. Related Project reports – On setting up local (aimag) networks on violence against women, funded by Swiss Development Agency

“ Last Report – Project “Combating Violence Against Women”. Project from 1 February – 31st. December 2009”, for Swiss Development Agency. 2009.

### **B. Outputs from the project**

#### 1. *Unpublished (In English):*

“Strengthen the implementation of the laws on VAW in Mongolia. Research Summary.” 2009. UNIFEM. 54pp.

“Strengthen the implementation of laws on VAW in Mongolia: Research Reports” n.d. (Consisting of: 8 main research articles; 4 general research articles; 2 additional research articles). Draft.

#### 2. *Unpublished (In Mongolian):*

Research reports (titles as translated)

“Legal Analysis on Rape 2007”

“Legal Analysis on Domestic Violence 2007”  
“Sexual Harassment – Legal Framework 2007”  
“Legal Analysis on Trafficking 2007”  
“Recommendations for Law Amendments 2007”  
“How women victims rights are protected” – a project proposal for compensation presented to national forum of Mongolian lawyers. 2007

3. *Published reports and pamphlets (in Mongolian)*

**Guidelines for offering services to victims of gender-based violence**, UNIFEM, National Center against Violence, Center for Human Rights and Development, 2008

Factsheets (on the four areas of research):

**Domestic Violence in Mongolia: current situation and legal environment (adjustment)** UNIFEM, National Center against Violence, Center for Human Rights and Development, 2008. (Factsheet 1)

**Sexual Harassment at Work Places: current situation and legal environment**, UNIFEM, National Center against Violence, Center for Human Rights and Development, 2008. (Factsheet 2)

**Human Trafficking in Mongolia: the current state and legal environment**, UNIFEM, National Center against Violence, Center for Human Rights and Development, 2008. (Factsheet 3)

**Sexual Harassment and Rape: current situation and legal environment**, UNIFEM, National Center against Violence, Center for Human Rights and Development, 2008. (Factsheet 4)

**Violence against women is a violation of Human Rights – Essays and paintings UNIFEM 2009.** (Competition publication)

**Working with Survivors of Domestic/Intimate violence and/or other forms of violence or abuse.** Marion Oke, Australian psychologist and family therapist, NCAV, Sept 26th. – Oct. 1st. 2007. (Training document)

**Implementation of CEDAW in Mongolia. Shadow Report**, 2008. Funded by Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC).

4. *Papers, reports and documents submitted to UNIFEM – (in Mongolian)*  
*[Translated for evaluation -titles and selected content of 17 items identified by evaluator]*

“Policy Document on Combatting violence against women”.

“Law of Mongolia: 1) Amendments in the law against domestic violence ;2) Amendments in the Law on Proceedings of Imposing Civil Case liabilities in the Courts; 3) Amendments in the Administrative Law of Mongolia; 4) Amendments in the Criminal Code of Mongolia (Provision of article 126). Developed by B. Arvintaria.

(Presentation): “Legal Practices in taking measures on restricting the rights of people who commit violence”, Speech by lawyer N. Monkhubayar, Han-Uul district.

(Speech): “ The practices of enforcing laws at the primary level of the government administration: C Aldarmaa.

(Workshop presentation): “Understanding the underpinnings of Violence”

(Newspaper articles): – “Opportunities for Citizens to give information and remain incognito – “questions and answers for citizens interested in issues from the National Centre Against Violence( NCAV); “Domestic Violence is not only just an issue of physical harm but it is much more” ( NCAV)

(Workshop agenda/programme):“Lobby Action Agenda. Objectives to introduce reports on 4 topics of VAW to get government support and assistance.”

(Article/Research paper): “Report on Research and Feasibility Studies – 1) Religion, Traditions and Customs of Mongols and VAW” by TS. Odgerel, MA, S. Sarangerel, MA and S.Tumendelger(Phd.).

(Article/Research paper): “ Public Awareness and Attitudes on VAW” (Research report UB 2008. Available in English.

Training of Trainers programme – 26-30 January, 2008.

(Seminar Workshop): Training on establishing a local network. “Reports for March, April 2008”. (from Dundgobi, Tov, Dornod, Hovd, Selenge aimags. General report on organizing and training course;

Training Course reports for local VAW network staff of Dornod, Hovd, Selenge, Ovorkhangai, Bayanhongor aimags.

(Training for Advocacy): “Making changes to the secondary school curriculum on VAW

(Training course for students – April 2008): “ Draft Project on Intensifying the implementation of concerned laws and legal acts”;

(Training): “Human Rights and quality Education” for secondary education textbook writers.

(Workshop report): “Reflecting Human Rights Concepts in the Content of Every Lesson”, 2008, Amnesty International and Center for Citizens Alliance.

(Pamphlets): “Recommendations for Secondary School Teachers on reflecting Human rights Components in their teaching” (Pamphlets on Maths, Social and Natural Sciences, Arts and Music lessons. (Curricula and handouts on themes/topics. Human Rights

recommendations, Handouts on basic human rights). Published by Amnesty International and Center for Citizens Alliance (CCA). n.d.

(Posters):- “Children’s Human Rights: “Do you know you have a right to learn about your rights?” Printed by Amnesty International, UNIFEM, CCA.

(Course certificate for attendance): “Integrating Human Rights in the Curriculum”, November 13-14, 2008.

“Media campaign”, Report for UNIFEM, 2009.

(Newspaper clippings): – Article ‘ Prime Minister – Please take care of the shelters’, December 12-18, 2008. “An open letter to the Prime Minister”.

#### **5. Local Networks materials** (CCA folder of documents on aimag VAW networks)

(Publication):- Research report – Bayenkhonger aimag- “Non-legalised forms of VAW”. 2008

(Sample): - Letter of invitation to training sent to 7 aimag government offices

(Sample): Contract for 7 aimag co-ordinators

(Sample) - Dundgovi aimag essay competition - Announcement

Dornod aimag Working Plan – November, December 2008

(Aimag brochures): on VAW, Human Trafficking, Domestic Violence, Sexual Harassment, and rape (printed)

(Sample) - Local VAW network newspaper articles:

- Selenge aimag. Columns on: Legal information, Network activity news; Recommendations.

- Dundgovi aimag. Newspaper article: “Introduction to local VAW network and activities”.

- Sample - Newspaper article – Local training participant’s article on sexual harassment in the herder community.

